

Inside the EU Code of Conduct Group: 20 Years of Tackling Harmful Tax Competition

Martijn F. Nouwen

Thesis

submitted to the University of Amsterdam
in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Laws

Degree awarded on 11 June 2020



Volume 59
IBFD Doctoral Series

Table of Contents

Abbreviations	xv
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1. Motivation and relevance	1
1.2. Research question	6
1.3. Method, delimitations and documents used	7
1.4. Outline	11
Chapter 2: The Preparatory Works and the Drafting of the Code	15
2.1. Introduction	15
2.2. The Ruding Report on the need to tackle harmful tax competition	16
2.3. The First Monti Memorandum and the need for a global approach to tax issues	18
2.4. The Second Monti Memorandum and the need to develop a code to tackle harmful tax competition	20
2.5. The drafting of the first compromise proposal for the Code	22
2.6. “Agreement in principle” on the Council’s first compromise proposal for the Code	28
2.7. The Third Monti Memorandum and the drafting of the second and third compromise proposals for the Code	28
2.8. Discussion on the third compromise proposal for the Code by the Council	33

2.9.	The Fourth Monti Memorandum and the drafting of the fourth compromise proposal for the Code	34
2.10.	Paving the way for political agreement on the Code	36
2.11.	Political agreement on the Code by the Council	37
2.12.	Summary and conclusions	39
Chapter 3:	The Legal Status of the Code	43
3.1.	Introduction	43
3.2.	Soft law: An informal para and pre-law steering instrument	44
3.3.	Soft law: Soft governance to tackle harmful tax competition	49
3.4.	The Open Method of Coordination	52
3.5.	The Code of Conduct for Business Taxation as an OMC in disguise?	61
3.5.1.	OMC features in the area of pseudo-case law	62
3.5.2.	OMC features in the area of pseudo-legislation	64
3.6.	Summary and conclusions	65
Chapter 4:	The Governance and Working Methods of the Code of Conduct Group	69
4.1.	Introduction: The parties involved in the Code of Conduct Group's decision-making process	69
4.2.	The Code of Conduct Group (Business Taxation) itself	71
4.2.1.	A preparatory Council working group	71
4.2.2.	The mandate of the Code of Conduct Group	73
4.2.3.	The governance of the Code of Conduct Group	74
4.2.3.1.	Introduction	74
4.2.3.2.	Governance and Member State representation	75
4.2.3.3.	Decision-making	78
4.2.3.4.	Confidentiality	80

4.2.4.	The working methods of the Code of Conduct Group	83
4.2.4.1.	Introduction	83
4.2.4.2.	Pseudo-case law practice	84
4.2.4.2.1.	Phase 1: Standstill notification phase	84
4.2.4.2.2.	Phase 2: Agreed description phase	87
4.2.4.2.3.	Phase 3: Formal assessment phase	88
4.2.4.2.4.	Phase 4: Rollback notification and monitoring phase	89
4.2.4.3.	Pseudo-legislation practice	90
4.2.4.3.1.	Phase 1: Drafting phase	90
4.2.4.3.2.	Phase 2: Adoption and publication phase	90
4.2.4.3.3.	Phase 3: Implementation phase	91
4.2.4.3.4.	Phase 4: Monitoring phase	91
4.3.	The role of Code of Conduct SubGroups	93
4.4.	The role of other high-level working groups	94
4.5.	The role of the European Commission	96
4.6.	The role of the European Parliament	96
4.7.	The role of the Council Secretariat	98
4.8.	The role of Coreper	99
4.9.	The role of the Ecofin Council	100
4.10.	Summary and conclusions: The development of the Code of Conduct	101
Chapter 5:	The Geographical Scope of the Code:	105
5.1.	Introduction	105
5.2.	Member States	106
5.3.	Outermost Regions	107
5.4.	European territories for whose external relations a Member State is responsible	109
5.5.	Overseas Countries and Territories	110

5.6.	Special cases: Small islands	112
5.7.	Third countries	114
5.8.	Summary and conclusions	123
Chapter 6:	The Substantive Scope of the Code	125
6.1.	Introduction	125
6.2.	A four-step assessment of the harmfulness of preferential tax regimes	126
6.3.	Step I: Is the tax regime within scope?	129
6.3.1.	Introduction: Taxes covered	129
6.3.2.	“Business taxation”	130
6.3.2.1.	Introduction	130
6.3.2.2.	Indirect taxation	131
6.3.2.3.	Individual income taxation	131
6.3.2.4.	Excluded business sectors: Shipping and financial services	133
6.3.3.	“Measures”	135
6.3.4.	“Affect or may affect in a significant way”	135
6.3.5.	“Business activity”	137
6.3.6.	“In the Community”	138
6.4.	Step 2: Is the tax regime <i>potentially</i> harmful?	138
6.4.1.	Introduction: The gateway criterion	138
6.4.2.	“A significantly lower level of taxation”, “the effective level of taxation”, “zero taxation” and “the normal level of taxation”	140
6.4.3.	Application	142
6.4.4.	Revision	145
6.5.	Step 3: Is the tax regime <i>actually</i> harmful?	146
6.5.1.	Introduction: The assessment criteria	146
6.5.2.	Ring-fencing I	150
6.5.2.1.	Definition	150
6.5.2.2.	Application	154
6.5.2.2.1.	De jure assessment	154
6.5.2.2.2.	De facto assessment	156
6.5.3.	Ring-fencing II	158

6.5.3.1.	Definition	158
6.5.3.2.	Application	160
6.5.4.	Substance criterion	161
6.5.4.1.	Definition	161
6.5.4.2.	Application	165
6.5.5.	Profit determination criterion	171
6.5.5.1.	Definition	171
6.5.5.2.	Application	176
6.5.6.	Transparency criterion	179
6.5.6.1.	Definition	179
6.5.6.2.	Application	181
6.6.	Step 4: Is the harmful tax regime nevertheless justified?	184
6.6.1.	Introduction: Justifications	184
6.6.2.	Absence of harmful effects on other Member States' economies	185
6.6.3.	Supporting the economic development of underdeveloped regions	186
6.6.4.	Ensuring the competitiveness of SMEs and of certain sectors	187
6.6.5.	Precedent	188
6.7.	Summary and conclusions	188
Chapter 7:	Discussion and Assessment of the Pseudo-Case Law of the Code of Conduct Group	193
7.1.	Introduction	193
7.2.	Generic corporate tax regimes	196
7.2.1.	Overview	196
7.2.2.	The Gibraltar <i>Tax exemption regime for passive income</i>	198
7.2.3.	The Gibraltar <i>Tax treatment of asset-holding companies</i>	207
7.2.4.	The Isle of Man <i>Retail tax regime</i>	216
7.3.	Shareholder tax regimes	221
7.3.1.	Overview	221
7.3.2.	The Aruban <i>Imputation payment company regime</i>	223

7.3.3.	The Maltese <i>Advance company income tax and refunds regime</i>	229
7.3.4.	The Isle of Man <i>Distributable profits charge regime</i>	234
7.3.5.	The Jersey <i>Deemed distribution and attribution regime</i>	238
7.4.	Interest regimes	243
7.4.1.	Overview	243
7.4.2.	Interest deduction regimes	246
7.4.2.1.	Actual deduction regimes	246
7.4.2.2.	Deemed deduction regimes	247
7.4.3.	Tax rate regimes	249
7.4.3.1.	Reduced tax rate regimes	249
7.4.4.	Tax base regimes	249
7.4.4.1.	Tax exemption regimes	249
7.4.4.2.	Tax-free reserve regimes	251
7.4.4.3.	Reduced tax base regimes	253
7.4.4.3.1.	Introduction	253
7.4.4.3.2.	The Hungarian <i>Interest from affiliated companies regime</i>	255
7.4.4.3.3.	The Dutch <i>Group interest box regime</i>	261
7.4.4.3.4.	The Hungarian <i>Tax base for interest payments received from abroad regime</i>	264
7.5.	Notional interest deduction regimes	268
7.6.	Intellectual property regimes	282
7.6.1.	Overview	282
7.6.2.	Front-end (cost-based) regimes	288
7.6.3.	Back-end (income-based) regimes	290
7.7.	Insurance company regimes	302
7.8.	Generic holding company regimes (participation exemptions)	309
7.9.	Group coordination regimes	324
7.10.	Special holding company regimes	331

7.11.	Intermediate group finance and licence-company regimes	337
7.12.	Foreign finance branch regimes	346
7.13.	Informal capital regimes	351
7.14.	Hybrid financing regimes	361
7.15.	Free zone regimes	364
7.16.	Summary and conclusions	383
7.16.1.	Content of the pseudo-case law of the Group	383
7.16.2.	Effectiveness of the pseudo-case law of the Group	388
7.16.3.	The Code is backed by the State-aid prohibition and vice versa	397
Chapter 8:	Discussion and Assessment of the Pseudo-Legislation of the Code of Conduct Group	399
8.1.	Introduction	399
8.2.	Exchange of information on tax rulings	400
8.3.	Common tax ruling policy	412
8.4.	EU-inbound profit transfers (the “gatekeeper problem”)	426
8.5.	EU-outbound payments (the “reverse gatekeeper problem”)	435
8.6.	Hybrid mismatches	445
8.6.1.	Introduction	445
8.6.2.	Hybrid financing mismatches	445
8.6.3.	Hybrid entities and hybrid PE mismatches	456
8.7.	Transfer pricing	467
8.8.	Summary and conclusions	467

Chapter 9:	The Market Distortion Provisions and Harmful Tax Competition	479
9.1.	Introduction: The market distortion rules as an alternative or complement to the Code	479
9.2.	The notion of a market distortion in articles 116 and 117 of the TFEU	482
9.2.1.	Introduction	482
9.2.2.	“A difference” (disparity)	483
9.2.3.	“Distorting the conditions of competition”	484
9.2.4.	“Resultant distortion needs to be eliminated”	485
9.2.5.	Market-distorting fiscal disparities	494
9.3.	Market distortion procedure and enforcement	502
9.3.1.	Introduction	502
9.3.2.	Monitoring of existing distortions (rollback)	502
9.3.3.	Notification of new distortions (standstill)	505
9.3.4.	No direct effect	507
9.4.	Practical effect of the market distortion rules in tax and non-tax cases	508
9.4.1.	Introduction	508
9.4.2.	The European Commission	508
9.4.3.	The European Parliament	518
9.4.4.	The judiciary	524
9.5.	Reasons for non-application of the market distortion rules in direct tax matters	525
9.5.1.	Introduction	525
9.5.2.	Legal issues	525
9.5.2.1.	Introduction: Preference for and primacy of other market-integrating legal mechanisms to tackle market distortions	525
9.5.2.2.	Harmful tax competition: The Code of Conduct for Business Taxation	525
9.5.2.3.	Harmonization of national laws necessary for the functioning of the internal market	527
9.5.2.4.	Free movement rights	529
9.5.2.5.	State aid prohibition	532
9.5.2.6.	Conclusions	533
9.5.3.	Procedural and organizational issues	534

9.5.4.	Conceptual issues	534
9.5.5.	Political unfeasibility	535
9.6.	Summary and conclusions	535
Chapter 10:	Summary, Conclusions and Outlook: Inside the EU Code of Conduct Group – 20 Years of Tackling Harmful Tax Competition	541
10.1.	Introduction	541
10.2.	The historical background and purpose of the Code (chapter 2)	542
10.3.	The legal status of the Code (chapter 3)	543
10.4.	The governance and working methods of the Code of Conduct Group (chapter 4)	544
10.5.	The geographical scope of the Code (chapter 5)	547
10.6.	The substantive scope of the Code (chapter 6)	547
10.7.	Evaluating the work and effectiveness of the Group (chapters 7 and 8)	550
10.7.1.	Pseudo-case law (chapter 7)	551
10.7.2.	Pseudo-legislation (chapter 8)	559
10.8.	Interaction between the Code (soft law) and hard law (chapters 7 and 9)	562
10.9.	Outlook	564
Appendix:	Code of Conduct for Business Taxation	567
Bibliography		573
Table of Case Law		579
Table of Pseudo-Case Law of the Code of Conduct Group		581