

International Tax Policy and Double Tax Treaties

An Introduction to Principles and Application

Second Revised Edition

Kevin Holmes

IBFD

Table of Contents

About the Author	v
Preface to the Second Edition	vii
Preface to the First Edition	viii
Chapter 1: International Tax Policy	1
1.1. Introduction	1
1.2. International tax	2
1.3. Objectives of international tax rules	4
1.3.1. National wealth maximization	4
1.3.2. Tax equity	4
1.3.3. Economic efficiency	5
1.3.4. Administrative efficiency	5
1.3.5. International compatibility	6
1.3.6. Conflicts between objectives	6
1.4. Taxation of inward investment	7
1.4.1. Capital import neutrality	7
1.4.2. Other policy considerations	8
1.4.3. Non-resident withholding taxes	10
1.5. Taxation of outward investment	12
1.5.1. Capital export neutrality	12
1.5.2. Other policy considerations	14
1.5.2.1. Controlled foreign companies	15
1.5.2.2. Active/passive income distinction	16
1.5.2.3. Portfolio investments	16
1.6. Conclusion	17
Review questions	18

Table of Contents

Chapter 2:	Double Taxation	19
2.1.	Introduction	19
2.2.	Source and residence tax jurisdictions	19
2.2.1.	Source jurisdiction	19
2.2.2.	Residence jurisdiction	21
2.3.	Juridical double taxation	22
2.3.1.	Source-source conflict	23
2.3.2.	Residence-residence conflict	23
2.3.3.	Source-residence conflict	23
2.4.	Methods of relief from juridical double taxation	24
2.4.1.	Exemption method	25
2.4.1.1.	Full exemption	25
2.4.1.2.	Exemption with progression	26
2.4.2.	Foreign tax credit method	28
2.4.2.1.	Full credit	28
2.4.2.2.	Ordinary credit	28
2.4.2.3.	“Basket” foreign tax credit limitations	32
2.4.2.4.	Suboptimal outcome	35
2.4.3.	Deduction method	36
2.5.	Economic double taxation	38
2.5.1.	Exemption at the corporate level	41
2.5.2.	Exemption at the shareholder level	42
2.5.3.	Full integration of corporate profits and shareholder income	43
2.5.4.	Full imputation of corporate profits to shareholders	44
2.6.	Effect of non-resident shareholders	45
2.6.1.	Economic double taxation elimination methods breaching capital import neutrality	45
2.6.1.1.	Exemption at the corporate level	45
2.6.1.2.	Full imputation	46
2.6.2.	Economic double taxation elimination methods achieving capital import neutrality	47
2.6.2.1.	Exemption at the shareholder level	47
2.6.2.2.	Full integration	48
2.6.2.3.	Foreign investor tax credit	49

2.7.	Conclusion	55
	Review questions	55
Chapter 3:	Double Tax Treaties	57
3.1.	Introduction	57
3.2.	What is a double tax treaty?	58
3.3.	Purpose of double tax treaties	58
3.3.1.	Avoidance of juridical double taxation	58
3.3.2.	Prevention of fiscal evasion	59
3.4.	History of double tax treaties	60
3.4.1.	League of Nations	60
3.4.2.	OECD model double tax treaty	62
3.4.3.	UN model double tax treaty	64
3.5.	Status of OECD and UN model double tax treaties	65
3.6.	Other model double tax treaties	66
3.6.1.	US model double tax treaty	66
3.6.2.	Other models	67
3.7.	Multilateral double tax treaties	67
3.7.1.	Nordic Convention	68
3.7.2.	CARICOM Agreement	68
3.7.3.	Other multilateral double tax treaties	69
3.8.	Conclusion	70
	Review questions	70
Chapter 4:	Legal Framework of Double Tax Treaties	73
4.1.	Introduction	73
4.2.	International law	74
4.3.	Interpretation of double tax treaties	74

Table of Contents

4.4.	Vienna Convention 1969	76
4.5.	OECD model double tax treaty definitions	77
4.6.	Role and status of the OECD model double tax treaty and OECD commentary	79
4.7.	Practical observations	80
4.8.	Specific country practices	81
4.9.	Static vs ambulatory interpretation	82
4.10.	Domestic legal status of double tax treaties	83
4.10.1.	US savings clause	83
4.11.	Conclusion	84
	Review questions and case studies	85
Chapter 5:	Structure of Double Tax Treaties	89
5.1.	Introduction	89
5.2.	General framework	89
5.3.	Application articles	90
5.3.1.	Scope of application of double tax treaty	90
5.3.2.	Definitions to apply substantive articles	90
5.3.3.	Beginning and end of application of double tax treaty	91
5.4.	Distributive rules	91
5.4.1.	Active income	92
5.4.2.	Passive income	94
5.4.3.	Other income	95
5.4.4.	Elimination of double taxation	95
5.5.	Prevention of tax avoidance and fiscal evasion	95
5.6.	Miscellaneous matters	96
5.7.	Schedular nature of distributive rules	97

5.8.	Ordering rules	98
5.9.	Procedural aspects of double tax treaties	98
5.9.1.	Inception of a double tax treaty	99
5.9.1.1.	Negotiation	99
5.9.1.2.	Initialling	99
5.9.1.3.	Signature	99
5.9.1.4.	Ratification	99
5.9.1.5.	Entry into force	100
5.9.1.6.	Effective date	100
5.9.2.	Termination of a double tax treaty	100
5.10.	Conclusion	101
	Review questions and case studies	102
Chapter 6:	Treaty Relief from Juridical Double Taxation	103
6.1.	Introduction	103
6.2.	Unilateral and double tax treaty relief	103
6.3.	Article 23 of the OECD model double tax treaty	104
6.3.1.	Article 23A - Exemption method	104
6.3.2.	Article 23B - Credit method	107
6.4.	Tax sparing credit relief	109
6.5.	Conclusion	113
	Review questions and case studies	114
Chapter 7:	Personal and Material Scope of Double Tax Treaties	117
7.1.	Introduction	117
7.2.	Personal scope	117
7.3.	Attribution of income	118
7.4.	Territorial scope	120

Table of Contents

7.5.	Taxes covered	123
7.6.	Conclusion	124
	Review questions and case studies	125
Chapter 8:	Residence	127
8.1.	Introduction	127
8.2.	Domestic law residence tests	127
8.2.1.	Individuals	127
8.2.2.	Companies	129
8.3.	Concept of residence in double tax treaties	130
8.3.1.	Dual resident tie breaker rules	133
8.3.1.1.	Individuals	133
8.3.1.2.	Companies	136
8.4.	The global economy	139
8.5.	Conclusion	140
	Review questions and case studies	141
Chapter 9:	Permanent Establishments	149
9.1.	Introduction	149
9.2.	Application of domestic law	151
9.3.	Business profits	151
9.4.	Meaning of “permanent establishment”	152
9.4.1.	Basic-rule permanent establishment	153
9.4.1.1.	<i>Place</i> of business	153
9.4.1.2.	A <i>fixed</i> place	153
9.4.1.3.	Carry on <i>business</i>	154
9.4.2.	Examples of permanent establishments	154
9.4.3.	Construction permanent establishment	156
9.4.4.	Excluded activities	158
9.4.4.1.	Preparatory or auxiliary activities	160

9.4.5.	Dependent agents	161
9.4.6.	Independent agents	163
9.4.7.	Subsidiary companies	165
9.5.	The impact of e-commerce	167
9.5.1.	Three internet scenarios	168
9.5.1.1.	Internet website	168
9.5.1.2.	Use of server	168
9.5.1.2.1.	Hosting arrangement	168
9.5.1.2.2.	Own server	168
9.5.1.3.	Internet service providers	169
9.6.	Taxation of services	169
9.7.	Conclusion	171
	Review questions and case studies	172
Chapter 10:	Business Profits	181
10.1.	Introduction	181
10.2.	Application of domestic law	181
10.3.	Requirement of a permanent establishment in a source state	182
10.4.	Meaning of “profits”	182
10.5.	Meaning of “enterprise”	183
10.6.	Nexus with source state	183
10.7.	Force of attraction	184
10.8.	Allocation of profits to a permanent establishment	185
10.8.1.	Quantification	185
10.8.2.	Agents	186
10.9.	Arm’s length pricing	187
10.10.	Adjustment to profits	190

Table of Contents

10.11.	UN and former OECD models	191
10.11.1.	Deductible expenditure	192
10.11.1.1.	2008 OECD model DTA	192
10.11.1.2.	UN model DTA	194
10.11.2.	Indirect method	195
10.11.3.	Purchasing offices	198
10.11.4.	Consistent methodology	199
10.12.	Subordination of article 7	200
10.13.	International transportation	200
10.14.	Conclusion	206
	Review questions and case studies	208
Chapter 11:	Associated Enterprises	213
11.1.	Introduction	213
11.2.	Transfer pricing	214
11.3.	Associated enterprises	215
11.4.	Compensating adjustments	217
11.5.	Conclusion	220
	Review questions and case studies	220
Chapter 12:	Dividends	225
12.1.	Introduction	225
12.2.	What are “dividends”?	227
12.3.	Domestic law taxation of dividends	228
12.4.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	230
12.4.1.	Model double tax treaty definitions of “dividends”	232
12.4.2.	Participation and portfolio dividends	235
12.4.3.	Interaction with imputation systems	237

12.4.4.	Dividends received by a permanent establishment	237
12.4.5.	Prohibition on extra-territorial taxation of dividends	241
12.4.6.	Branch profits tax	242
12.4.7.	Beneficial ownership	243
12.5.	Conclusion	248
	Review questions and case studies	249
Chapter 13: Interest		253
13.1.	Introduction	253
13.2.	Domestic law taxation of interest	253
13.3.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	254
13.3.1.	Meaning of “interest”	256
13.3.2.	Interest derived through a permanent establishment	257
13.3.3.	Where does interest arise?	258
13.3.4.	Interest payments between associated parties	259
13.4.	Conclusion	261
	Review questions and case studies	262
Chapter 14: Royalties		267
14.1.	Introduction	267
14.2.	Domestic law taxation of royalties	269
14.3.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	270
14.3.1.	Meaning of “royalties”	272
14.3.2.	Alienation of rights	275
14.3.3.	Know-how	275
14.3.4.	Royalties derived through a permanent establishment	277
14.3.5.	Royalty payments between associated parties	279
14.3.6.	Technical service fees and management fees	281
14.3.7.	Definition of “technical service fees”	282
14.3.8.	CARICOM Agreement	284
14.3.9.	Technical services and know-how	284

Table of Contents

14.3.10.	Mixed know-how and technical service contracts	287
14.3.11.	UN model double tax treaty	288
14.4.	Conclusion	289
	Review questions and case studies	290
Chapter 15:	Immovable Property	293
15.1.	Introduction	293
15.2.	Domestic law taxation of income from immovable property	293
15.3.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	295
15.3.1.	Meaning of “immovable property”	296
15.3.2.	Immovable property of an enterprise	298
15.4.	Conclusion	298
	Review questions and case studies	299
Chapter 16:	Capital Gains	303
16.1.	Introduction	303
16.2.	Domestic law taxation of capital gains	303
16.3.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	305
16.3.1.	What is an “alienation” of property?	306
16.3.2.	Alienation of immovable property	306
16.3.3.	Shares in real property owning companies	308
16.3.4.	Alienation of movable property	309
16.3.5.	Sale of shares	311
16.3.6.	Ships and aircraft	311
16.3.7.	Other gains	312
16.3.8.	Summary table	313
16.4.	Conclusion	314
	Review questions and case studies	315

Chapter 17: Personal Services	321
17.1. Introduction	321
17.2. Income from employment	324
17.2.1. Domestic law taxation of income from personal services	324
17.2.2. Taxing rights under double tax treaties	324
17.2.2.1. OECD and UN model double tax treaties	325
17.2.2.2. US model double tax treaty	328
17.2.2.3. CARICOM Agreement	328
17.3. Income from independent personal services	328
17.3.1. UN model double tax treaty	329
17.3.2. CARICOM Agreement	330
17.4. Artistes and sportspeople	330
17.4.1. Who is an artiste or sportsperson?	332
17.4.2. What income is taxable in the source state?	333
17.4.3. Artiste companies	333
17.4.4. CARICOM Agreement	334
17.4.5. US model double tax treaty	335
17.5. Directors' fees	336
17.6. Government service	336
17.7. Academics	338
17.8. Diplomats	339
17.9. Conclusion	339
Review questions and case studies	341
Chapter 18: Other Distributive Articles	349
18.1. Introduction	349
18.2. Pensions	350
18.2.1. Domestic law taxation of pensions	350

Table of Contents

18.2.2.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	351
18.2.2.1.	OECD model double tax treaty	351
18.2.2.2.	UN model double tax treaty	352
18.2.2.3.	US model double tax treaty	352
18.2.2.4.	CARICOM Agreement	355
18.2.3.	What is a pension?	355
18.3.	Students	356
18.4.	Other income	358
18.4.1.	Domestic law taxation of other income	358
18.4.2.	Taxing rights under double tax treaties	358
18.4.3.	Other income received through a permanent establishment	360
18.5.	Taxation of capital	361
18.6.	Conclusion	362
	Review questions and case studies	363
Chapter 19:	International Tax Avoidance	367
19.1.	Introduction	367
19.2.	General observation on tax avoidance	368
19.3.	Approaches to international tax avoidance	369
19.3.1.	Conduit companies	369
19.3.2.	Base companies	371
19.3.3.	Treaty shopping	372
19.3.4.	Hybrid entities	373
19.3.5.	Hybrid financial instruments	374
19.3.6.	Double Irish and Dutch sandwich	375
19.4.	Counteracting measures to international tax avoidance	378
19.4.1.	Judicial doctrines	378
19.4.1.1.	Abuse of law	378
19.4.1.2.	Substance and form	379
19.4.2.	Domestic legislative remedies	381

19.4.2.1.	General anti-avoidance rule (GAAR)	381
19.4.2.2.	Specific anti-avoidance legislation	381
19.4.2.2.1.	Residence definition	381
19.4.2.2.2.	Controlled foreign company (CFC) rules	382
19.4.2.2.3.	Thin capitalization rules	383
19.4.2.2.4.	Transfer pricing rules	385
19.4.3.	Double tax treaty measures to combat international tax avoidance	386
19.4.3.1.	Specific anti-abuse provisions	386
19.4.3.2.	Permanent establishment	387
19.4.3.3.	Arm’s length principle	388
19.4.3.4.	Beneficial ownership	388
19.4.3.5.	Artiste companies	389
19.4.3.6.	US savings clause	389
19.4.3.7.	Limitation on benefits	390
19.4.3.7.1.	“Look-through” approach	390
19.4.3.7.2.	“Channel” approach	391
19.4.3.7.3.	Active trade or business test	391
19.4.3.7.4.	Competent authority approval	392
19.4.3.7.5.	Exclusion approach	392
19.4.3.7.6.	“Subject-to-tax” approach	392
19.4.3.8.	Subordination articles	393
19.4.4.	Harmful tax competition	394
19.4.5.	Base erosion and profit shifting	397
19.5.	Conclusion	399
	Review questions and case studies	400
Chapter 20:	Administration of Double Tax Treaties	409
20.1.	Introduction	409
20.2.	Exchange of information	409
20.3.	Tax recovery	415
20.4.	Mutual agreement procedure	416
20.5.	Non-discrimination	420
20.5.1.	Non-discrimination of permanent establishments	424

Table of Contents

20.5.2.	Branch profits tax	426
20.5.3.	Most favoured nation clause	426
20.6.	Conclusion	427
	Review questions and case studies	429