

Data Protection and Taxpayers' Rights: Challenges Created by Automatic Exchange of Information

Viktoria Wohrer

IBFD

Volume 10

**WU Institute for Austrian and International Tax Law
European and International Tax Law and Policy Series**

Table of Contents

Preface	xiii
List of Abbreviations	xv
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
Chapter 2: Why Do We Need Information Exchange?	5
Chapter 3: Exchange of Information – A Historical Overview	11
3.1. Introduction	11
3.2. Bilateral exchange of information	12
3.2.1. The League of Nation's work on exchange of information	12
3.2.1.1. Early developments	12
3.2.1.2. 1927 Model Tax Conventions	14
3.2.1.3. Proposal for automatic exchange of information	16
3.2.1.4. 1946 London and 1943 Mexico Model Tax Conventions	17
3.2.2. The OECD's work on exchange of information	20
3.2.2.1. First OECD Model of 1963	20
3.2.2.2. OECD Model of 1977	26
3.2.2.3. The 2000 update to the OECD Model	31
3.2.2.4. OECD report on Harmful Tax Competition (1998)	32
3.2.2.5. OECD report on Improving Access to Bank Information (2000)	33
3.2.2.6. OECD Model Agreement on Exchange of Information on Tax Matters (2002)	34
3.2.2.7. The 2005 update to the OECD Model	40
3.2.2.8. Global Forum	43
3.2.2.9. The 2012 update to the OECD Model	45
3.2.2.10. Model Protocol for the Purpose of Allowing the Automatic and Spontaneous Exchange of Information under a TIEA (2015)	48
3.2.3. The UN's work on exchange of information	50
3.2.3.1. United Nations Model Double Taxation Convention between Developed and Developing Countries (1980)	50

3.2.3.2.	The 2011 update to the UN Model	51
3.2.3.3.	The 2017 update to the UN Model	52
3.2.4.	Summary: Bilateral exchange of information	53
3.3.	Multilateral exchange of information	54
3.3.1.	CoE/OECD Convention on Mutual Administrative Assistance in Tax Matters (1988)	54
3.3.2.	Protocol amending the Convention on Mutual Administrative Assistance in Tax Matters (2010)	60
3.3.3.	OECD Common Reporting Standard (2014)	61
3.3.4.	BEPS Action 5: Exchange of tax rulings (2015)	68
3.3.5.	BEPS Action 13: Country-by-country reporting (2015)	70
3.3.6.	Summary. Multilateral exchange of information	74
3.4.	Exchange of information in the European Union	74
3.4.1.	Mutual Assistance Directive (1977)	74
3.4.2.	Administrative Cooperation Directive (2011)	78
3.4.3.	Savings Directive (2003)	82
3.4.4.	Amendments to the Savings Directive (2014) and repeal of the Savings Directive (2015)	85
3.4.5.	Automatic exchange of financial account information under the DAC (2014)	86
3.4.6.	Fourth Anti-Money Laundering Directive (2015)	91
3.4.7.	Access to AML information by tax authorities	93
3.4.8.	Fifth Anti-Money Laundering Directive	94
3.4.9.	Automatic exchange of tax rulings under the DAC	95
3.4.10.	Automatic exchange of CbC reports under the DAC	98
3.4.11.	Public CbC reporting	100
3.4.12.	Automatic exchange of information on reportable cross-border arrangements	101
3.4.13.	Summary: Exchange of information in the European Union	103
3.5.	Scope of exchange of information: Steadily increasing?	104

Chapter 4:	Scope of Automatic Exchange of Information	111
4.1.	Introduction	111
4.2.	Automatic exchange of financial account information	113
4.2.1.	General framework	113
4.2.2.	Who has to report: Reporting financial institutions	115
4.2.3.	Accounts subject to reporting: Reportable accounts	118
4.2.4.	Information to be reported: Reportable information	124
4.2.5.	Summary	127
4.3.	Automatic exchange of tax rulings	128
4.3.1.	General framework	128
4.3.2.	Which rulings are subject to reporting?	131
4.3.3.	Who will receive the information?	136
4.3.4.	Which information has to be reported?	137
4.3.5.	Summary	139
4.4.	Automatic exchange of country-by-country reports	141
4.4.1.	General framework	141
4.4.2.	Who has to report?	142
4.4.3.	Which persons are subject to reporting?	145
4.4.4.	Which information has to be reported?	145
4.4.5.	Summary	148
4.5.	Beyond automatic exchange of information: Proposal for public country-by-country reporting	151
4.5.1.	General framework	151
4.5.2.	Who has to report?	155
4.5.3.	Which information has to be reported?	156
4.5.4.	Summary	160
4.6.	Automatic exchange of information on reportable cross-border arrangements	162
4.6.1.	General framework	162
4.6.2.	Who has to report?	164
4.6.3.	Which information has to be reported?	165
4.6.4.	Summary	167
4.7.	Conclusion	168

Chapter 5:	Exchange of Information and the Risks for Taxpayers	171
5.1.	Introduction	171
5.2.	Risk of disclosure creates an "uneasy feeling"	173
5.3.	Risk of exchange of false information: The <i>Aloe Vera</i> case	 176
5.4.	Risk of using information for other purposes	180
5.5.	Risk of an increasing number of tax disputes	182
5.6.	Protection of the taxpayer under automatic exchange of information provisions	184
5.6.1.	General issues	184
5.6.2.	Confidentiality provisions	184
5.6.3.	Procedural rights	186
5.6.4.	Data protection in the DAC	190
5.7.	Conclusion	195
Chapter 6:	Data Protection Guarantees in Europe	199
6.1.	Introduction	199
6.2.	Data protection under article 8 of the European Convention on Human Rights	204
6.2.1.	Introduction	204
6.2.2.	Scope of application of the ECHR	206
6.2.3.	Personal scope	207
6.2.4.	Scope of data protection under article 8 of the ECHR	211
6.2.5.	The need for a legal basis	215
6.2.6.	The need for a legitimate purpose	219
6.2.7.	The need for a proportionality assessment	222
6.2.8.	Procedural rights	230
6.2.9.	Summary: Data protection under the ECHR	232
6.3.	Data Protection Directive and General Data Protection Regulation	234
6.3.1.	Introduction	234

6.3.2.	Scope of application of the DPD and the GDPR	237
6.3.2.1.	DPD: Not outside the scope of Community law	237
6.3.2.2.	GDPR: Not outside the scope of Union law	242
6.3.2.3.	Territorial scope	244
6.3.2.4.	Transfer of data to third countries	247
6.3.3.	Personal scope	250
6.3.4.	Scope of data protection under the DPD and under the GDPR	253
6.3.5.	The need for a legal basis	256
6.3.6.	The need for a legitimate purpose	262
6.3.7.	The need for a proportionality assessment	267
6.3.8.	Procedural rights	272
6.3.8.1.	Right to be informed about data processing	272
6.3.8.2.	Right of access to the data	275
6.3.8.3.	Right to rectification and erasure	277
6.3.8.4.	Right to object	279
6.3.8.5.	Communication of a personal data breach to the data subject	279
6.3.8.6.	Restrictions of procedural rights	281
6.3.9.	Summary: Data protection under the DPD and the GDPR	282
6.4.	Data protection in the Charter of Fundamental Rights	284
6.4.1.	Introduction	284
6.4.2.	Scope of application of the CFR	287
6.4.3.	Personal scope	295
6.4.4.	Scope of data protection under article 8 of the CFR	298
6.4.5.	The need for a legal basis	300
6.4.6.	The need for a legitimate purpose	303
6.4.7.	The need for a proportionality assessment	304
6.4.8.	Procedural rights	311
6.4.9.	Summary: Data protection under the CFR	312
6.5.	Conclusion	313

Chapter 7:	Compatibility of Exchange of Information with Data Protection	317
7.1.	Introduction	317
7.2.	Is exchange of information for tax purposes within the scope of the data protection provisions?	318
7.2.1.	Exchange of information between two EU Member States	318
7.2.2.	Exchange of information involving third states	323
7.3.	Personal scope of data protection provisions	328
7.3.1.	Is tax data personal data?	328
7.3.2.	Is data of legal persons covered by the personal scope?	330
7.3.3.	Is automatic exchange of information covered by the personal scope?	333
7.4.	What is protected under European data protection?	338
7.4.1.	Introduction	338
7.4.2.	Collection of tax information	341
7.4.3.	Information exchange for tax purposes	343
7.4.4.	Use of exchanged information	344
7.4.5.	Storage of exchanged tax information	346
7.4.6.	Conclusion	347
		348
7.5.	The need for a legal basis	349
7.6.	The need for a legitimate purpose	356
7.7.	The need for a proportionality assessment	363
7.7.1.	Introduction	363
7.7.2.	Collection and exchange of financial account information	368
7.7.2.1.	Introduction	368
7.7.2.2.	Proportionality of the number of accounts covered	369
7.7.2.3.	Proportionality of the scope of financial information covered	374

7.7.2.4.	Proportionality of the number of receiving jurisdictions	378
7.7.2.5.	Summary: Collection and exchange of financial account information	382
7.7.3.	Use of exchanged information	384
7.7.4.	Storage of exchanged tax information	386
7.8.	Procedural rights	388
7.8.1.	Right to be informed about exchange of information	388
7.8.2.	Right of access to the data	393
7.8.3.	Right to rectification and erasure	394
7.9.	Conclusion	395
Chapter 8:	Summary and Conclusions	401
8.1.	Starting point	401
8.2.	Automatic exchange of information	401
8.3.	Why do we need exchange of information?	406
8.4.	Are there reasons to limit exchange of information?	407
8.5.	Data protection guarantees	407
8.6. i	Compatibility of exchange of information with data protection	411
References		417