History in Management and Organization Studies

From Margin to Mainstream

Behliil Usdiken and Matthias Kipping



Contents

	List of Illustrations Acknowledgments	xi xii
1	Objective: Finding History in Management Research Introduction 1	1
	Let's Look to the Past: History Is Back, or Was It Ever Gone? 1	
	Like Hot Cakes: The Recent Popularity of History 1	
	Who Cares? Little Regard for Histories of Managers and Management 3	
	Crazy About History? Management and Organization Studies S	
	Separated in the Past, Rejoined in the Present? 9	
	Who Kicked History Out: "Science" or Sociology? 9	
	Can the Twain Ever Meet Again? 11	
	Let's Have Another Look: History Is Already There,	
	Kind of 15	
	As Stated Before: More Than Meets the Eye 15	
	Haven't We Seen This Movie Already? Opening the Package 17	
	And Displaying Its Contents 19	

PARTI

2	Origins: History and Management Becoming "Sciences"	29
	Introduction 29	
	Always There: The Ever-Present Hand of History 30	
	Early and Everywhere: Origins of Written Histories	
	Around the Globe 31	

Scientizing History and Historicizing Everything: The Rankean "Revolution" 34 Beyond a Single Truth: Multiplying the "Houses of History" 38 A Bumpy Road: Developing Business and Then Management Into a "Science" 40 Late, Diverse and Difficult: The Origins of "Business" Schools 41 Thirsting for Legitimacy: Early Claims to "Science" 42 Getting There—And Globally: Turning Management Into a "True" Science 46 Conclusion SO

3 Aspirations: Bringing History and Management Studies (Back) Together Introduction 54 Anybody Out There? Contacts Between Historical and Business and Management Research 55 Roads to Nowhere: Missed Opportunities 55 Lonely Hearts: Business Historians and "New Look " Management Studies 58 Unrequited Love: Management Indifference From the 1960s Through the 1980s 59 Feeling Nostalgic: Growing Calls for "More History" Since the 1990s 62 Whole Lotta Love: Increasing Diversity as History Attracts Greater Attention 65 Turning Where? Business History, History or Postmodern History 66 Turning How? Searching for Some Form of "Synthesis" 68 Above and Beyond: Extending the Historic Turn in Organization Studies to Other Domains 72 Conclusion 73

54

 Evidence: Identifying History in Top Management Journals 79 Introduction 79 Needle in a Haystack? History in the Management and Organization Studies Literature 80 Previous Surveys and Their Limitations 80 Objectives and Scope of the Present Survey 81 And Then There Were Two . . . Types of Studies With a Historical Dimension 84
Two Souls: History and Theory in Management and Organizational Research 87
Backing It All Up: History as Evidence and a Source of Data 87
In the Driving Seat: History as Part of Theoretical Models 92
Putting It All Together: A Pramework for Combining History and Theory 93

PART II

5	Beginnings: Early Writings on Management History	103
	Introduction 103	
	When It All Began: Early Histories of Management 104	
	Ideas Matter: The Transition Toward Histories	
	of Management Thought 107	
	Setting the Stage: Initial Exemplary Works 107	
	Making It Count: Histories for Practitioners	
	by Consultants and Managers 110	
	Staying in the Shadows: Limited Contributions	
	by Academics 112	
	Enter "Theory", Kind of: Going Beyond Management	
	History 116	
	Conclusion 119	
6	Orthodoxy: Establishing and Defending Classic	
	Management History	124
	Introduction 124	
	Claiming a Place in the Mainstream 125	
	Bringing It All Together: Publication of the First	
	Textbooks 125	124
	Progressing a Bit: Further, Albeit Limited	
	Expansion of the Literature 128	
	Drifting to the Margins: The Effect of "Scientization"	
	on Management History 132	
	Closing Doors: Reduced Publication Opportunities	
	in Mainstream Management Journals 132	
	Doubling Down: The "Classic" View Persists 134	

viii Contents

Still Focusing on Individuals: From "Pioneers" to "Innovators" and Back 137 Conclusion 139

7	Alternatives: Emergence and Expansion of Critical Views	145
	Introduction 145	
	'Twas All Rather Different: Revisionist Histories 146	
	False Starts: Labor Process Theory and Critical	
	Management Studies 146	
	Talk Matters: Theorizing the Evolution of	
	Management Discourses and Models 147	
	And So Does Context: "Politicizing" the History	
	of Management Thought in the US 150	
	'Twas the Total Opposite, Actually:	
	Counter-Histories 154	
	Cue in Foucault: Archaeologies and Genealogies 154	
	Cue in Latour: ANTi-History 158	
	Other Worlds: Expanding the Critical Perspective	
	Geographically 159	
	Moving Beyond the US: Comparative and Diffusion	
	Studies 159	
	Better to Be Different? Institutionalizing a Critical	
	and International Perspective 162	
	Conclusion 164	

PART III

History to Theory: Institutional Theories and	
Process Studies	171
Introduction 171	
Which Way? Two Institutionalisms on Different Paths	
From History to Theory 172	
How It All Started: Institutionalism From the TVA	
to a Theory of "Organizational Character" 173	
Bring in the New: Developing Neo-Institutional	
Theory 175	
Here Come the Dynamos: Institutional	
Entrepreneurship and Institutional Work 179	
Holding It All Together—In a Dynamic Way:	
Institutional Logics 182	
	Process Studies Introduction 171 Which Way? Two Institutionalisms on Different Paths From History to Theory 172 How It All Started: Institutionalism From the TVA to a Theory of "Organizational Character" 173 Bring in the New: Developing Neo-Institutional Theory 175 Here Come the Dynamos: Institutional Entrepreneurship and Institutional Work 179 Holding It All Together—In a Dynamic Way:

	What's Going On? Unrealized Potential in Process	
	Studies of Organizations and Strategy 184	
	Looking Inside: Process Organization Studies 184	
	Inside Looking Out: Strategy-Making 187	
	Conclusion 190	
9	History to Theory: Organizational Ecology, Economics,	
	Resource Dependence	196
	Introduction 196	
	Who Wants to Live Forever: Organizational	
	Ecology 197	
	The More, the Merrier—Up to a Point: Density	
	Dependence 198	
	Scale or Scope? Resource Partitioning and Community	
	Ecology 201	
	That Rare Beast: Qualitative Studies 202	
	And the Twain Did Meet: Organizational Ecology	
	and Institutions 203	
	Where You Belong: Categories and Categorization 207	
	Not Much There: History and Organizational	
	Economics 210	
	Nor Here: Resource Dependence 213	
	Conclusion 215	
10	History in Theory: Imprinting and Path Dependence	220
	Introduction 220	
	History Leaving a Lasting Presence: Imprinting 221	
	Its Own Past: Origins and Early Studies 221	
	People Matter: Founder Characteristics	
	and Organizations 223	

Context Matters: Initial Institutional and Economic Environments of Organizations 226 The Past Really Matters: History, Institutional Logics

and Organizations 229

Local Matters: Community-Level Imprinting and Institutional Legacies 231

Staying on Track: Path Dependence 234 How It All Started: Origins and Definitions 234 How It Works in Practice: Organizational Path Dependence 236

x Contents

Parallels and Crossings: Path Dependence in Institutional Persistence and Change 238 Conclusion 240

1	History in Theory: Ecology, Strategy, Co-evolution	246
	Introduction 246	
	Origins Matter Here, Too: Organizational Ecology 247	
	What Starts Well : Founding Conditions and the	
	Density Delay Model 247	
	When Things Get Sticky: Structural Inertia	
	and History Dependence 250	
	The Ever-Present Past: Population History	
	and History of Competition 253	
	It Stays in the Family: Parents and Progenies 256	
	Survival Strategies: Resources, Routines and Dynamic	
	Capabilities 257	
	It Pays to Be Early: First Movers 258	
	Managing the Past: History as a "Resource" 259	
	Change Is Back: From Routines to Dynamic	
	Capabilities 261	
	A Way Out? Combining Imprinting and History	
	Dependence in Co-evolution 264	
	Conclusion 267	
12	Not a Conclusion: Multiple Ways Forward	272
	Introduction 272	
	Main Findings in Brief_Very Brief 273	

Main Findings in Brief—Very Brief 273
No Hope in History—Well, Maybe a Little 275
History in the Present: Uses of the Past 281
Toward "Historical Cognizance": Contextualized
Theorizing 287
Cognizant vs. Universalist: Big Business in the
US 289
From Comparisons to Cognizance: "Management"
Goes Global 290
Cognizance in the Mainstream: Institutional Logics
and Beyond 292
This Is the End . . . Not Really, Since There Is More
to Come 294