

Dispute Resolution in the EU

The EU Arbitration Convention
and the Dispute Resolution Directive

Harm Mark Pit

Thesis
submitted to the University of Groningen
in fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor (Cum Laude)

Degree awarded on 30 January 2017

IBFD

Volume 42
IBFD Doctoral Series

Table of Contents

Preface	lxv
Abstract	lxvii
List of Abbreviations	lxxv
Introduction	1
1. Introductory Remarks	1
2. Clarification of the Research Subject	2
2.1. Basic features of the EU Arbitration Convention	2
2.2. New developments: The Dispute Resolution Directive	4
2.3. Previous studies concerning dispute resolution within the European Union	5
2.4. Necessity of an in-depth study of the EU Arbitration Convention	7
3. Aim and Purpose of this Book	9
4. Research Questions	11
4.1. Research questions in relation to the EU Arbitration Convention	11
4.2. Research question in relation to the Dispute Resolution Directive	13
5. Theoretical Framework	13
5.1. EU Arbitration Convention	13
5.1.1. Testing the Convention's governance	13
5.1.2. Testing the Convention's functioning	15
5.1.2.1. Defining the basis for testing the Convention's functioning	15

Table of Contents

5.1.2.2.	Testing framework	20
5.1.2.2.1.	Formal scope of application	20
5.1.2.2.2.	Material scope of application	21
5.1.2.2.3.	Procedural functioning	21
5.1.3.	Improving the EU Arbitration Convention's governance and functioning	22
5.2. -	The Dispute Resolution Directive	23
6.	Undertaking the Evaluating Analysis	23
7.	Taxonomy of the Book	24
7.1.	General considerations	24
7.2.	Part I: The EU Arbitration Convention	24
7.3.	Part II: The Dispute Resolution Directive	27
 Part I The EU Arbitration Convention 		
Chapter 1:	History and Recent Developments	31
1.1.	Chapter overview	31
1.2.	Period 1975-1984: Proposal for an Arbitration Directive and reception by Member States	32
1.2.1.	Issuing of a proposal for an Arbitration Directive	32
1.2.1.1.	Preliminary considerations	32
1.2.1.2.	Road to the Arbitration Directive	32
1.2.1.3.	General features of the Arbitration Directive	35
1.2.2.	Reception of the Arbitration Directive proposal	36
1.2.2.1.	General considerations	36
1.2.2.2.	Reception by the European Parliament and Economic and Social Committee	36
1.2.2.3.	Reception by the Council	37
1.2.2.4.	Further proceedings	40
1.2.2.4.1.	Discussions on the legal nature of the arbitration instrument	40
1.2.2.4.2.	Proposal for a multilateral convention	41

1.3.	Period 1984-1990: Negotiations on a multilateral convention	43
1.3.1.	Breaking the deadlock: A single tax package	43
1.3.2.	Breaking the deadlock: Signing of the EU Arbitration Convention	46
1.4.	Period 1990-1999: Entry into force and discussions on practical implementation	46
1.5.	Period 2000-2011: Commission's Study on company taxation in the internal market, installation of the EU JTPF and adoption of a Code of Conduct	47
1.5.1.	General considerations	47
1.5.2.	2001: The Commission's Study on company taxation in the common market and its tax strategy	48
1.5.2.1.	The Commission's 2001 Study on company taxation in the common market	48
1.5.2.2.	The Commission's 2001 Communication on tax strategy	49
1.5.3.	Installation of a Joint Forum on Transfer Pricing	50
1.5.3.1.	Instalment process	50
1.5.3.2.	EU JTPF's output	51
1.5.3.2.1.	2004 Communication	51
1.5.3.2.2.	2009 Communication	51
1.5.3.2.3.	2011 Communication	52
1.6.	Period 2012-2017: Recent developments	53
1.7.	Concluding remarks	54
Chapter 2:	General Overview	55
2.1.	Chapter overview	55
2.2.	Principal objective	56
2.3.	Content	58
2.3.1.	General overview	58
2.3.2.	Procedural phases	59
2.4.	Signatory states and accession of new states	60

Table of Contents

2.4.1.	General considerations	60
2.4.2.	1995: Accession of Austria, Finland and Sweden	61
2.4.3.	2005: Accession of the Czech Republic, Cyprus, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Malta, Poland, the Slovak Republic and Slovenia	63
2.4.4.	2008: Accession of Bulgaria and Romania	65
2.4.5.	2014: Accession of Croatia	66
2.5.	Additions: Code of Conduct	68
2.5.1.	Process of adoption and implementation	68
2.5.2.	Content	69
2.5.3.	Revisions	70
2.5.3.1.	2009 revision	70
2.5.3.2.	2015-2016 revision	71
2.5.3.3.	Future revisions	72
2.6.	Language	72
2.6.1.	Languages of the original signatory Member States	72
2.6.2.	Language of the acceding Member States	74
2.6.2.1.	1995 Accession Convention	74
2.6.2.2.	2005 Accession Convention	74
2.6.2.3.	2008 Accession Decision	75
2.6.2.4.	2014 Accession Decision	76
2.7.	Revision	76
2.8.	Withdrawal	77
2.9.	Termination	78
2.10.	Evaluation	80
Chapter 3:	Ratification, Entry into Force, Running Period and Application of Cases	83
3.1.	Chapter overview	83
3.2.	Ratification and entry into force	84
3.2.1.	EU Arbitration Convention	84
3.2.1.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	84
3.2.1.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	85
3.2.1.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	85

Table of Contents

3.2.1.4.	Analysis	85
3.2.2.	Accession conventions	87
3.2.2.1.	Provision of the accession conventions	87
3.2.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	90
3.2.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	90
3.2.2.4.	Analysis	91
3.3.	Running period	93
3.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	93
3.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	95
3.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	95
3.3.4.	Analysis	95
3.3.4.1.	Clarification of the 5-year period	95
3.3.4.2.	Starting point of the 5-year period	96
3.3.4.3.	Renewal of the running period	98
3.4.	Application of cases	99
3.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	99
3.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	100
3.4.2.1.	General considerations	100
3.4.2.2.	Requests submitted prior to the expiration of the Convention's initial running period	100
3.4.2.3.	Requests submitted during the interim period	102
3.4.2.3.I.	Initial discussions	102
3.4.2.3.2.	Common commencement date of the 2-year deadline during the interim period	104
3.4.2.4.	Application of cases in states that acceded to the EU Arbitration Convention	105
3.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	106
3.4.4.	Analysis	107
3.4.4.1.	Application of cases during the initial running period: 1995-1999	107
3.4.4.2.	Application of cases during the interim period: 2000-2004	108
3.4.4.2.I.	General considerations	108
3.4.4.2.2.	Resolution of cases initiated during the Convention's initial running period	108
3.4.4.2.3.	Resolution of cases initiated during the interim period	110
3.4.4.3.	Application of cases after the EU Arbitration Convention re-entered into force	112

Table of Contents

3.4.4.4.	Application of cases in respect of acceding Member States	113
3.5.	Evaluation	114
Chapter 4:	Usage	117
4.1.	Chapter overview	117
4.2.	Collection of data	118
4.3.	Cases under the EU Arbitration Convention	120
4.3.1.	General considerations	120
4.3.2.	1995-1999	121
4.3.3.	Period 2000-2011	122
4.3.3.1.	Number of cases	122
4.3.3.2.	Initiated arbitration procedures	125
4.3.4.	Period from 2012 onwards	127
4.3.4.1.	Number of cases	127
4.3.4.1.1.	Rejected requests for the application of the EU Arbitration Convention	127
4.3.4.1.2.	Time period between submission of a request and the initiation of the mutual agreement procedure	128
4.3.4.1.3.	Number of pending cases	129
4.3.4.1.4.	Cases pending more than 2 years	131
4.3.4.2.	Initiated arbitration procedures	132
4.4.	Analysis	132
4.4.1.	General considerations	132
4.4.2.	Quality of published data	132
4.4.2.1.	Period 1995-1999	132
4.4.2.2.	Period 2000-2011	133
4.4.2.3.	Period 2012 onwards	134
4.4.2.4.	Evaluation	135
4.4.3.	Analysis of the published data	136
4.4.3.1.	Requests submitted under the EU Arbitration Convention	136
4.4.3.2.	Acceptance and rejection of cases	138
4.4.3.3.	Number of pending cases	140
4.4.3.3.1.	Validity of the reported pending cases	140
4.4.3.3.2.	Completion time of pending cases	142

4.43.4.	Reference of cases to the arbitration procedure	145
4.5.	Evaluation and concluding remarks	145
Chapter 5:	Legal Status	149
5.1.	Chapter overview	149
5.2.	The constitutional framework for eliminating double taxation within the internal market	150
5.2.1.	General considerations	150
5.2.2.	Adoption of directives: Article 100 of the EEC Treaty and its successor provisions	150
5.2.2.1.	Starting point: Article 100 of the EEC Treaty and developments in harmonization	150
5.2.2.2.	Directives in the field of taxation: Articles 113 and 115 of the TFEU	152
5.2.23.	Legal status of directives under EU law	153
5.23.	Other possible measures in the field of direct taxation: Former article 220 of the EEC Treaty	155
5.23.1.	General considerations	155
5.23.2.	Enforcement of compliance of Member States with the obligations laid down in article 220 of the EEC Treaty	156
5.23.2.1.	No direct effect of article 220 of the EEC Treaty	156
5.23.2.2.	Enforcement of elimination of double taxation under article 220 of the EEC Treaty	157
5.233.	Content of article 220 of the EEC Treaty	159
5.233.1.	Clarification of the words “with each other”	159
5.233.2.	Clarification of the words “in so far as necessary”	162
5.2333.	Clarification of the words “engage in negotiations”	165
5.2.4.	Principles defining competence of the EU institutions	167
53.	Lawful conclusion of the EU Arbitration Convention: Relationship between article 100 of the EEC Treaty and article 220 of the EEC Treaty	169
53.1.	General considerations	169

Table of Contents

5.3.2.	Competence of the Commission to propose and of the Council to adopt the proposed Arbitration Directive	170
5.3.2.1.	Distorting effects of double taxation on the functioning of the internal market	170
53.2.2.	The European Union’s competence based on the principle of proportionality	171
5.3.3.	Competence of Member States to adopt measures on the basis of article 220 of the EEC Treaty despite the fact that the EU already proposed similar harmonization measures	174
5.3.3.1.	General considerations	174
5.33.2.	Adopted harmonization measures	174
5.33.3.	No harmonization measures yet/proposed or pending harmonization measures	175
5.3.33.1.	General considerations	175
5.33.3.2.	Positions taken in the literature	176
53.3.3.2.1.	Positions in favour of precedence of article 100 of the EEC Treaty over article 220 of the EEC Treaty	176
5333.2.2.	Positions in favour of the precedence of article 220 of the EEC Treaty over article 100 of the EEC Treaty	178
53.3.3.3.	Analysis	179
5333.3.1.	Precedence of articles	179
5.3333.2.	Lawful action by Member States	180
5.3.4.	Lawful conclusion of the EU Arbitration Convention?	182
53.4.1.	The EU Arbitration Convention’s history in brief	182
53.4.2.	Positions taken in the literature	183
5.3.43.	Analysis	184
53.4.3.1.	General considerations	184
5.3.43.2.	Obligation for the Council formally to decide on the proposed Arbitration Directive	184
5.3.43.3.	Evaluating the agreement with the Commission on the EU Arbitration Convention	185
5.3.43.4.	Final considerations	186
5.3.5.	Challenging the validity of the EU Arbitration Convention	187
5.4.	Legal status of the EU Arbitration Convention and related measures	188

5.4.1.	Legal status of the EU Arbitration Convention	188
5.4.1.1.	General considerations	188
5.4.1.2.	Positions taken in the literature	189
5.4.1.3.	Analysis	192
5.4.1.3.1.	Facts relating to the signing of the EU Arbitration Convention	192
5.4.1.3.2.	Member States' intentions when signing the EU Arbitration Convention	193
5.4.1.3.3.	Final considerations	194
5.4.2.	Legal status of the Prolongation Protocol	195
5.4.3.	Legal status of the Accession Conventions and Accession Decisions	195
5.4.3.1.	General considerations	195
5.4.3.2.	1995 and 2004 Accession Conventions	196
5.4.3.3.	2008 and 2014 Accession Decisions	197
5.4.3.3.1.	Content of the Accession Decisions	197
5.4.3.3.2.	Discussion on alternative routes for the accession of new Member States to the EU Arbitration Convention	198
5.4.3.4.	Analysis	200
5.4.3.4.1.	The Council's competence to decide on the accession of Bulgaria, Croatia and Romania to the EU Arbitration Convention	200
5.4.3.4.2.	Validity of the Accession Decisions	202
5.4.3.4.3.	Legal impact of the Accession Decisions	203
5.4.3.4.4.	Final considerations	204
5.4.4.	Legal status of the Code of Conduct	205
5.4.4.1.	Process of adoption and implementation of the Code of Conduct	205
5.4.4.2.	Analysis	206
5.4.4.2.1.	General considerations	206
5.4.4.2.2.	Was the Commission competent to propose the Code of Conduct and to propose for a revision of the Code of Conduct?	207
5.4.4.2.2.1.	Primary competence	207
5.4.4.2.2.2.	Competence via the EU JTPF	207
5.4.4.2.2.3.	Final considerations	209
5.4.4.2.3.	Was the Council competent to adopt the Code of Conduct and the revised Code of Conduct? 209	
5.4.4.2.4.	Was the Code of Conduct lawfully concluded?	210
5.4.4.2.5.	Legal status	211
5.5.	Evaluation	212

Table of Contents

Chapter 6:	Relationship with EU Law, International Law, the OECD Model Convention, Double Tax Conventions between Member States and Member States' Domestic Legislation	215
6.1.	Chapter overview	215
6.2.	Relationship with EU law	216
6.2.1.	General considerations	216
6.2.2.	Competence of the ECJ	217
6.2.3.	Competence of the Commission	220
6.3.	Relationship with international law	221
6.4.	Relationship with the OECD Model Convention	222
6.5.	Relationship with double tax conventions between Member States	223
6.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	223
6.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	224
6.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	224
6.5.4.	Analysis	225
6.5.4.1.	General considerations	225
6.5.4.2.	Relationship with double tax conventions with a lesser obligation	226
6.5.4.3.	Relationship with double tax conventions with a wider obligation	229
6.5.4.3.I.	Wider obligations on the basis of a double tax convention	229
6.5.4.3.2.	Wider obligations on the basis of the Multilateral Instrument	233
6.5.4.4.	Relationship of the Code of Conduct with double tax conventions between Member States	235
6.6.	Relationship with Member States' domestic legislation	238
6.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	238
6.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	238
6.6.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	238
6.6.4.	Analysis	238
6.6.4.1.	Relationship with Member States' domestic legislation	238

6.6.4.2.	Competence of Member States' domestic courts to interpret and enforce compliance with the EU Arbitration Convention	240
6.7.	Evaluation	242
Chapter 7:	Governance	245
7.1.	Chapter overview	245
7.2.	Parties involved in governing the EU Arbitration Convention	246
7.2.1.	General considerations	246
7.2.2.	Role of the Member States	246
7.2.3.	Role of the Commission	247
7.2.4.	Role of the Council	248
7.2.5.	Role of the EU JTPF	250
7.2.5.1.	Term of establishment, objective and mandate, composition and internal rules of procedure	250
7.2.5.1.1.	Term of establishment	250
7.2.5.1.2.	Objective, mandate and tasks	251
7.2.5.1.3.	Composition	252
7.2.5.1.4.	Selection and appointment of members	254
7.2.5.1.5.	Organizational aspects	255
7.2.5.1.6.	Working procedures	256
7.2.5.1.7.	Publication of opinions and working documents	256
7.2.5.2.	Monitoring task	257
7.2.5.2.1.	Objective monitoring task	257
7.2.5.2.2.	Specific areas of monitoring	258
7.2.5.2.3.	Outcome of the monitoring process	260
7.2.6.	Role of the European Parliament and the Economic and Social Committee	260
7.3.	International relations theory	261
7.3.1.	Basic outline of the theory	261
7.3.2.	Main pillars of the international relations theory	262
7.3.2.1.	Realism	262
7.3.2.2.	Liberalism	263
7.3.2.3.	Constructivism	264
7.3.2.4.	Functionalism	266
7.3.3.	Previous research concerning the international relations theory and international tax law	268

Table of Contents

7.3.3.1.	Altman's dissertation	268
7.33.2.	Studies by Ring	269
73.3.2.1.	2006 study on international regime theory in respect of international taxation	269
7.33.2.2.	2010 study on the role of international organizations in shaping tax policy	270
7.33.3.	Relevance of the studies for this book	271
7.3.4.	Using the international relations theory for the EU Arbitration Convention: Which theory?	272
73.4.1.	Limitations of realism	272
73.4.2.	Liberalism and functionalism versus constructivism	273
7.3.43.	Choice for constructivism	275
7.4.	Clarifying the EU Arbitration Convention's governance through the lens of the international relations theory	276
7.4.1.	General considerations	276
7.4.2.	Emergence of developments: A broader EU level	276
7.4.2.1.	The European Union as networking society	276
7.4.2.2.	Governance within the European Union in relation to direct taxation	278
7.4.2.2.L	A shift towards informal governance in general	278
7.4.2.2.2.	A shift towards informal governance: The 1997 tax package	279
7.4.2.23.	Mingling of hard-law and soft-law instruments	281
7.4.3.	Emergence of developments: The EU Arbitration Convention	283
7.43.1.	General considerations	283
7.43.2.	Steering role of the Commission	283
7.4.33.	Clarification of developments and directions in the EU Arbitration Convention's governance	284
7.4.33.1.	Shift towards an informal type of governance: Inclusion of the business community	284
7.4.33.2.	The leading role of the Commission	286
7.43.3.3.	Increasing the Forum's legitimacy: Inclusion of the business community and the adoption of soft-law instruments	286
7.43.3.4.	Monitoring task and transparency	287
7.43.3.5.	Place of the EU Arbitration Convention's governance in a broader EU governance perspective	287

7.4.4.	International relations theory and the EU Arbitration Convention	288
7.4.4.1.	General considerations	288
7.4.4.2.	Constructivism in respect of the EU Arbitration Convention	289
7.4.4.3.	The EU Arbitration Convention's governance and work conducted by Ring	290
7.5.	Evaluation	292
Chapter 8:	Answering the First Research Sub-Question	295
8.1.	Chapter overview	295
8.2.	Question (1): How is the EU Arbitration Convention governed?	296
8.2.1.	Day-to-day application	296
8.2.2.	Governance from a procedural perspective	297
8.3.	Question (2): Is this governance consistent with the EU Arbitration Convention's legal status and associated competences?	299
8.4.	Question (3): Does this governance adhere to the principles of effectiveness and efficiency?	300
8.4.1.	Day-to-day application	301
8.4.2.	Governance from a legal perspective	302
8.4.3.	Governance from a procedural perspective	303
8.5.	Answer to the first research sub-question	303
Chapter 9:	Formal Scope of Application	305
9.1.	Chapter overview	305
9.2.	Definitions of terms	306
9.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	306
9.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	307
9.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	308
9.2.4.	Analysis	308
9.2.4.1.	Interpretation of undefined terms under article 3(2) of the EU Arbitration Convention	308

Table of Contents

9.2.4.2.	Interpretation of the phrase “unless the context otherwise requires”	312
9.2.4.2.I.	General considerations	312
9.2.4.2.2.	Context according to the Vienna Convention	312
9.2.4.23.	Context according to the OECD Model Convention	313
9.3.	Taxes covered	314
9.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	314
9.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	315
9.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	315
9.3.4.	Analysis	315
93.4.1.	Application to taxes on income	315
93.4.2.	Member States’ definition of taxes	316
9.3.43.	Non-exhaustive list of taxes	317
93.4.4.	Application to local taxes/taxes levied by local authorities	318
93.4.5.	Newly introduced taxes	319
9.4.	Taxpayers covered	320
9.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	320
9.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	320
9.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	321
9.4.4.	Analysis	321
9.4.4.1.	Requirement of an enterprise of a contracting state	321
9.4.4.2.	Clarification of the term “enterprise of a Contracting State”	322
9.4.4.2.I.	Term “enterprise of a Contracting State”	322
9.4.4.2.2.	Term “enterprise”	323
9.4.4.23.	Term “resident”	324
9.4.43.	Final considerations	326
9.5.	Associated enterprises	326
9.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	326
9.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	327
9.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	327
9.5.4.	Analysis	327
9.5.4.1.	Examples of the application of the EU Arbitration Convention to associated enterprises	327
9.5.4.1.1.	Article 4(1)(a) of the EU Arbitration Convention	327
9.5.4.1.2.	Article 4(1)(b) of the EU Arbitration Convention	330
9.5.4.13.	Other situations	330

9.5.4.2.	Definition of the term “associated enterprises”	331
9.5.43.	Final considerations	332
9.6.	Permanent establishments	333
9.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	333
9.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	334
9.63.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	335
9.6.4.	Analysis	335
9.6.4.1.	Application of the EU Arbitration Convention to permanent establishments	335
9.6.4.1.1.	General considerations	335
9.6.4.1.2.	Examples of the application of the EU Arbitration Convention in respect of permanent establishments	336
9.6.4.13.	Examples of non-application of the EU Arbitration Convention in respect of permanent establishments	340
9.6.4.2.	Definition of the term “permanent establishment”	344
9.6.43.	Final considerations	346
9.7.	Territorial scope	347
9.7.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	347
9.7.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	348
9.73.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	348
9.7.4.	Analysis	348
9.7.4.1.	Defining the territorial scope of the EU Arbitration Convention	348
9.7.4.2.	Territorial scope per Member State	350
9.8.	Evaluation	357
Chapter 10:	Material Scope of Application	361
10.1.	Chapter overview	361
10.2.	Cases covered	362
10.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	362
10.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	362
10.23.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	364
10.2.4.	Analysis	364
10.2.4.1.	Conditions upon which cases become eligible under the EU Arbitration Convention	364

Table of Contents

10.2.4.2.	Actual payment of taxes as a requirement for cases to become admissible under the EU Arbitration Convention	368
10.3.	Primary, corresponding and secondary adjustments	369
10.3.1.	General considerations	369
10.3.2.	Primary adjustments	372
10.3.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	372
10.3.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	373
10.3.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	373
10.3.2.4.	Analysis	373
10.3.2.4.1.	A self-executing provision?	373
10.3.2.4.2.	Notification of a(n) (intended) profit adjustment	375
10.3.2.4.2.1.	Obligation to notify the taxpayer prior to the intended adjustment	375
10.3.2.4.2.2.	Non-compliance with the information obligation	376
10.3.2.4.2.3.	Agreement with the adjustment	378
10.3.3.	Corresponding adjustments	379
10.3.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	379
10.3.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	379
10.3.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	379
10.3.3.4.	Analysis	379
10.3.4.	Secondary adjustments	381
10.3.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	381
10.3.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	381
10.3.4.2.1.	General considerations	381
10.3.4.2.2.	The EU JTPF’s questionnaire on Member States’ policies as regards secondary adjustments	382
10.3.4.2.3.	Discussions on dealing with secondary adjustments in relation to the EU Arbitration Convention	384
10.3.4.2.4.	Final report on secondary adjustments	387
10.3.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	389
10.3.4.4.	Analysis	389
10.3.4.4.1.	General considerations	389
10.3.4.4.2.	State of play in international taxation	389
10.3.4.4.3.	Inclusion of secondary adjustments in the scope of application of the EU Arbitration Convention	391
10.3.4.4.4.	Recommendations provided for by the EU JTPF	393

10.4.	Application to situations of losses	394
10.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	394
10.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	394
10.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	394
10.4.4.	Analysis	394
10.5.	Tax principles	398
10.5.1.	General considerations	398
10.5.2.	Arm's length principle	399
10.5.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	399
10.5.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	400
10.5.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	400
10.5.2.4.	Analysis	400
10.5.3.	Profit attribution to permanent establishments	403
10.5.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	403
10.5.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	404
10.5.3.2.1.	General considerations	404
10.5.3.2.2.	Report on the interaction between article 4(2) of the EU Arbitration Convention and the equivalent of article 7 of the OECD Model Convention as included in the double tax conventions between Member States	405
10.5.3.2.3.	Follow-up to the Belgian report	407
10.5.3.2.3.1.	Deciding on the preferred option	407
10.5.3.2.3.2.	Working towards a common approach	408
10.5.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	410
10.5.3.4.	Analysis	411
10.5.3.4.1.	General considerations	411
10.5.3.4.2.	Attribution of profits to permanent establishments under the OECD Model Convention: Recent developments	413
10.5.3.4.3.	Discussions within the EU JTPF	417
10.5.3.4.4.	Guidance in the Code of Conduct	420
10.6.	Application to thin capitalization	421
10.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	421
10.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	422
10.6.2.1.	Initial discussions within the EU JTPF	422
10.6.2.2.	Member States' replies to the questionnaire on thin capitalization	423
10.6.2.3.	Final discussions within the EU JTPF and working towards a common approach	424

Table of Contents

10.6.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	427
10.6.4.	Analysis	427
10.6.4.1.	General considerations	427
10.6.4.2.	Possible situations of thin capitalization legislation	429
10.6.4.3.	Interpretation of the term “financial relations” under the OECD Model Convention	431
10.6.4.4.	Application of the EU Arbitration Convention to thin capitalization cases	434
10.6.4.4.1.	General considerations	434
10.6.4.4.2.	Qualification approach	435
10.6.4.4.3.	Arm’s length approach	436
10.6.4.4.4.	Debt/equity approach	438
10.6.4.5.	Solution offered in the Code of Conduct	441
10.7.	Evaluation	443
Chapter 11:	Phase I: Application	447
11.1.	Chapter overview	447
11.2.	Three-year deadline for submission of a request	448
11.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	448
11.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	448
11.2.2.1.	Discussions and agreement on a common definition of the starting-period of the 3-year deadline	448
11.2.2.2.	Miscellaneous discussions on several aspects of the 3-year deadline	450
11.2.2.2.1.	General considerations	450
11.2.2.2.2.	Early submission of cases	450
11.2.2.2.3.	Informing taxpayers of their rights as regards the 3-year deadline	451
11.2.2.2.4.	Borderline cases	452
11.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	453
11.2.4.	Analysis	454
11.2.4.1.	General considerations	454
11.2.4.2.	Interpretation of the phrase “first notification of action” and commencement date of the 3-year deadline	455

11.2.4.3.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF and guidance in the Code of Conduct as regards the commencement date of the 3-year deadline	456
11.2.4.4.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF and guidance in the Code of Conduct on related issues	460
11.2.4.4.1.	Early submission of cases	460
11.2.4.4.2.	Borderline cases and informing taxpayers of their rights in respect of the 3-year deadline	461
11.3.	Submission of a request	461
11.3.1.	General considerations	461
11.3.2.	Persons eligible to submit a request	461
11.3.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	461
11.3.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	462
11.3.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	463
11.3.2.4.	Analysis	463
11.3.2.4.1.	Eligible persons in general	463
11.3.2.4.2.	Eligible persons in case of mergers, restructuring, dissolution or liquidation	465
11.3.3.	Grounds for submission of a request	466
11.3.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	466
11.3.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	467
11.3.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	468
11.3.3.4.	Analysis	468
11.3.3.4.1.	Requirements to be met for submission of a request	468
11.3.3.4.2.	Finality of the tax assessment that includes the profit adjustment	469
11.3.3.4.3.	Waiver of access to dispute settlement procedures following an audit settlement	471
11.3.4.	Content, format and language of the request	472
11.3.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	472
11.3.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	472
11.3.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	474
11.3.4.4.	Analysis	475
11.3.4.4.1.	Content request	475
11.3.4.4.1.1.	List of information to be submitted	475
11.3.4.4.1.2.	More than one adjustment	477
11.3.4.4.1.3.	Incomplete requests	477
11.3.4.4.2.	Notification of other Member States involved	479
11.3.4.4.3.	Format of the request	479
11.3.4.4.4.	Language of the request	480

Table of Contents

11.3.5.	Addressee of the request	481
11.3.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	481
11.3.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	481
11.3.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	482
11.3.5.4.	Analysis	482
11.4.	Receipt of the request and initial follow-up	485
11.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	485
11.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	485
11.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	485
11.4.4.	Analysis	486
11.4.4.1.	Notification of the receipt	486
11.4.4.1.1.	Notification of the other involved competent authority(ies)	486
11.4.4.1.2.	Notification of the taxpayer	488
11.4.4.2.	Request for additional information	489
11.5.	Evaluation	490
Chapter 12:	Phase II: Unilateral Relief Procedure	495
12.1.	Chapter overview	495
12.2.	Timeline for unilateral relief procedure	496
12.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	496
12.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	496
12.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	496
12.2.4.	Analysis	496
12.3.	Review of the request	498
12.3.1.	Request well-founded	498
12.3.1.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	498
12.3.1.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	498
12.3.1.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	500
12.3.1.4.	Analysis	501
12.3.1.4.1.	General considerations	501
12.3.1.4.2.	Clarification of the term “well-founded”	503
12.3.1.4.3.	Possibility of appeal against a judgment of a request not well-founded	507
12.3.2.	Possibility of a satisfactory solution	510
12.3.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	510
12.3.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	510

Table of Contents

12.3.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	510
12.3.2.4.	Analysis	511
12.4.	Proceedings during the unilateral relief procedure	513
12.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	513
12.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	513
12.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	514
12.4.4.	Analysis	515
12.4.4.1.	General considerations	515
12.4.4.2.	Request is judged not well-founded	516
12.4.4.3.	Request is considered well-founded and a satisfactory solution is possible	518
12.4.4.4.	Request is considered well-founded, but a satisfactory solution is not possible	519
12.5.	Restrictions in the application of the EU Arbitration Convention: Serious penalty clause	522
12.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	522
12.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	523
12.5.2.1.	2002-2004: Discussions during the EU JTPF's first term on article 8 of the EU Arbitration Convention	523
12.5.2.2.	2005-2009: Working towards a common approach on applying article 8 of the EU Arbitration Convention	525
12.5.2.3.	2011-2015: Renewed discussions on the scope of application of article 8 of the EU Arbitration Convention	527
12.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	530
12.5.4.	Analysis	531
12.5.4.1.	General considerations	531
12.5.4.2.	Working sphere of the penalty clause of article 8 of the EU Arbitration Convention	532
12.5.4.2.1.	Requirements to be met for invoking the penalty clause	532
12.5.4.2.2.	Member States' definitions of the term "serious penalty"	535
12.5.4.3.	Application of the penalty clause in practice	538
12.5.4.3.1.	Member State's policy and practices when imposing penalties	538
12.5.4.3.2.	Member States' application of the penalty clause	540

Table of Contents

12.5.4.4.	Correctness of the inclusion of the penalty clause and content thereof	542
12.5.4.5.	Guidance in the Code of Conduct	546
12.6.	Suspension of tax collection during the period the EU Arbitration Convention is applied	548
12.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	548
12.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	548
12.6.2.1.	Working towards a common approach	548
12.6.2.2.	Monitoring the suspension of tax collection in practice	550
12.6.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	551
12.6.4.	Analysis	552
12.6.4.1.	Tax collection and the application of the EU Arbitration Convention	552
12.6.4.2.	Solution offered in the Code of Conduct	555
12.7.	Evaluation	557
Chapter 13:	Phase III: Mutual Agreement Procedure (<i>Procedure Amiable</i>)	561
13.1.	Chapter overview	561
13.2.	The 2-year deadline for the mutual agreement procedure	562
13.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	562
13.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	563
13.2.2.1.	2002-2004: Working towards a common approach on the commencement date of the 2-year deadline	563
13.2.2.2.	2011-2015: Renewed discussions on the commencement date of the 2-year deadline	565
13.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	569
13.2.4.	Analysis	570
13.2.4.1.	Background of the 2-year deadline	570
13.2.4.2.	Possible commencement dates of the 2-year deadline	572
13.2.4.3.	Solution offered in the Code of Conduct	574
13.2.4.3.1.	Guidance on the commencement date of the 2-year deadline	574

13.2.4.3.2.	Requests for additional information and stalling the computation of the 2-year deadline	576
13.2.4.3.3.	Agreement between the competent authorities involved on whether all information listed in paragraph 7.6(a) of the Code of Conduct has been submitted	578
13.3.	Amendments to the 2-year deadline	580
13.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	580
13.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	580
13.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	581
13.3.4.	Analysis	581
13.4.	Proceedings during the mutual agreement procedure	585
13.4.1.	General considerations	585
13.4.2.	Timeline for the mutual agreement procedure	586
13.4.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	586
13.4.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	586
13.4.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	588
13.4.2.4.	Analysis	589
13.4.2.4.1.	General considerations	589
13.4.2.4.2.	Content of the timescale	590
13.4.2.4.2.1.	Months 1-4: Submission of a position paper	590
13.4.2.4.2.2.	Months 5-10: Submission of a responding position paper	591
13.4.2.4.2.3.	Months 11-18: Initial negotiations and planning of face-to-face meetings	592
13.4.2.4.2.4.	Months 19-24: Final negotiation phase	593
13.4.2.4.2.5.	Forms of communication	594
13.4.2.5.	Final considerations	595
13.4.3.	Independent functioning of the competent authority	595
13.4.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	595
13.4.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	596
13.4.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	597
13.4.3.4.	Analysis	597
13.4.4.	Common working language	600
13.4.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	600
13.4.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	600
13.4.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	601
13.4.4.4.	Analysis	601

Table of Contents

13.4.4.4.1.	Necessity for a common working language	601
13.4.4.4.2.	Guidance in the Code of Conduct	602
13.4.5.	Position paper and responding position paper	604
13.4.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	604
13.4.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	605
13.4.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	606
13.4.5.4.	Analysis	607
13.4.5.4.1.	Party to issue the position paper	607
13.4.5.4.2.	Content of the position paper	608
13.4.5.4.3.	Response to the position paper	609
13.4.5.4.3.1.	Possible forms of a response	609
13.4.5.4.3.2.	Content of the responding position paper	611
13.5.	Confidentiality of information	612
13.5.1.	Provisions of the EU Arbitration Convention	612
13.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	612
13.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	613
13.5.4.	Analysis	613
13.6.	Costs of the mutual agreement procedure	614
13.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	614
13.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	614
13.6.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	615
13.6.4.	Analysis	615
13.7.	Outcome of the procedure	616
13.7.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	616
13.7.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	617
13.7.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	618
13.7.4.	Analysis	618
13.7.4.1.	A mutual agreement is reached	618
13.7.4.2.	No mutual agreement is reached	619
13.8.	Evaluation	621
Chapter 14:	Phase IV: Arbitration Procedure	627
14.1.	Chapter overview	627
14.2.	Six-month deadline for the arbitration procedure	628
14.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	628
14.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	628

14.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	630
14.2.4.	Analysis	631
14.2.4.1.	Six months as an appropriate term?	631
14.2.4.2.	Possible commencement dates of the 6-month deadline	632
14.2.4.3.	Guidance provided in the Code of Conduct	636
14.3.	Establishment of the advisory commission	638
14.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	638
14.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	638
14.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	639
14.3.4.	Analysis	640
14.3.4.1.	Obligation to establish the advisory commission	640
14.3.4.2.	Deadline for establishing the advisory commission	641
14.3.4.3.	Non-cooperation by Member States in establishing the advisory commission	643
14.4.	Composition of the advisory commission	644
14.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	644
14.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	645
14.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	648
14.4.4.	Analysis	648
14.4.4.1.	Number of members of the advisory commission	648
14.4.4.2.	Inclusion of independent persons	649
14.4.4.3.	Inclusion of Member States' representatives	650
14.4.4.4.	Actual number of members of an advisory commission	651
14.5.	Secretarial assistance	654
14.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	654
14.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	654
14.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	655
14.5.4.	Analysis	655
14.6.	Selection and appointment of members	656
14.6.1.	Member States' representatives	656
14.6.1.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	656
14.6.1.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	656
14.6.1.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	657
14.6.1.4.	Analysis	657
14.6.1.5.	Evaluation	659
14.6.2.	Independent persons	660

Table of Contents

14.6.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	660
14.6.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	661
14.6.2.2.1.	Permanency and publication of the list of nominated persons	661
14.6.2.2.2.	Interpretation of the criteria to be met by the nominated persons	661
14.6.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	664
14.6.2.4.	Analysis	665
14.6.2.4.1.	Procedure for appointing independent persons	665
14.6.2.4.1.1.	Appointment by mutual agreement	665
14.6.2.4.1.2.	Disagreement on appointing independent persons: Drawing of lots	668
14.6.2.4.2.	List of independent persons	671
14.6.2.4.2.1.	Number of nominees and actual submission of the nominated persons	671
14.6.2.4.2.2.	Permanency of the list and alterations thereto	674
14.6.2.4.2.3.	Publication of the list	675
14.6.2.4.3.	Criteria for independent persons	676
14.6.2.4.3.1.	Nationality and residence criteria	676
14.6.2.4.3.2.	Competence criterion	676
14.6.2.4.3.3.	Independence criterion	678
14.6.2.4.3.4.	Current list of nominees	680
14.6.2.5.	Final considerations	683
14.6.3.	Chairman	684
14.6.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	684
14.6.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	684
14.6.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	685
14.6.3.4.	Analysis	685
14.6.3.4.1.	Process of appointment	685
14.6.3.4.2.	Disagreement on the appointment	686
14.6.3.4.3.	Criteria for appointment	686
14.6.4.	Alternates	687
14.6.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	687
14.6.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	687
14.6.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	688
14.6.4.4.	Analysis	688
14.7.	Proceedings during the arbitration procedure	689
14.7.1.	Place of the advisory commission's meetings	689
14.7.1.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	689
14.7.1.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	690
14.7.1.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	690

14.7.1.4.	Analysis	690
14.7.2.	Planning of the advisory commission's meetings	692
14.7.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	692
14.7.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	692
14.7.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	692
14.7.2.4.	Analysis	692
14.7.3.	Attendance of the meetings	693
14.7.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	693
14.7.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	693
14.7.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	693
14.7.3.4.	Analysis	693
14.7.4.	Common working language	694
14.7.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	694
14.7.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	694
14.7.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	695
14.7.4.4.	Analysis	695
14.7.4.4.1.	Agreeing on a common working language	695
14.7.4.4.2.	Translation of additional information	698
14.7.5.	Providing information to the advisory commission	699
14.7.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	699
14.7.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	699
14.7.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	700
14.7.5.4.	Analysis	701
14.7.5.4.1.	Submission of information by Member States	701
14.7.5.4.2.	Submission of information by taxpayers	702
14.7.6.	Requesting additional information by the advisory commission	703
14.7.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	703
14.7.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	703
14.7.6.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	704
14.7.6.4.	Analysis	704
14.7.6.4.1.	Possibility to request and obligation to submit information	704
14.7.6.4.2.	Exception clauses	705
14.7.7.	Appearance before the advisory commission	708
14.7.7.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	708
14.7.7.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	708
14.7.7.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	710
14.7.7.4.	Analysis	711
14.7.7.4.1.	Appearance by the taxpayer and/or its associated enterprise(s)	711
14.7.7.4.2.	Appearance by Member States	713

Table of Contents

14.8.	Confidentiality of information	714
14.8.1.	Provisions of the EU Arbitration Convention	714
14.8.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	714
14.8.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	715
14.8.4.	Analysis	715
14.8.4.1.	Necessity of a secrecy obligation	715
14.8.4.2.	Content of the secrecy obligation	716
14.8.4.3.	Penalty clause for breach of secrecy obligation	718
14.9.	Costs	720
14.9.1.	Provisions of the EU Arbitration Convention	720
14.9.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	720
14.9.2.1.	Cost basis of the arbitration procedure and payment of the costs	720
14.9.2.2.	Fees of independent persons/chairman	721
14.9.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	724
14.9.4.	Analysis	725
14.9.4.1.	Cost basis of the arbitration procedure	725
14.9.4.2.	Fees of independent persons/chairman	727
14.9.4.3.	Reimbursement of expenses of independent persons	730
14.9.4.4.	Payment of the costs of the arbitration procedure	731
14.9.4.5.	Agreement on different rules	732
14.10.	Outcome of the procedure	732
14.10.1.	Adoption of the opinion	732
14.10.1.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	732
14.10.1.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	732
14.10.1.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	733
14.10.1.4.	Analysis	734
14.10.1.4.1.	Arriving at a majority opinion	734
14.10.1.4.2.	Limited voting power and allowance of separate deliberations	735
14.10.1.4.3.	Agreeing on additional rules of procedure	736
14.10.2.	Content of the opinion	737
14.10.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	737
14.10.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	737
14.10.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	738
14.10.2.4.	Analysis	738
14.10.2.4.1.	Grounds of the opinion	738
14.10.2.4.2.	Content of the opinion	740
14.10.3.	Communication of the opinion	741

14.10.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	741
14.10.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	741
14.10.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	741
14.10.3.4.	Analysis	741
14.11.	Evaluation	742
Chapter 15:	Phase V: Final Decision and Implementation	753
15.1.	Chapter overview	753
15.2.	Six-month deadline for taking a final decision	754
15.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	754
15.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	754
15.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	754
15.2.4.	Analysis	755
15.3.	Content of the final decision	755
15.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	755
15.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	756
15.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	756
15.3.4.	Analysis	756
15.3.4.1.	Agreement with the opinion of the advisory commission	756
15.3.4.2.	Disagreement with the opinion of the advisory commission	757
15.3.4.2.1.	General considerations	757
15.3.4.2.2.	A final decision is taken	757
15.3.4.2.3.	No final decision is taken	761
15.4.	Communication of the final decision	761
15.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	761
15.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	761
15.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	762
15.4.4.	Analysis	762
15.5.	Implementation of a mutual agreement reached / The final decision	764
15.5.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	764
15.5.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	764
15.5.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	764
15.5.4.	Analysis	764

Table of Contents

15.5.4.1.	Implementation of a mutual agreement reached as a result of the mutual agreement procedure	764
15.5.4.2.	Implementation of a final decision as a follow-up to the outcome of the arbitration procedure	766
15.6.	Publication of the final decision	767
15.6.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	767
15.6.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	767
15.6.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	767
15.6.4.	Analysis	768
15.6.4.1.	Necessity of allowing for publication	768
15.6.4.2.	Content of the publication	769
15.6.4.3.	Place of publication	770
15.6.4.4.	Taxpayers' consent to publication	771
15.6.4.5.	Period within which to agree on publication	773
15.7.	Alteration of decisions and remaining double taxation	773
15.7.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	773
15.7.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	774
15.7.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	774
15.7.4.	Analysis	774
15.7.4.1.	Alteration of decisions and reapplying the EU Arbitration Convention	774
15.7.4.2.	Remaining double taxation	776
15.8.	Effect on future years and precedential effects	778
15.8.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	778
15.8.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	778
15.8.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	779
15.8.4.	Analysis	780
15.8.4.1.	Effect on future years	780
15.8.4.2.	Precedential effects	782
15.9.	Interest charges and refunds	783
15.9.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	783
15.9.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	783
15.9.2.1.	2002-2004: Initial discussions	783
15.9.2.2.	2005-2008: Working towards a common approach	784
15.9.2.3.	2011-2015: Renewed discussions on a common approach	786
15.9.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	787

15.9.4.	Analysis	788
15.9.4.1.	General considerations	788
15.9.4.2.	Possible options for dealing with interest charges and refunds	791
15.9.4.3.	Solution provided for in the Code of Conduct	792
15.10.	Evaluation	794
Chapter 16:	Miscellaneous	799
16.1.	Chapter overview	799
16.2.	Taxpayers' rights and involvement	800
16.2.1.	General considerations	800
16.2.2.	Taxpayers' rights and involvement during the mutual agreement procedure	800
16.2.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	800
16.2.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	800
16.2.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	802
16.2.2.4.	Analysis	802
16.2.2.4.1.	General considerations	802
16.2.2.4.2.	Guidance in the Code of Conduct	803
16.2.2.4.2.1.	Informing the taxpayer of relevant developments	803
16.2.2.4.2.2.	Taxpayers' right to participate	804
16.2.2.4.3.	Right to end the mutual agreement procedure	806
16.2.3.	Taxpayers' rights and involvement during the arbitration procedure	807
16.2.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	807
16.2.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	808
16.2.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	809
16.2.3.4.	Analysis	809
16.2.3.4.1.	Absence of extensive rights to participate in the arbitration procedure	809
16.2.3.4.2.	Rights granted to taxpayers	811
16.2.4.	Taxpayers' rights and involvement during the implementation phase	813
16.2.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	813
16.2.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	813
16.2.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	816
16.2.4.4.	Analysis	816
16.2.4.4.1.	General considerations	816

Table of Contents

16.2.4.4.2.	Agreement reached as a result of the mutual agreement procedure	817
16.2.4.4.3.	Final decision as a follow-up to the outcome of the arbitration procedure	820
16.2.4.4.4.	Binding opinion of the advisory commission in the absence of a final decision	821
16.3.	Interaction with other dispute settlement procedures	824
16.3.1.	Interaction during the application phase and unilateral relief procedure	824
16.3.1.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	824
16.3.1.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	825
16.3.1.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	827
16.3.1.4.	Analysis	827
16.3.1.4.1.	Interaction with domestic appeals procedure	827
16.3.1.4.2.	Interaction with the dispute settlement procedure under the applicable double tax convention	829
16.3.1.4.2.1.	Absence of detailed rules in the EU Arbitration Convention on the interaction with double tax conventions between Member States	829
16.3.1.4.2.2.	Application of the EU Arbitration Convention dependent on the outcome of a mutual agreement procedure under the applicable double tax convention	831
16.3.1.4.2.3.	Interaction with pending mutual agreement procedures under double tax conventions between Member States	832
16.3.2.	Interaction during the mutual agreement procedure	833
16.3.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	833
16.3.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	833
16.3.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	835
16.3.2.4.	Analysis	836
16.3.2.4.1.	General considerations	836
16.3.2.4.2.	Interpretation of the terms “court” and “tribunal”	836
16.3.2.4.3.	Interpretation of the phrase “shall be computed from the date”	838
16.3.2.4.4.	Interpretation of the phrase “judgment of the final court of appeal”	840
16.3.3.	Interaction during the arbitration procedure	841
16.3.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	841

16.3.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	843
16.3.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	844
16.3.3.4.	Analysis	844
16.3.3.4.1.	Initiating juridical/administrative procedures for administrative penalties and the reference of a case to arbitration	844
16.3.3.4.2.	Interaction with domestic appeals procedures	845
16.3.3.4.2.1.	Content of article 7(3) of the EU Arbitration Convention	845
16.3.3.4.2.2.	Member States' policy and practices	848
16.3.3.4.3.	Interaction with the dispute settlement procedure under the applicable double tax convention	850
16.3.4.	Interaction during the implementation phase	851
16.3.4.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	851
16.3.4.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	851
16.3.4.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	852
16.3.4.4.	Analysis	852
16.4.	Triangular cases	853
16.4.1.	General considerations	853
16.4.2.	Inclusion of triangular cases in the scope of application of the EU Arbitration Convention	854
16.4.2.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	854
16.4.2.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	854
16.4.2.2.1.	Discussions on the inclusion of triangular cases in the Convention's scope of application	854
16.4.2.2.2.	Discussions on the practical application of the Convention to triangular cases	855
16.4.2.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	857
16.4.2.4.	Analysis	858
16.4.2.4.1.	Possible situations of triangular cases	858
16.4.2.4.2.	Application of the EU Arbitration Convention to triangular cases	861
16.4.2.4.3.	Guidance in the Code of Conduct	863
16.4.3.	Procedural application	865
16.4.3.1.	Provision of the EU Arbitration Convention	865
16.4.3.2.	Work conducted by the EU JTPF	865
16.4.3.2.1.	General considerations	865
16.4.3.2.2.	EU triangular cases	866
16.4.3.2.3.	Non-EU triangular cases	867
16.4.3.3.	Provision of the Code of Conduct	869
16.4.3.4.	Analysis	871

Table of Contents

16.4.3.4.1.	EU triangular cases	871
16.4.3.4.1.1.	Identifying a triangular case	871
16.4.3.4.1.2.	Taxpayer’s rights and involvement	875
16.4.3.4.1.3.	Application of the 2-year deadline of the mutual agreement procedure to triangular cases	877
16.4.3.4.1.4.	Applying the mutual agreement procedure to triangular cases	878
16.4.3.4.1.5.	Applying the arbitration procedure to triangular cases	882
16.4.3.4.2.	Non-EU triangular cases	885
16.5.	Evaluations	889
16.5.1.	Taxpayers’ rights and involvement	889
16.5.2.	Interaction with other dispute settlement mechanism	893
16.5.3.	Triangular cases	898
16.5.4.	Final considerations	902
Chapter 17:	Answering the Second Research Sub-Question	903
17.1.	Chapter overview	903
17.2.	Basic outcome of the evaluation	903
17.2.1.	Formal scope of application	903
17.2.2.	Material scope of application	904
17.2.3.	Procedural functioning	905
17.2.3.1.	General considerations	905
17.2.3.2.	Phase I: Application	905
17.2.3.3.	Phase II: Unilateral review	906
17.2.3.4.	Phase III: Mutual agreement procedure	906
17.2.3.5.	Phase IV: Arbitration procedure	907
17.2.3.6.	Phase V: Final decision and implementation	907
17.2.3.7.	Miscellaneous	908
17.3.	Answer to the second research sub-question	908
Chapter 18:	Answering the Third Research Sub-Question	917
18.1.	Chapter overview	917
18.2.	Bottlenecks in the current design of the EU Arbitration Convention	919

183.	Improvements through the Code of Conduct	924
183.1.	General considerations	924
183.2.	Effect of the Code of Conduct through the lens of the arbitration procedure	925
1833.	Contribution of the Code of Conduct to a more efficient and effective functioning of the EU Arbitration Convention	928
18.4.	Main contours of improved governance and functioning of the EU Arbitration Convention	931
18.4.1.	General considerations	931
18.4.2.	Overview of recommendations to improve the Convention's governance	931
18.43.	Overview of recommendations to improve the Convention's functioning	932
18.43.1.	General considerations	932
18.43.2.	Recommendations as regards the formal and material scope of application	933
18.433.	Recommendations as regards the procedural functioning: Introducing more sophisticated deadlines for the procedures and a proper default mechanism	934
18.433.1.	General considerations	934
18.433.2.	Introducing a proper default mechanism	935
18.433.2.1.	General considerations	935
18.433.2.2.	Legal nature of the arbitration procedure under the EU Arbitration Convention	936
18.433.23.	Necessity of the final decision phase	941
18.433.2.4.	Providing a more effective and efficient functioning of the arbitration procedure	942
18.4333.	Introducing a more sophisticated timeline for the Convention's procedures	947
18.433.4.	Building in procedural safeguards	950
18.5.	Concluding remarks	956
Chapter 19:	Improving the Governance of the EU Arbitration Convention	957
19.1.	Chapter overview	957
19.2.	Improving the day-to-day application of the Convention	958

Table of Contents

19.2.1.	General considerations	958
19.2.2.	Performing registration tasks	959
19.2.3.	Introducing a central supervising organ	960
19.2.3.1.	Contours of an improved system to ensure compliance with the Convention's obligations	960
19.2.3.2.	Choosing an institution that should function as the central supervising organ	961
19.2.3.3.	Tasks to be assigned to this institution	963
19.2.3.3.1.	General considerations	963
19.2.3.3.2.	Introducing a central and permanent secretariat as well as a central monitoring function	963
19.2.3.3.3.	Introducing a default mechanism to refer cases to the arbitration procedure	966
19.2.3.4.	Translation of the recommendations into specific treaty provisions	967
19.2.3.4.1.	General considerations	967
19.2.3.4.2.	Establishing a central and permanent secretariat	968
19.2.3.4.3.	Competence for the Commission to refer cases to the arbitration procedure	969
19.2.3.4.3.1.	Establishing the advisory commission	969
19.2.3.4.3.2.	Nomination of independent persons	970
19.3.	Improving the governance from a legal perspective	972
19.4.	Improving the governance from a procedural perspective	973
19.5.	Concluding remarks	974
Chapter 20:	Improving the Functioning of the EU Arbitration Convention	975
20.1.	Chapter overview	975
20.2.	Improving the Convention's formal scope of application	976
20.2.1.	General considerations	976
20.2.2.	Applicable language	976
20.2.3.	Period of application and admissibility of cases	977
20.2.4.	Ratification procedures	978
20.2.5.	Definition of terms	979
20.2.5.1.	General considerations	979

20.2.5.2.	Interpretation of undefined terms: Amending article 3(2) of the Convention	980
20.2.5.3.	Definition of the terms “enterprise of a Contracting State”, “enterprise” and “resident”	981
20.2.5.4.	Definition of the term “associated enterprises”	983
20.2.5.5.	Definition of the term “permanent establishment”	985
20.2.6.	Taxes covered	987
20.2.7.	Personal application	988
20.2.7.1.	Application to dealings between associated enterprises	988
20.2.7.2.	Application to dealings with permanent establishments	988
20.2.8.	Territorial scope	990
20.3.	Improving the Convention’s material scope of application	992
20.3.1.	General considerations	992
20.3.2.	Cases covered	992
20.3.3.	Application to primary, corresponding and secondary adjustments	994
20.3.3.1.	Primary adjustments	994
20.3.3.2.	Corresponding adjustments	994
20.3.3.3.	Secondary adjustments	994
20.3.4.	Application to situation of losses	996
20.3.5.	Tax principles underlying the Convention’s material scope of application	997
20.3.5.1.	Arm’s length principle	997
20.3.5.2.	Principle of attributing profits to permanent establishments	998
20.3.6.	Application to thin capitalization cases	1001
20.4.	Improving the Convention’s procedural functioning	1003
20.4.1.	General considerations	1003
20.4.2.	Phase I: Application	1003
20.4.2.1.	General considerations	1003
20.4.2.2.	Three-year deadline for submission of a request	1004
20.4.2.3.	Persons eligible to submit a request	1006
20.4.2.4.	Grounds for submission of the request	1007
20.4.2.5.	Content, format and language of the request	1008
20.4.2.5.1.	Content	1008
20.4.2.5.2.	Format	1011

Table of Contents

20.4.2.5.3.	Language	1011
20.4.2.6.	Addressee of the request	1012
20.4.3.	Phase II: Unilateral relief procedure	1014
20.4.3.1.	General considerations	1014
20.4.3.2.	Introducing a timeline for the unilateral relief procedure	1014
20.4.3.3.	Defining the terms “well-founded” and “satisfactory solution”	1015
20.4.3.3.1.	Criteria for a well-founded request	1015
20.4.3.3.2.	Arriving at a satisfactory solution	1018
20.4.3.4.	Procedural rules to be applied during the unilateral relief procedure	1019
20.4.3.4.1.	Months 0-1: Notification of receipt to the taxpayer that submitted the request/other involved competent authorities	1019
20.4.3.4.2.	Months 0-2: Requesting additional information	1020
20.4.3.4.3.	Months 3-4: Submission of additional information	1020
20.4.3.4.4.	Months 5-6: Reviewing the request	1021
20.4.3.4.4.1.	General considerations	1021
20.4.3.4.4.2.	Option (1): The request is judged to be not well-founded	1021
20.4.3.4.4.3.	Option (2): The request is judged to be well-founded, but a unilateral satisfactory solution is possible	1023
20.4.3.4.4.4.	Option (3): The request is judged to be well-founded and no unilateral satisfactory solution is possible	1024
20.4.3.5.	Redefining the penalty clause	1025
20.4.3.6.	Suspension of tax collection	1028
20.4.4.	Phase III: Mutual agreement procedure	1029
20.4.4.1.	General considerations	1029
20.4.4.2.	Introducing a more sophisticated deadline for the mutual agreement procedure	1029
20.4.4.3.	Amendments to the deadline	1032
20.4.4.4.	Timeline for the mutual agreement procedure	1032
20.4.4.5.	Independent functioning of the competent authority	1035
20.4.4.6.	Common working language	1036
20.4.4.7.	Content and exchange of position papers	1037
20.4.4.8.	Confidentiality of information	1040
20.4.4.9.	Costs of the procedure	1042
20.4.4.10.	Outcome of the procedure	1043

20.4.5.	Phase IV: Arbitration procedure	1044
20.4.5.1.	General considerations	1044
20.4.5.2.	Six-month deadline	1044
20.4.5.3.	Establishment of the arbitration commission	1046
20.4.5.4.	Composition of the arbitration commission	1048
20.4.5.5.	Secretarial assistance	1050
20.4.5.6.	Selecting and appointing members	1051
20.4.5.6.1.	General considerations	1051
20.4.5.6.2.	Member States' representatives	1051
20.4.5.6.3.	Independent persons	1054
20.4.5.6.3.1.	Process of appointment	1054
20.4.5.6.3.2.	List of independent persons	1055
20.4.5.6.3.3.	Criteria for independent persons	1058
20.4.5.6.4.	Chairman	1064
20.4.5.6.5.	Alternates	1068
20.4.5.7.	Proceedings within the arbitration commission	1070
20.4.5.7.1.	Place of the arbitration commission's meetings	1070
20.4.5.7.2.	Planning of meetings	1071
20.4.5.7.3.	Attendance at meetings	1072
20.4.5.7.4.	Common working language	1074
20.4.5.7.5.	Providing information to the arbitration commission	1075
20.4.5.7.6.	Request for additional information by the arbitration commission	1076
20.4.5.7.7.	Appearance before the arbitration commission	1082
20.4.5.8.	Confidentiality of information	1085
20.4.5.9.	Costs	1087
20.4.5.9.1.	Costs basis of the arbitration procedure	1087
20.4.5.9.2.	Remuneration and reimbursement of independent persons/chairman	1088
20.4.5.9.2.1.	Fees for independent persons/chairman	1088
20.4.5.9.2.2.	Reimbursement of expenses of independent persons/chairman	1090
20.4.5.9.3.	Actual payment of costs	1092
20.4.5.9.4.	Agreement on deviating rules	1092
20.4.5.10.	Outcome of the procedure	1093
20.4.5.10.1.	General considerations	1093
20.4.5.10.2.	Process of adopting an arbitration decision	1093
20.4.5.10.3.	Content of the arbitral award	1095
20.4.6.	Phase V: Implementation	1096
20.4.6.1.	General considerations	1096

Table of Contents

20.4.6.2.	Communication of the mutual agreement and arbitral award	1097
20.4.6.3.	Implementation of the mutual agreement and the arbitral award	1099
20.4.6.3.1.	Implementation of a mutual agreement	1099
20.4.6.3.2.	Implementation of the arbitral award	1102
20.4.6.3.3.	Post-award controls	1104
20.4.6.4.	Publication of the arbitral award	1105
20.4.6.5.	Alteration of decisions and remaining double taxation	1107
20.4.6.5.1.	Alteration of decisions	1107
20.4.6.5.2.	Remaining double taxation	1109
20.4.6.6.	Effect on future years and precedential effects	1110
20.4.6.6.1.	Effect on future years	1110
20.4.6.6.2.	Precedential effects	1111
20.4.6.7.	Interest charges and refunds	1112
20.4.7.	Miscellaneous	1115
20.4.7.1.	General considerations	1115
20.4.7.2.	Taxpayer's rights and involvement	1115
20.4.7.2.1.	Previous recommendations relating to the five phases of the EU Arbitration Convention	1115
20.4.7.2.2.	Additional recommendations to improve taxpayers' rights and involvement under the EU Arbitration Convention	1117
20.4.7.3.	Interaction with other dispute settlement mechanisms	1119
20.4.7.3.1.	Interaction with domestic appeals	1119
20.4.7.3.2.	Interaction with double tax conventions between Member States	1123
20.4.7.3.3.	Relation with previously conducted mutual agreement procedures	1124
20.4.7.4.	Triangular cases	1126
20.4.7.4.1.	Including triangular cases in the scope of application of the EU Arbitration Convention	1126
20.4.7.4.2.	Procedural application to EU triangular cases	1128
20.4.7.4.2.1.	Identification of a triangular case	1128
20.4.7.4.2.2.	Timeline for the mutual agreement procedure	1130
20.4.7.4.2.3.	Rules to be applied during the mutual agreement procedure	1131
20.4.7.4.2.4.	Rules to be applied during the arbitration procedure	1132

20.4.7.4.3.	Procedural application to non-EU triangular cases	1133
20.5.	Concluding remarks	1136
Chapter 21:	Answering the Central Research Question	1137
21.1.	Chapter overview	1137
21.2.	Short recap of the outcome of the dissertation	1138
21.2.1.	Hypotheses posed	1138
21.2.2.	Answer to the first sub-question	1139
21.2.3.	Answer to the second sub-question	1140
21.2.4.	Answer to the third sub-question	1142
21.3.	Answer to the central research question	1144
Part II		
The Dispute Resolution Directive		
Chapter 22:	History of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1149
22.1.	Chapter overview	1149
22.2.	Developments on an EU level on improving dispute resolution	1149
22.2.1.	Origins of a proposal for a directive on dispute resolution	1149
22.2.1.1.	Desirability to have the proposed Arbitration Directive adopted (1990-2005)	1149
22.2.1.2.	Exploring the necessity and desirability for an EU-wide dispute resolution mechanism (2006-2011)	1151
22.2.1.2.1.	2006 Communication	1151
22.2.1.2.2.	2007 Communication	1152
22.2.1.2.3.	2010 Public consultation	1152
22.2.1.2.4.	2011 Communication	1154
22.2.1.2.5.	2011 Roadmap on initiatives to address double taxation within the European Union	1156
22.2.1.3.	Working towards a proposal for dispute resolution mechanisms (2012-2016)	1156

Table of Contents

22.2.2.	Studies on feasible measures for an EU-wide dispute resolution mechanism	1158
22.2.2.1.	Section overview	1158
22.2.2.2.	2011 Roadmap	1158
22.2.2.3.	2016 Public consultation	1159
22.2.2.3.1.	Issuing the consultation and general overview of the responses	1159
22.2.2.3.2.	Responses to the questionnaire	1160
22.2.2.3.2.1.	Question 1: Necessary action at the EU level	1160
22.2.2.3.2.2.	Question 2: Objectives of possible actions at the EU level	1162
22.2.2.3.2.3.	Question 3: Preferences for the presented options of possible actions at the EU level	1163
22.2.2.4.	Conclusions drawn by the Commission from the consultation	1165
22.2.2.4.1.	General considerations	1165
22.2.2.4.2.	Consideration of the three options	1166
22.2.2.4.3.	Conclusion on the options and way forward	1168
22.3.	The proposal for a directive on dispute resolution	1170
22.3.1.	Section overview	1170
22.3.2.	Legal basis of the proposal	1170
22.3.2.1.	General considerations	1170
22.3.2.2.	Principle of subsidiarity	1171
22.3.2.2.1.	Requirements under the principle of subsidiarity	1171
22.3.2.2.2.	Double taxation and the impact of the functioning of the EU internal market	1171
22.3.2.2.3.	Shortcomings identified with existing dispute resolution mechanisms and justification of EU action in light of the principle of subsidiarity	1173
22.3.2.3.	Principle of proportionality	1177
22.3.2.4.	Final considerations	1178
22.3.3.	Process of adoption	1179
22.4.	Concluding remarks	1182
Chapter 23:	Objectives, General Overview and Implementation	1183
23.1.	Chapter overview	1183
23.2.	Objectives of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1183

23.2.1.	General objectives	1183
23.2.2.	Specific objectives	1186
23.3.	Structure and overview	1188
23.3.1.	Basic outline	1188
23.3.2.	Structure	1189
23.4.	Implementation and application	1190
23.4.1.	Transposition into Member States' domestic legislations	1190
23.4.2.	Entry into force of the Dispute Resolution Directive and application to cases	1191
23.5.	Concluding remarks and evaluation	1192
Chapter 24:	Legal Status and Governance	1195
24.1.	Chapter overview	1195
24.2.	Legal status of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1196
24.3.	Governance	1198
24.3.1.	Implementing, administering and applying the dispute resolution procedures	1198
24.3.2.	Role of the Commission in implementing the dispute resolution procedures	1199
24.3.3.	Role of the Commission in providing administrative support	1201
24.3.4.	Monitoring implementation	1202
24.3.5.	Evaluation of implementation and functioning	1203
24.4.	Evaluation	1204
Chapter 25:	Formal Scope of Application	1211
25.1.	Chapter overview	1211
25.2.	Applicable language	1211
25.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1211
25.2.2.	Analysis	1211
25.3.	Definition of terms	1213

Table of Contents

25.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1213
25.3.2.	Analysis	1214
25.4.	Taxes covered	1216
25.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1216
25.4.2.	Analysis	1217
25.5.	Persons covered	1218
25.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1218
25.5.2.	Analysis	1219
25.5.2.1.	General considerations	1219
25.5.2.2.	Original proposal: Taxpayers subject to taxes on income from business	1219
25.5.2.2.1.	General considerations	1219
25.5.2.2.2.	Element (a): Definition of “taxpayer” and of being subject to taxes in general	1220
25.5.2.2.3.	Element (b): The application to hybrid entities	1221
25.5.2.2.4.	Element (c): Status of a permanent establishment	1222
25.5.2.3.	Adopted Directive: Link to double tax conventions between Member States	1223
25.5.2.3.1.	General considerations	1223
25.5.2.3.2.	Element (a): Concept of residency under the adopted Directive	1224
25.5.2.3.3.	Element (b): The application to hybrid entities	1227
25.5.2.3.4.	Element (c): Status of a permanent establishment	1228
25.5.2.4.	Final considerations: Comparison with the EU Arbitration Convention	1229
25.6.	Territorial scope	1230
25.6.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1230
25.6.2.	Analysis	1231
25.7.	Evaluation	1231
Chapter 26:	Material Scope of Application	1235
26.1.	Chapter overview	1235
26.2.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1235
26.2.1.	Text of the initial directive proposal	1235
26.2.2.	Adopted text	1236

26.3.	Analysis	1237
26.3.1.	General considerations	1237
26.3.2.	Changing the material scope of application	1237
26.3.2.1.	Initial proposal: Only income from business	1237
26.3.2.2.	Legal deficit of the directive proposal	1241
26.3.2.3.	Amendment to all income-tax-related disputes	1243
26.3.3.	Definition of the term “double taxation”	1244
26.3.4.	Conditions to be fulfilled for cases falling within the scope of application	1247
26.4.	Evaluation	1250
Chapter 27:	Phase I: Application	1255
27.1.	Chapter overview	1255
27.2.	Three-year deadline for submission of a complaint	1256
27.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1256
27.2.2.	Analysis	1257
27.2.2.1.	Commencement date of the 3-year deadline	1257
27.2.2.2.	Miscellaneous discussions on several aspects of the 3-year deadline	1258
27.3.	Submission of a complaint	1259
27.3.1.	Persons eligible to submit a complaint	1259
27.3.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1259
27.3.1.2.	Analysis	1259
27.3.2.	Grounds for submission of a complaint	1261
27.3.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1261
27.3.2.2.	Analysis	1262
27.3.3.	Content, format and language of the complaint	1265
27.3.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1265
27.3.3.2.	Analysis	1267
27.3.3.2.1.	Introduction of a list of information to be submitted with a complaint	1267
27.3.3.2.2.	Content of the list of information to be submitted with a complaint	1268
27.3.3.2.3.	Incomplete complaints	1271
27.3.3.2.4.	Notification of other Member States involved of a complaint submitted	1272
27.3.3.2.5.	Format of the complaint	1272
27.3.3.2.6.	Language of the complaint	1272

Table of Contents

27.3.4.	Addressee of the complaint	1274
27.3.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1274
27.3.4.2.	Analysis	1274
27.4.	Receipt of the complaint and initial follow-up	1277
27.4.1.	Notification of receipt of a complaint	1277
27.4.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1277
27.4.1.2.	Analysis	1277
27.4.2.	Requesting additional information	1278
27.4.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1278
27.4.2.2.	Analysis	1279
27.4.2.2.1.	Possibility to request additional information and conditions and the term for such request	1279
27.4.2.2.2.	Term to provide requested additional information	1281
27.5.	Special procedures for individuals and small and medium-sized enterprises	1282
27.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1282
27.5.2.	Analysis	1282
27.6.	Withdrawal of a complaint	1284
27.6.1.	Provisions of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1284
27.6.2.	Analysis	1285
<i>Tin.</i>	Evaluation	1285
Chapter 28:	Phase II: Unilateral Review	1289
28.1.	Chapter overview	1289
28.2.	Timeline for unilateral review phase	1289
28.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1289
28.2.2.	Analysis	1290
28.3.	Review of the complaint	1292
28.3.1.	Possible outcomes in the review of the complaint	1292
28.3.2.	Acceptance or rejection of a complaint	1292
28.3.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1292
28.3.2.2.	Analysis	1293
28.3.3.	Possibility of a satisfactory solution	1294
28.3.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1294
28.3.3.2.	Analysis	1295

28.4.	Proceedings during the unilateral review phase	1296
28.4.1.	General considerations	1296
28.4.2.	Decision on the acceptance or rejection of the complaint	1297
28.4.2.1.	Possible decisions	1297
28.4.2.2.	Situation (1): All competent authorities concerned accept the complaint	1297
28.4.2.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1297
28.4.2.2.2.	Analysis	1298
28.4.2.3.	Situation (2): All competent authorities concerned reject the complaint	1298
28.4.2.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1298
28.4.2.3.2.	Analysis	1299
28.4.2.4.	Situation (3): Only one of the competent authorities accepts the complaint	1303
28.4.2.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1303
28.4.2.4.2.	Analysis	1305
28.4.2.4.2.1.	General considerations	1305
28.4.2.4.2.2.	(1) Requirements for requesting to have a decision to reject a complaint reviewed by an advisory commission	1306
28.4.2.4.2.3.	(2) Term for submission of a request	1307
28.4.2.4.2.4.	(3) Restrictions in establishing the advisory commission	1308
28.4.2.4.2.5.	(4) Term for establishing an advisory commission	1310
28.4.2.4.2.6.	(5) Task of the advisory commission	1310
28.4.2.4.2.7.	(6) Term for taking a decision	1310
28.4.2.4.2.8.	(7) Content and effect of the decision	1311
28.4.2.4.2.9.	(8) Applicable sanction mechanism	1313
28.4.2.5.	Situation (4): No decision is taken	1314
28.4.2.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1314
28.4.2.5.2.	Analysis	1315
28.4.2.6.	Final considerations	1316
28.4.3.	Deciding on a unilateral resolution of the dispute	1319
28.4.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1319
28.4.3.2.	Analysis	1319
28.4.4.	Informing affected persons of the outcome	1320
28.4.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1320
28.4.4.2.	Analysis	1322
28.4.4.2.1.	Acceptance/rejection of the complaint	1322

Table of Contents

28.4.4.2.2.	Decision by an advisory commission that the complaint should be accepted	1324
28.4.4.2.3.	Decision to unilaterally resolve the question of dispute	1324
28.4.4.2.4.	Final considerations	1325
28.5.	Restrictions on the application of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1326
28.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1326
28.5.2.	Analysis	1327
28.5.2.1.	Cases of tax fraud, willful default and gross negligence: Article 16(6)	1327
28.5.2.1.1.	General considerations	1327
28.5.2.1.2.	Scope of application and requirements for invocation by Member States	1329
28.5.2.1.2.1.	Article 16(6), first sentence	1329
28.5.2.1.2.2.	Article 16(6), second sentence	1334
28.5.2.1.3.	Similarities with article 8 of the EU Arbitration Convention	1335
28.5.2.1.4.	Final considerations	1338
28.5.2.2.	No cases of double taxation: Article 16(7)	1339
28.6.	Suspension of tax collection during the period in which the Dispute Resolution Directive is applied	1341
28.6.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1341
28.6.2.	Analysis	1341
28.7.	Ending of proceedings under the Dispute Resolution Directive	1343
28.7.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1343
28.7.2.	Analysis	1343
28.8.	Evaluation	1344
Chapter 29:	Phase III: Mutual Agreement Procedure	1349
29.1.	Chapter overview	1349
29.2.	The 2-year deadline of the mutual agreement procedure	1350
29.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1350

29.2.2.	Analysis	1351
29.2.2.1.	General considerations of the 2-year deadline	1351
29.2.2.2.	Commencement date of the 2-year deadline in general	1352
29.2.2.3.	Commencement date of the 2-year deadline following a decision by the advisory commission	1354
29.2.2.4.	Commencement date of the 2-year deadline following domestic court procedures	1355
29.2.2.5.	Commencement date of the 2-year deadline when no decision on the acceptance of the complaint is taken	1356
29.2.2.6.	Final considerations	1356
29.3.	Extension of the 2-year deadline	1357
29.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1357
29.3.2.	Analysis	1358
29.3.2.1.	Possibility of an extension of the 2-year deadline and term of extension	1358
29.3.2.2.	Conditions for allowing for an extension of the 2-year deadline	1359
29.3.2.3.	Final considerations	1361
29.4.	Proceedings during the mutual agreement procedure	1361
29.4.1.	General considerations	1361
29.4.2.	Common working language	1362
29.4.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1362
29.4.2.2.	Analysis	1363
29.4.3.	Final considerations	1364
29.5.	Confidentiality of information	1365
29.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1365
29.5.2.	Analysis	1366
29.6.	Costs of the mutual agreement procedure	1367
29.6.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1367
29.6.2.	Analysis	1367
29.7.	Outcome of the procedure	1368
29.7.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1368
29.7.2.	Analysis	1370

Table of Contents

29.7.2.1.	General considerations	1370
29.7.2.2.	A mutual agreement is reached	1370
29.7.2.2.1.	Notification of the agreement to the affected person	1370
29.7.2.3.	No mutual agreement is reached	1371
29.8.	Implementation of mutual agreements	1373
29.8.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1373
29.8.2.	Analysis	1374
29.8.2.1.	Right of acceptance for the affected person	1374
29.8.2.2.	Process, requirements and time limits for implementation	1375
29.9.	Evaluation	1377
Chapter 30:	Phase IV: Arbitration Procedure	1381
30.1.	Chapter overview	1381
30.2.	Possible forms of the arbitration procedure	1382
30.2.1.	General considerations	1382
30.2.2.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1383
30.2.3.	Analysis	1385
30.2.3.1.	Decision to establish an alternative dispute resolution commission	1385
30.2.3.2.	Establishment on an ad hoc or permanent basis	1385
30.2.3.3.	Techniques and types of dispute resolution processes	1392
30.2.3.3.1.	Dispute resolution techniques	1392
30.2.3.3.2.	Types of dispute resolution processes	1394
30.2.3.4.	Composition of the alternative dispute resolution commission	1395
30.2.3.5.	Procedural rules to be applied by the alternative dispute resolution commission	1396
30.2.3.6.	Final considerations	1397
30.3.	Deadline for the arbitration procedure	1399
30.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1399
30.3.2.	Analysis	1400
30.3.2.1.	Deadline for rendering an opinion and commencement date	1400
30.3.2.2.	Extension of the deadline	1401

Table of Contents

30.4.	Establishment of the advisory commission	1402
30.4.1.	Rules for establishing the advisory commission	1402
30.4.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1402
30.4.1.2.	Analysis	1404
30.4.1.2.1.	Obligation to establish the advisory commission	1404
30.4.2.2.2.	Deadline for submission of a request and establishment of the advisory commission	1405
30.4.2.	Enforcement mechanism when the advisory commission is not established in due time	1407
30.4.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1407
30.4.2.2.	Analysis	1409
30.4.2.2.1.	System chosen: Involvement of national courts	1409
30.4.2.2.1.1.	Reference to national courts or another designated body	1409
30.4.2.2.1.2.	Grounds for initiating the enforcement mechanism	1410
30.4.2.2.1.3.	Term for submission of a request	1411
30.4.2.2.1.4.	Process, timing and outcome of the procedure	1412
30.4.2.2.2.	Comparison with the EU Arbitration Convention	1413
30.5.	Composition of the advisory commission	1415
30.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1415
30.5.2.	Analysis	1416
30.5.2.1.	Number of members of an advisory commission	1416
30.5.2.2.	Inclusion of Member States' representatives and number of representatives	1417
30.5.2.3.	Inclusion of independent persons and number of representatives	1418
30.5.2.4.	Composition of an advisory commission in practice	1419
30.5.2.5.	Allowing a different composition on a bilateral basis	1420
30.6.	Secretarial assistance	1420
30.6.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1420
30.6.2.	Analysis	1421
30.7.	Selection and appointment of members	1422
30.7.1.	Member States' representatives	1422
30.7.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1422
30.7.1.2.	Analysis	1422

Table of Contents

30.7.2.	Independent persons	1423
30.7.2.1.	Procedure for appointing independent persons	1423
30.7.2.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1423
30.7.2.1.2.	Analysis	1425
30.7.2.1.2.1.	Appointment from the list of independent persons and on the basis of agreed rules for appointment between Member States	1425
30.7.2.1.2.2.	No agreement on rules for appointment: Drawing lots	1426
30.7.2.1.2.3.	Objections to appointments	1427
30.7.2.2.	List of independent persons	1429
30.7.2.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1429
30.7.2.2.2.	Analysis	1431
30.7.2.2.2.1.	Number of nominees and actual submission of the nominated persons	1431
30.7.2.2.2.2.	Informing the Commission of nominated persons and the submission of curricula vitae	1432
30.7.2.2.2.3.	Permanency of the list and alterations thereto	1433
30.7.2.2.2.4.	Publication of the list	1434
30.7.2.3.	Criteria for independent persons	1435
30.7.2.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1435
30.7.2.3.2.	Analysis	1436
30.7.2.3.2.1.	Criteria to be met by nominees	1436
30.7.2.3.2.2.	Disclosure of information	1440
30.7.2.3.2.3.	Impact of the actual number of nominees	1441
30.7.2.4.	Final considerations	1442
30.7.3.	Chairman	1445
30.7.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1445
30.7.3.2.	Analysis	1446
30.7.3.2.1.	Process of appointment	1446
30.7.3.2.2.	Criteria for a chairperson	1448
30.7.4.	Substitutes	1448
30.7.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1448
30.7.4.2.	Analysis	1449
30.8.	Proceedings during the arbitration procedure	1450
30.8.1.	General considerations	1450
30.8.2.	Rules of functioning for the advisory commission	1450
30.8.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1450
30.8.2.2.	Analysis	1453

30.8.2.2.1.	Introduction of the obligation to establish rules of functioning	1453
30.8.2.2.2.	Notification to affected persons	1454
30.8.2.2.3.	Content of the rules of functioning	1455
30.8.2.2.3.1.	Bilaterally established rules of functioning	1455
30.8.2.2.3.2.	Standard rules of functioning	1457
30.8.2.2.3.3.	Rules of functioning during the unilateral review phase	1457
30.8.2.2.4.	Default mechanism on untimely establishment of the rules of functioning	1458
30.8.2.2.5.	Final considerations	1460
30.8.3.	Place of the advisory commission's meetings	1461
30.8.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1461
30.8.3.2.	Analysis	1461
30.8.4.	Planning of the advisory commission's meetings	1462
30.8.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1462
30.8.4.2.	Analysis	1462
30.8.5.	Attendance of the meetings	1463
30.8.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1463
30.8.5.2.	Analysis	1463
30.8.6.	Common working language	1464
30.8.6.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1464
30.8.6.2.	Analysis	1464
30.8.6.2.1.	Using a common working language during the arbitration procedure	1464
30.8.7.	Providing information to the advisory commission	1466
30.8.7.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1466
30.8.7.2.	Analysis	1466
30.8.7.2.1.	Submission of information by Member States	1466
30.8.7.2.2.	Submission of information by affected persons	1467
30.8.8.	Requesting additional information by the advisory commission	1468
30.8.8.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1468
30.8.8.2.	Analysis	1469
30.8.9.	Appearance before the advisory commission	1472
30.8.9.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1472
30.8.9.2.	Analysis	1472
30.8.9.2.1.	Appearance by affected persons	1472
30.8.9.2.2.	Appearance by Member States	1473
30.8.9.2.3.	Other elements in appearing before the commission	1474

Table of Contents

30.9.	Confidentiality of information	1475
30.9.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1475
30.9.2.	Analysis	1476
30.9.2.1.	Necessity of a secrecy obligation	1476
30.9.2.2.	Content of the secrecy obligation and parties subject to this obligation	1476
30.9.2.2.1.	Obligation put on members of the advisory commission	1476
30.9.2.2.2.	Obligation put on affected persons and their representatives	1477
30.9.2.3.	Penalties for breaching the secrecy obligation	1478
30.10.	Costs	1480
30.10.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1480
30.10.2.	Analysis	1481
30.10.2.1.	Cost basis of the arbitration procedure	1481
30.10.2.2.	Fees of independent persons and the chairman	1482
30.10.2.3.	Reimbursement of expenses of independent persons	1483
30.10.2.4.	Payment of costs of the arbitration procedure	1484
30.10.2.5.	Sharing of costs and agreement on different rules	1485
30.10.2.6.	Bearing of costs by affected persons	1486
30.10.2.7.	Final considerations	1487
30.11.	Outcome of the procedure	1488
30.11.1.	Adoption of the opinion by the advisory commission	1488
30.11.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1488
30.11.1.2.	Analysis	1488
30.11.2.	Content of the opinion	1489
30.11.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1489
30.11.2.2.	Analysis	1490
30.11.2.2.1.	Basis of the opinion	1490
30.11.2.2.2.	Content of the opinion	1492
30.11.3.	Communication of the opinion	1492
30.11.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1492
30.11.3.2.	Analysis	1493
30.12.	Evaluation	1493

Chapter 31:	Phase V: Final Decision and Implementation	1501
31.1.	Chapter overview	1501
31.2.	Necessity of the final decision phase	1502
31.3.	Six-month deadline for taking a final decision	1503
31.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1503
31.3.2.	Analysis	1504
31.4.	Content of the final decision	1505
31.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1505
31.4.2.	Analysis	1505
31.4.2.1.	General considerations	1505
31.4.2.2.	Agreement with the opinion of the advisory commission	1506
31.4.2.3.	Disagreement with the opinion of the advisory commission	1506
31.4.2.3.1.	A final decision is taken	1506
31.4.2.3.2.	No final decision is taken	1507
31.5.	Communication of the final decision	1508
31.5.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1508
31.5.2.	Analysis	1508
31.6.	Implementation of the final decision	1511
31.6.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1511
31.6.2.	Analysis	1512
31.6.2.1.	Binding effect of the final decision and right of acceptance for affected persons	1512
31.6.2.2.	No final decision taken: Binding opinion of the advisory commission	1513
31.6.2.3.	Process, requirements and time limits for implementation	1514
31.6.2.3.1.	Process for implementation	1514
31.6.2.3.2.	Requirements for implementation	1515
31.6.2.3.3.	Time limits for implementation	1515
31.6.2.4.	Post-award controls	1516
31.6.2.5.	No implementation of a final decision in special circumstances	1517
31.6.2.6.	Final considerations	1519

Table of Contents

31.7.	Publication of the final decision	1520
31.7.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1520
31.7.2.	Analysis	1521
31.7.2.1.	Necessity of allowing publication	1521
31.7.2.2.	Content of the publication of the final decision	1523
31.7.2.3.	Place of publication	1524
31.7.2.4.	Taxpayers' consent to publication	1525
31.8.	Alteration of decisions and a remaining question in dispute	1526
31.8.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1526
31.8.2.	Analysis	1526
31.8.2.1.	Alteration of decisions and reapplying the Directive's procedures	1526
31.8.2.2.	Remaining double taxation	1527
31.9.	Effect on future years and precedential effects	1528
31.9.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1528
31.9.2.	Analysis	1529
31.9.2.1.	Effect on future years	1529
31.9.2.2.	Precedential effects	1531
31.10.	Interest charges and refunds	1531
31.10.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1531
31.10.2.	Analysis	1532
31.11.	Evaluation	1533
Chapter 32:	Miscellaneous	1537
32.1.	Chapter overview	1537
32.2.	Affected persons' rights and involvement	1537
32.2.1.	General considerations	1537
32.2.2.	Affected persons' rights and involvement during the application and unilateral review phase	1538
32.2.2.1.	Submission of complaints	1538
32.2.2.2.	Review of the complaint	1539
32.2.2.3.	Notification of affected persons	1540
32.2.2.4.	Withdrawal and termination of proceedings	1540
32.2.3.	Affected persons' rights and involvement during the mutual agreement procedure	1541

32.2.4.	Affected persons' rights and involvement during the arbitration procedure	1543
32.2.4.1.	Rights granted to affected persons during the arbitration procedure	1543
32.2.4.2.	Establishment of the advisory commission	1544
32.2.4.3.	Proceedings within the advisory commission	1544
32.2.4.4.	Outcome of the arbitration procedure	1546
32.2.5.	Affected persons' rights and involvement during the final decision and implementation phase	1546
32.2.6.	Final considerations	1548
32.3.	Interaction with other dispute settlement procedures	1550
32.3.1.	Interaction with dispute resolution procedures under double tax conventions between Member States	1550
32.3.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1550
32.3.1.2.	Analysis	1551
32.3.1.2.1.	Basic rule: The Dispute Resolution Directive overrules conventions/agreements between Member States	1551
32.3.1.2.2.	Application of the Dispute Resolution Directive to earlier resolved questions in dispute or pending procedures	1554
32.3.2.	Interaction with domestic available remedies	1555
32.3.2.1.	Interaction when submitting a complaint	1555
32.3.2.1.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1555
32.3.2.1.2.	Analysis	1556
32.3.2.2.	Interaction when available domestic remedies are pending	1556
32.3.2.2.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1556
32.3.2.2.2.	Analysis	1557
32.3.2.3.	Interaction when available domestic remedies have been finalized	1559
32.3.2.3.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1559
32.3.2.3.2.	Analysis	1560
32.3.2.4.	Interaction when the procedures of the Dispute Resolution Directive have been finalized	1562
32.3.2.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1562
32.3.2.4.2.	Analysis	1563
32.3.2.5.	Final considerations	1564

Table of Contents

32.4.	Triangular cases/multilateral disputes	1566
32.4.1.	Provision of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1566
32.4.2.	Analysis	1566
32.4.2.1.	Inclusion of triangular cases/multilateral disputes in the scope of application of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1566
32.4.2.2.	Procedural application	1569
32.5.	Evaluation	1570
Chapter 33:	Conclusions and Evaluation	1573
33.1.	Chapter overview	1573
33.2.	Attaining of the objectives of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1574
33.2.1.	Basic objective of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1574
33.2.2.	Specific objectives of the Dispute Resolution Directive	1576
33.2.2.1.	Objective (1): Enlarging the scope of application of the EU Arbitration Convention	1576
33.2.2.2.	Objective (2): Ensuring legal certainty for taxpayers	1577
33.2.2.3.	Objective (3): Ensuring effectiveness/efficiency	1579
33.2.2.4.	Objective (4): Ensuring transparency	1582
33.2.2.5.	Objective (5): Improving governance	1584
33.2.3.	Final considerations	1587
33.3.	The Dispute Resolution Directive versus the EU Arbitration Convention: Improvements realized?	1589
33.3.1.	General considerations	1589
33.3.2.	Scope of application	1590
33.3.3.	Procedural functioning	1591
33.3.3.1.	Phase I: Application	1591
33.3.3.2.	Phase II: Unilateral review procedure	1592
33.3.3.3.	Phase III: Mutual agreement procedure	1594
33.3.3.4.	Phase IV: Arbitration procedure	1595
33.3.3.5.	Phase V: Final decision and implementation	1597
33.3.3.6.	Miscellaneous	1598
33.3.4.	Answer to the question posed	1599

Annex I — Implementation of the Code of Conduct by Member States as per 2008	1603
Annex II - Ratification procedures	1604
Annex III - Arbitration clauses in double tax conventions between Member States	1607
Annex IV - Taxes to which the EU Arbitration Convention applies	1617
Annex V - Member States' reservations to paragraph 4 of the Code of Conduct	1620
Annex VI — Unilateral definitions by each Member State on the term “serious penalty” in article 8 of the EU Arbitration Convention	1623
References	1631