

Moffat's Trusts Law

Text and Materials

Seventh Edition

JONATHAN GARTON

University of Warwick

REBECCA PROBERT

University of Exeter

GERRY BEAN

DLA Piper, Melbourne

CAMBRIDGE
UNIVERSITY PRESS

Contents

Preface to the Seventh Edition	<i>page</i> xix
Acknowledgements	xxiii
List of Abbreviations	xxiv
Useful Websites	xxv
Table of Statutes	xxvi
Table of Statutory Instruments	xliii
Table of Cases	xliv
1 Trusts Introduced	1
1 Introduction	1
2 The Nature of a Trust in English Law	3
3 The Trust's Versatility	5
4 Manipulating Facets of Ownership through Trusts	5
(a) The Trust's 'Tricks'	5
(b) Summary	12
5 Equity's Rules for Enforcing Trusts and Supplementing Their Terms	13
6 When Is a Trust Not a Trust?	15
7 The Trust and 'Competing' Legal Institutions	16
(a) Trust and Contract	17
(b) Trusteeship and 'Personal Representation'	18
(c) Trust and Company	19
8 Imputed Trusts	21
9 Marking the Boundaries	27
10 Focus on Social Contexts Where Trusts Are Used	32
2 The Evolution of the Private Express Trust	34
1 Introduction	34
2 Medieval 'Uses' of Land	35
3 The Statute of Uses	40
4 The Emergence of the Modern Trust	44
(a) The Causes of Change	44
(b) The Changes in Trusts Law and Practice	46

5	Strict Settlements of Land and Married Women's Property Rights	50
	(a) Strict Settlements	50
	(b) Strict Settlements and Trusts	52
	(c) Trusts for Married Women	54
6	The Role of Trusts in English Law	56
7	The Jurisdiction of Equity	63
	(a) Equity and the Common Law	63
	(b) The Judicature Acts 1873 and 1875	65
	(c) Law and Equity: Fusion or Harmonisation?	66
3	Creating the Trust - I	72
	1 Introduction	72
	(a) The Centrality of Intention	72
	(b) Maxims of Equity and Trust Creation	74
	2 Creating a Trust: The Requirements Outlined	77
	(a) Capacity to Create a Trust	77
	(b) The 'Three Certainties' Must Be Present	77
	(c) The Necessary Formalities Must Be Observed	78
	(d) The Trust Must Either Be Completely Constituted or Supported by Valuable Consideration	78
	(e) The Trust Must Not Infringe the Rules Relating to Perpetuity, Inalienability and Accumulation	79
	(f) The Trust Must Not Be Intended to Defraud Creditors or Otherwise Be Contrary to Public Policy	79
	3 Formalities	79
	(a) Foreword: Creation of Trusts and Dealings in Equitable Interests	79
	(b) Creation of Trusts and Disposition of Equitable Interests: <i>Inter Vivos</i> Formalities	81
	(c) Complete Constitution of the <i>Inter Vivos</i> Trust	93
	(d) Creation of Trusts and Disposition of Equitable Interests: Testamentary Formalities	104
	4 Intention to Create a Binding Trust Obligation	120
	(a) Certainty of Intention	120
	(b) Certainty of Subject-Matter	134
	(c) Incomplete Constitution and the Role of Intention	141
	(d) Intention to Create a Binding Trust Obligation: Conclusion	154
	5 Trusts Creation and Resulting Trusts	155
	6 The <i>Vandervell</i> Saga	160
	(a) The Background	160
	(b) Stage 1: 1958-61	161
	(c) Stage 2: 1961-5	164
	(d) Epilogue	167

4	Creating the Trust – II	169
1	Introduction	169
2	Trusts and Powers	172
	(a) Trusts and Powers Distinguished	172
	(b) Trusts and Powers Compared: Discretionary Trusts and Powers of Appointment	175
	(c) Trusts, Powers and 'Trust Powers' ¹	177
	(d) Conclusion	178
3	Certainty of Objects	179
	(a) The Developing Law: Discretionary Trusts and Mere Powers	179
	(b) Mere Powers, Certainty of Objects and <i>Re Gulbenkian's Settlement Trusts</i>	184
	(c) Discretionary Trusts, Certainty of Objects and <i>McPhail v Doulton</i>	187
	(d) Certainty of Objects: Some Unresolved Problems	195
	(e) Conclusion	207
4	The Nature of a Beneficiary's Interest	211
	(a) The 'Great Debate'	211
	(b) Equitable Ownership and the Discretionary Trust	214
	(c) 'Cheese', the Nature of the Beneficiary's Interest and Discretionary Trusts	215
	(d) From 'Equitable Interest' to 'Equitable Right' and Beyond	217
5	The Beneficiary Principle in Modern Trusts Law	219
	(a) Introduction	219
	(b) The Principle Established	219
	(c) The Principle Undermined?	223
	(d) A 'Protector' Postscript	230
5	Trusts and Public Policy	232
1	Introduction	232
	(a) Public Policy and Freedom of Disposition	233
	(b) Limitations in Gifts, Public Policy and Legal Logic	233
2	Family Trusts and Creditors	236
	(a) Trusts, Insolvency and Public Policy	236
	(b) Protective Trusts	240
	(c) Attempts to Safeguard Property from the Creditors of the Trust Founder	258
3	Other Purposes Contrary to Public Policy	272
	(a) General	272
	(b) Racial and Religious Discrimination	273
	(c) A Statutory Limitation on Freedom of Testation	276
	(d) Statutory Limitation on Dispositions to Defeat the Claims of a Spouse	277
4	Trusts, Illegality, and Public Policy	278

5	Public Policy and Perpetuities	284
	(a) Introduction	284
	(b) The 'Rules' Outlined	286
	(c) The 'Dead Hand' and the Rule against Perpetuities: A Rule Without a Reason?	288
6	Flexibility in Relation to Beneficial Entitlement	291
	1 Introduction	291
	2 Premature Termination of Trusts	-- 293
	(a) The 'Rule' in <i>Saunders v Vautier</i>	293
	(b) The Explanation for and Limits of the Rule	295
	3 Variation of Trusts	297
	(a) Introduction	297
	(b) Pre-1958 Jurisdiction	298
	(c) The Roads to 1958	303
	(d) The Variation of Trusts Act 1958	309
	(e) Conclusion	325
	4 Flexibility in Relation to Capital Entitlement and the Power of Advancement	326
	(a) Introduction	326
	(b) The Statutory Power of Advancement	326
	(c) 'Advancement or Benefit'	329
	5 Flexibility in Relation to Income Entitlement and the Power of Maintenance	335
	(a) Introduction	335
	(b) The Statutory Power of Maintenance	336
	(c) Conclusion	341
7	An Introduction to Trustees and Trusteeship	343
	1 Introduction	343
	2 Trusteeship: Moral Obligation and a Profit Motive	344
	(a) A Model of Trusteeship	344
	(b) The Influence of the Traditional Model	346
	(c) The Decline of Gratuitous Trusteeship	347
	(d) Present Demography of Trusteeship	348
	(e) Trustee Act 2000: A Summary	350
	3 Trusteeship and Trustees: An Introduction	351
	(a) Trustees: Capacity and Numbers	351
	(b) Special Types of Trustee	351
	(c) Special Forms of Trusteeship	353
	4 Trustees' Duties and Powers: An Outline	355
	(a) Trustees' Duties	355
	(b) Trustees' Powers	356
	(c) Duties and Powers: A Synthesis	357

Contents

5	Conflict of Interest and Duty	358
6	Trustees and Direct Remuneration	361
	(a) Introduction	361
	(b) Remuneration: The Rules	363
7	Trusteeship and Indirect Remuneration	371
	(a) Directors' Fees	371
	(b) Commission and Analogous Profits	375
8	Dealings with the Trust Fund or Beneficiaries	375
	(a) Introduction: 'Self-Dealing' and 'Fair-Dealing' Rules	375
	(b) 'Self-Dealing' Rule and the Purchase of Trust Property	376
	(c) 'Fair-Dealing' Rule: Dealings with a Beneficiary Including Purchase of the Beneficial Interest	380
9	Conflicts of Interest and Duty: The Wider Picture	382
Aspects of the Management of Trusts		384
1	Introduction	384
2	Duty of Care	385
	(a) From the 'Prudent Man' to a Statutory Duty of Care	385
	(b) A Statutory Duty of Care: Trustee Act 2000, s 1	387
3	Investment	391
	(a) Introduction	391
	(b) The Investment Marketplace	393
	(c) Commerce, the Courts and the Development of Trustee Investment Law	399
	(d) Powers of Investment and the Trustee Act 2000	415
	(e) Investment Management, Risk and Liability for Loss	422
	(f) Investment and the Trustee Act 2000: A Panacea for All Ills?	427
4	Impartiality and Investment	432
	(a) Introduction	432
	(b) The 'Annual Harvest' and Some Problems of Capital and Income	434
	(c) The Scope of the Duty to Act Impartially	436
5	Delegation	445
	(a) Introduction: From Prohibition to the Trustee Act 2000	445
	(b) Trustees' Powers of Delegation and the Trustee Act 2000	447
Trusteeship, Control and Breach of Trust		459
1	Introduction	459
2	Appointment and Removal of Trustees	462
	(a) The Role of the Settlor	462
	(b) Appointment of New or Additional Trustees	463
	(c) Retirement and Removal of Trustees	468
3	Controlling Trustees' Discretion	471
	(a) Trusts, Powers and Discretions	471
	(b) Exercising the Discretion	473

Contents

(c) Setting Aside Decisions	478
(d) Beneficiaries' Access to Information	486
(e) Access to Information under the Data Protection Act 2018	496
(f) Conclusion	496
4 Pursuing a Remedy	500
(a) Introduction to Trustee Liability	500
(b) Breach of Trust and Compensation Claims: A Classification	502
(c) The Measure of Liability	505
(d) Liability of Trustees: Personal or Collective?	523
(e) Relief of Trustees	525
(f) Protection of Time	537
5 Proprietary Remedies	543
(a) Tracing: An Introduction	543
Implied Trusts and the Family Home	545
1 Introduction	545
2 Legal Starting-Points	547
(a) Express and Implied Trusts	547
(b) Resulting and Constructive Trusts	549
3 Implied Trusts and Family Property Law	550
(a) The Common Law	550
(b) Statutory Reform: The Married Women's Property Act 1882	551
(c) Section 17: Signs of Community?	551
(d) The House of Lords' Rules: <i>Pettitt and Gissing</i>	552
(e) Family Law Reformed	553
(f) Matrimonial Property Law and the Ongoing Marriage	554
(g) Unmarried Couples	555
(h) Other Family Relationships	556
4 The Family Home in Joint Legal Ownership	557
(a) Express Declarations	557
(b) No Express Declarations	560
5 The Family Home in Sole Legal Ownership	568
(a) Constructive Trusts	569
(b) Resulting Trusts	583
(c) Proprietary Estoppel	584
6 The Rules in Context	587
7 New Directions?	592
(a) Unjust Enrichment: Canada	592
(b) Unconscionability: Australia	596
(c) Reasonable Expectations: New Zealand	599
(d) Contributions: <i>Sharing Homes</i>	601
(e) A Reallocative Scheme	602
8 Conclusion	605

Contents

Trusts in Commerce - I: Commerce and Equitable Remedies	606
1 Introduction	606
2 Tracing	610
(a) Tracing: An Introduction	610
(b) Tracing and Claiming at Common Law	614
(c) Tracing and Claiming in Equity	618
(d) The Limits to Equitable Tracing and Equitable Proprietary Claims	626
(e) The Personal Claim in Equity	633
3 Subrogation	635
4 'Strangers', Equitable Personal Liability, 'Constructive Trusteeship' and Commercial Considerations	638
(a) Introduction: The Two Categories of 'Constructive Trusteeship' or 'Equitable Personal Liability'	638
(b) Recipient Liability and 'Knowing Receipt'	642
(c) Accessory Liability and 'Dishonest Assistance'	656
5 Injunctions	669
(a) Introduction	669
(b) Types of Injunction	669
(c) 'Holding the Ring': Interim Injunctions	671
(d) Securing the Assets: Freezing Orders and Search Orders	677
6 Specific Performance	686
7 Equitable Damages	689
(a) Introduction	689
(b) The Jurisdictional Question	690
(c) Exercising the Discretion	690
(d) The Measure of Damages	692
(e) Losses, Gains and a Blurring of Boundaries	693
Trusts in Commerce - II: Commerce, Credit and the Trust	696
1 Introduction	696
2 Consumer Prepayments and the Trust	698
(a) The Prepayment Problem	698
(b) Remedies	698
(c) Conclusion	704
3 Loans, Security and the Trust	705
(a) Protecting the Lender's Interest	705
(b) The <i>Quistclose</i> Trust	706
(c) The Enforceability Puzzle: A 'New Model' Commercial Trust?	709
(d) Alternative Explanations	712
(e) <i>Quistclose</i> and Remedial Constructive Trusts	719
4 Reservation of Title and the Equitable Tracing Doctrine	720
(a) Unsecured Creditors, Freedom of Contract and Reservation of Title Clauses	720

	(b) The Commercial Framework	722
	(c) <i>Romalpa</i> , Unmixed Goods and the Requirements for an Equitable Tracing Claim	724
	(d) Reservation of Title, Mixing of Goods and the Limits of Equitable Tracing	729
	(e) Conclusion	734
13	Trusts in Commerce – III: Fiduciary Relationships, Commerce and the Trust	737
	1 Introduction	737
	2 Fiduciary Relationships and Breach of Fiduciary Duty	739
	(a) Identifying the 'Fiduciary Relationship'	740
	(b) Remedial Constructive Trusts	751
	(c) Fiduciaries, Breach of Confidence and Undue Influence	758
	(d) Defining the Content of Fiduciary Duties: Conflicts of Interest and the 'Secret Profits' Rule	762
	(e) Fiduciary Duties: Some Policy Considerations	783
	3 Remedies	790
	(a) The Problem of Bribes	791
	(b) Equitable Compensation	796
	4 A Postscript	797
14	Trust, Contract, and Unincorporated Associations	799
	1 Trusts within the Rules of an Association	799
	2 Bequests to an Association	801
	(a) The Problems Outlined	801
	(b) The Relevant Authorities	803
	(c) Conclusion	813
	3 Destination of Assets on the Dissolution of an Unincorporated Association	814
15	An Introduction to the Law of Charity	827
	1 Introduction	827
	2 Charity, the State and Charity Law: A Background	833
	(a) The Late Middle Ages to the Late Eighteenth Century	833
	(b) From the Industrial Revolution to the Emerging Welfare State	835
	3 Charity in a Welfare State	843
	(a) New Roles for Philanthropic Organisations	843
	4 'Privileges' of Charitable Status	848
	(a) Privileges of Charitable Trusts under Trusts Law	849
	(b) The Fiscal Privileges of Charities	861
	(c) Charities and Discrimination	864
	5 The Regulatory Framework	865
	(a) Introduction	865

(b) The Charity Commission	867
(c) The Tribunal	868
(d) Trusteeship and Control	869
6 Matching Charitable Purposes to Social Needs	872
(a) Introduction	872
(b) Coordination of Activities	873
(c) Modernisation under the <i>Cy-Pres</i> 'Doctrine'	874
(d) 'Small' Charities	880
(e) Conclusion	881
16 The Legal Definition of 'Charity'	883
1 Introduction	883
(a) An Agenda for Change	883
(b) The Charities Acts 2006 and 2011	885
(c) Summary	887
2 Procedure Governing Registration as a Charity	891
3 The Categories of Charity	894
(a) Prevention and Relief of Poverty	894
(b) Advancement of Education	897
(c) Advancement of Religion	901
(d) Advancement of Health or the Saving of Lives	910
(e) Advancement of Citizenship or Community Development	911
(f) Advancement of the Arts, Culture, Heritage or Science	912
(g) Advancement of Amateur Sport	913
(h) Advancement of Human Rights, Conflict Resolution or Reconciliation, or the Promotion of Religious or Racial Harmony, or Equality and Diversity	914
(i) Advancement of Environmental Protection or Improvement	915
(j) Relief of Those in Need by Reason of Youth, Age, Ill-Health, Disability, Financial Hardship, or Other Disadvantage	916
(k) Advancement of Animal Welfare	917
(l) Promotion of the Efficiency of the Armed Forces of the Crown, or of the Efficiency of the Police, Fire and Rescue Services or Ambulance Services	918
4 Recognising New Charitable Purposes under CA 2011, s 3(1)(m)	919
5 State-Charity Relations: A Comment	923
6 Recreational Purposes	924
7 Charities: An International Postscript	927
8 Public Benefit	927
(a) Introduction	927
(b) A 'Personal Nexus Test' and the Advancement of Education	928

	(c) A Relief of Poverty Anomaly: 'Poor Relatives' and 'Poor Employees'	930
	(d) A Flexible Approach and a 'Question of Degree Test'	932
	(e) A 'Class within a Class' Test	937
	(f) Access for the Poor, Charging Fees and Distributing Profits	938
	(g) Conclusion: Public Benefit, 'Section of the Public', and Altruism	942
9	Charities and Political Activity	943
	(a) The Scope of the Principle	943
	(b) The Principle in Practice	946
	(c) The Principle Assessed	949
10	Reform and the Definition of 'Charity'	953
17	Trusts - An International Dimension	957
	1 Introduction	957
	2 Offshore Financial Centres	960
	(a) Introduction	960
	(b) International Finance and Offshore Tax Havens	960
	3 Offshore Trusts	962
	(a) Tax Planning, Trusts and the Vestey Saga	962
	(b) Offshore Trusts and UK Taxation: Legislative Responses	965
	(c) Offshore Trusts: The Big Picture	966
	4 Conflict of Laws and the Hague Trusts Convention	968
	(a) Introduction	968
	(b) The Hague Trusts Convention: Key Legal Issues	969
	5 A Civilian Response	971
	(a) Introduction	971
	(b) Italy: <i>Trusts Interni</i>	972
	(c) France: <i>La Fiducie</i>	974
	6 EU Initiatives	975
	(a) Introduction	975
	(b) A Uniform Trust Code	976
	(c) A Directive on Protected Funds	976
	7 Conclusion	977
	Index	982