

# **Tax Sustainability in an EU and International Context**

Editors:  
Cecile Brokelind  
Servaas van Thiel

IBFD

# Table of Contents

## Foreword

## Introduction

*Cecile Brokelind*

- 0.1. Background
- 0.2. Questions
- 0.3. Contributions to scientific debate and outline
  - 0.3.1. Concept of tax sustainability
  - 0.3.2. Taxation as an instrument of sustainability?
  - 0.3.3. Equality as a sustainability goal
  - 0.3.4. BEPS and sustainability goals
  - 0.3.5. Environmental taxation and sustainability
  - 0.3.6. The challenges of tax sustainability
- 0.4. Setting the scene for further research

## Part One

### The Concept of Tax Sustainability

## Chapter 1: Sustainable Taxes for Sustainable Development

*Servaas van Thiel*

- 1.1. Introduction
- 1.2. Globalization and sustainable development
- 1.3. Tax policy to help tackle the economic challenges of globalization
  - 1.3.1. Economic challenges of globalization: Growth, jobs, industry and agriculture
  - 1.3.2. Tax policy in support of growth and innovation
  - 1.3.3. Tax policy in support of agriculture and food security

## Table of Contents

1.4.	Tax policy to help tackle the social challenges of globalization	28
1.4.1.	Social challenges: Poverty, inequality, health and good governance	28
1.4.2.	Tax policy to reduce income and wealth inequality and poverty	30
1.4.3.	Tax policy to reduce gender inequality	32
1.4.4.	Tax policy in support of other social objectives of sustainable development	33
1.5.	Tax policy to help tackle environmental challenges of globalization	35
1.5.1.	Environmental challenges of globalization	35
1.5.2.	Environmental taxes in general	36
1.5.3.	Tax policy to reduce emissions and climate change	38
1.6.	Summary and conclusions	40
<b>Chapter 2:</b>	<b>Reflections on Taxation and the Choice between Development and Sustainability</b>	45
	<i>Frans Vanistendael</i>	
2.1.	Introduction: Starting point and a few basic questions and principles	45
2.2.	Is there an order of priority in the development objectives?	46
2.2.1.	Comparing the Millennium Declaration and the UN 2030 Agenda	46
2.2.2.	Shift in focus to environmental goals and climate change	47
2.2.3.	Sustainability and development	48
2.2.4.	A sense of urgency	49
2.2.5.	Priority for sustainability means priority for climate change	49
2.3.	The role of taxation as an instrument to achieve a sustainable world	50

2.3.1.	The main role of taxation	50
2.3.2.	The use of taxation as an instrument for non-tax purposes: Trade-off between revenue and social engineering?	51
2.3.3.	Examples of tax measures for climate change	52
2.3.4.	The need for sunset clauses	53
2.3.5.	Environmental charges are always paid out of income or wealth	53
2.4.	Specific issues with respect to tax measures targeted to climate change	54
2.4.1.	The questions rising for concrete tax measures	54
2.4.2.	Interaction between non-tax regulation and tax measures	54
2.4.3.	How can tax measures accelerate the shift towards green energy?	55
2.5.	What about distortions of competition?	57
2.5.1.	Distortions in a national market	57
2.5.2.	Distortions in the EU market	58
2.5.3.	Distortions at the international level	59
2.6.	Border tax adjustments	61
2.7.	Ability to pay	63
2.7.1.	Ability to pay in a national framework	63
2.7.2.	Ability to pay in an international framework	65
2.7.3.	Principles for worldwide financing	66
2.8.	International partnerships	67
2.9.	Summary and conclusion	69
<b>Chapter 3:</b>	<b>Tax Policy Areas and Tools for Keeping Sustainable Economy and Society in the EU</b>	<b>71</b>
	<i>Danuse Nerudova, Marian Dobranschi, Marek Litzman and Petr Rozmahel</i>	
3.1.	Introduction	71

## Table of Contents

3.2.	The socio-economic dimensions (pillars), policy areas and tax tools	75
3.2.1.	Tax system sustainability and the economic pillar	75
3.2.2.	Tax system sustainability and the social pillar	78
3.2.3.	Tax system sustainability and the environmental pillar	80
3.2.4.	Tax system sustainability and the institutional pillar	82
3.3.	Conclusion	84
<b>Chapter 4:</b>	<b>A Legal Analysis of the Mutual Interactions between the UN Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs) and Taxation</b> <i>Alice Pirlot</i>	87
4.1.	Introduction	87
4.2.	Sustainable tax systems: The interactions between the SDGs and tax policies	89
4.2.1.	Indirect positive or negative interaction: Tax revenue as a source of funding the SDGs	90
4.2.2.	Direct and allegedly positive interaction	92
4.2.3.	Direct and allegedly negative interaction	95
4.3.	The legal effects of the SDGs on tax systems	99
4.3.1.	The SDGs versus other regulatory objectives	99
4.3.2.	The influence of the SDGs on the adoption of tax laws	102
4.3.3.	The influence of the SDGs on the interpretation of tax laws	105
4.3.3.1.	Domestic tax law	105
4.3.3.2.	International tax law	108
4.4.	Conclusion	110

## Part Two

## Taxation as Instrument of Sustainability

<b>Chapter 5:</b>	<b>Sugar-Sweetened Beverage Taxation as a Means to Achieve the SDGs: An Assessment from an International Investment Law Perspective</b>	115
	<i>Begoña Perez-Bertiabeu</i>	
5.1.	Nutrition in the spotlight of sustainable development goals	115
5.2.	“Indirect expropriation” as a limit on national tax policy space	120
5.3.	Policy options to ensure compatibility of regulatory tax measures with IIAs	126
5.4.	Another point of view: Protectionist and discriminatory tax measures disguised as sugar taxes	131
5.5.	Conclusions	133
<b>Chapter 6:</b>	<b>Building a Better Tax System for Sustainable Development: The Case of the Central and Eastern European Countries</b>	137
	<i>Jasna Bogovac</i>	
6.1.	Introduction	137
6.2.	The specific position of CEECs	139
6.2.1.	Socio-economic and institutional weaknesses	139
6.2.2.	Capacity constraints in the tax area and insufficient international cooperation	142
6.2.3.	The tax policy dilemma vis-a-vis foreign investment	144
6.3.	Improving tax systems of CEECs	147
6.3.1.	Recent research on taxpayer compliance shows a need for stability and predictability	147

## Table of Contents

6.3.2.	Practical recommendations	150
6.4.	Conclusions	156
<p>Part Three Equality as Sustainability Goal</p>		
<b>Chapter 7:</b>	<b>Equality and the Taxable Unit in Income Tax</b> <i>Sigrid Hemels</i>	161
7.1.	Introduction	161
7.2.	Equality between men and women as a fundamental goal of the European Union	163
7.3.	Participation of women in the Dutch labour market	164
7.4.	A policy choice: The taxable unit	165
7.5.	Consequences of the applicable taxable unit for participation in the labour market: Price elasticity	168
7.6.	Who benefits from a family tax system with splitting?	171
7.7.	Conclusion	174
<b>Chapter 8:</b>	<b>Political (Tax) Equity in a Global Context as a Part of Social Sustainability: Some Guidance for Researchers Who Wish to Explore Democratic Implications on Tax and Spending Decisions</b> <i>Yvette Lind</i>	175
8.1.	Introduction to the area of taxation and democracy and its importance to social sustainability	175
8.2.	Research approach and aim of the overall project and this specific chapter	178

8.3.	The construction of a theoretical framework adapted for research dealing with democratic implications and disruptions on tax and spend	180
8.4.	Direct influencing of tax and spending through voting and citizenship	183
8.5.	Indirect influencing of tax and spend through tax payment and tax filing	186
8.6.	Some reflections on social sustainability deficiencies as regards taxpayer influence on tax and spend	188
<b>Chapter 9:</b>	<b>Tax Expenditures and Inequality</b> <i>Agustin Redonda</i>	191
9.1.	Introduction	191
9.2.	Why care about tax expenditures	193
9.2.1.	The tax expenditure concept	193
9.2.2.	Fiscal cost	194
9.2.3.	Transparency	196
9.2.4.	Effectiveness	200
9.2.5.	Efficiency	202
9.3.	Tax expenditures and inequality	203
9.3.1.	General	203
9.3.2.	Direct effect	204
9.3.3.	Indirect effect	207
9.4.	Overall conclusion	210
<b>Chapter 10:</b>	<b>The Protection of Disability Rights in VAT Law from an EU and a Danish Perspective</b> <i>Karina Kim Egholm Elgaard</i>	211
10.1.	Introduction to disability rights, sustainability and VAT	211



## Table of Contents

10.2.	The scope of application of the CRPD and the Charter within the area of VAT	214
10.2.1.	The UN Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD)	214
10.2.1.1.	The scope of application of the CRPD	214
10.2.1.2.	Particular provisions of the CRPD	216
10.2.2.	The EU Charter of Fundamental Rights (Charter)	220
10.2.2.1.	The scope of application of the Charter	220
10.2.2.2.	Particular provisions concerning disability rights in the Charter	221
10.3.	Disability rights in VAT legislation and VAT case law of the EU and Denmark	223
10.3.1.	Disability rights in EU VAT legislation	223
10.3.2.	Disability rights in EU VAT case law	225
10.3.3.	Disability rights in Danish VAT regulation	228
10.3.4.	Disability rights in Danish VAT case law	229
10.4.	Conclusion	231

### Part Four BEPS and Sustainability Goals

<b>Chapter 11:</b>	<b>Global Sustainable Tax Governance in the OECD/G20 Transparency and BEPS Initiatives</b>	235
	<i>Wouter Lips and Irma Johanna Mosquera Valderrama</i>	
11.1.	Introduction	235
11.2.	The OECD/G20 transparency and BEPS agenda and sustainable domestic resource mobilization	239
11.2.1.	Domestic resource mobilization	239
11.2.1.1.	General	239
11.2.1.2.	Revenue sharing between developed and developing countries	241
11.2.1.3.	Tax incentives and tax competition	242

11.2.2.	Tailored partnerships for domestic resource mobilization	245
11.2.2.1.	General	245
11.2.2.2.	One solution does not fit all	247
11.2.2.3.	Medium-term revenue strategies	248
11.3.	Building global partnerships for sustainable development in international tax governance	250
11.3.1.	The interests of OECD countries versus those of developing countries	250
11.3.2.	Ensure responsive, inclusive, participatory and representative decision-making at all levels	254
11.3.3.	Developing effective, accountable and transparent institutions at all levels	257
11.4.	Conclusions	258
<b>Chapter 12:</b>	<b>The Role of the Anti-Tax Avoidance Directive in Restoring Fairness and Ensuring Sustainability of the International Tax Framework - A Legal Assessment</b>	261
	<i>Peter Koerver Schmidt</i>	
12.1.	Introduction	261
12.2.	Recent international tax policy initiatives at the global and regional levels	261
12.3.	The concepts of fairness and sustainability	265
12.3.1.	Fairness in the eyes of the European Commission	265
12.3.2.	Fairness and taxation - The discussion in academia	266
12.3.3.	Notions of fairness used to assess the ATAD	269
12.4.	Assessment of the ATAD in the light of principles of legal fairness	270
12.4.1.	The ATAD and the principle of legitimacy (conferral, subsidiarity and proportionality)	270
12.4.2.	The specific anti-avoidance rules (SAARs)	272
12.4.2.1.	The interest limitation rule	272
12.4.2.2.	Exit taxation	274

## Table of Contents

12.4.23.	The controlled foreign company rule	276
12.4.2.4.	The rules on hybrid mismatches	278
12.4.2.5.	Overall assessment of the SAARs in the ATAD	280
12.43.	The general anti-abuse rule (GAAR)	282
12.5.	Final remarks	287
<b>Chapter 13:</b>	<b>Tax Sustainability and Residence-Based Global Taxation of MNEs</b>	291
	<i>Carlo Garbarino</i>	
13.1.	“Tax sustainability” as residence-based global taxation of MNEs	291
13.2.	Problems with “value creation”	296
13.3.	The global tax trilemma and minimum standards	301
13.4.	The superiority of unitary taxation of Global Actors	309
13.4.1.	Alternative solutions	309
13.4.2.	Residence-based global taxation	310
13.4.3.	DBCFT and formulary apportionment	314
13.5.	Conclusions	317
	<b>Part Five</b>	
	<b>Environmental Taxation and Sustainability</b>	
<b>Chapter 14:</b>	<b>Carbon Taxation and the European Union</b>	321
	<i>Richard Lyal</i>	
14.1.	Introduction	321
14.2.	The rationale of a carbon tax	321
14.3.	International obligations	326
14.4.	The mechanism of carbon taxation	328

14.5.	Perceived difficulties of carbon taxation	333
14.6.	Experience	337
14.7.	The past: Union excise duty legislation and taxation of carbon	338
14.7.1.	Talking the talk	339
14.7.2.	Walking the walk on tax	342
14.8.	The future	345
<b>Chapter 15:</b>	<b>Energy Poverty and Energy Taxation in the European Union: An Overview of Tax Measures</b> <i>Mateusz Lewandowski</i>	347
15.1.	Introduction	347
15.2.	The United Nations' approach to energy poverty	349
15.3.	The legal framework of energy poverty in the European Union	352
15.4.	The concept of energy poverty	355
15.5.	Tax policy measures to counteract energy poverty	358
15.6.	Conclusions	367
<b>Chapter 16:</b>	<b>A Pluralistic Approach to the Question How to Balance Different Objectives of Sustainable Development through Environmental Taxes within the Framework of EU State Aid Law</b> <i>Joana Pedroso and Jonas Kyronviita</i>	369
16.1.	Introduction	369
16.1.1.	Generalities	369
16.1.2.	Rationality	370
16.1.3.	Terminology confusion	371
16.1.4.	Article outline and pluralistic approach	372
16.2.	Sustainable development models	374

## Table of Contents

16.3.	Environmental taxes and State aid	377
16.3.1.	Generalities	377
16.3.2.	Legal background	377
16.3.3.	State aid secondary law effects	380
16.3.4.	Political arguments	385
16.4.	The State aid criteria	387
16.4.1.	Selectivity - Certain undertaking or the production of certain goods	387
16.4.2.	Distorts or threatens to distort competition	389
16.5.	Summary	390
 Part Six The Challenges of Tax Sustainability  		
<b>Chapter 17:</b>	<b>Identifying Challenges for Sustainable Tax Policy</b>	393
	<i>Pemilla Rendahl and Katarina Nordblom</i>	
17.1.	Introduction	393
17.2.	Identification of relevant SDGs	395
17.3.	Basic values	400
17.4.	Core policies	406
17.4.1.	General	406
17.4.2.	Redistributive taxation	406
17.4.3.	Environmental taxes	408
17.4.4.	International legal cooperation	410
17.4.5.	Legitimate and non-discriminatory tax policy	413
17.4.5.1.	Taxation should be perceived as fair	414
17.4.5.2.	Tax rules should be easy to understand	415
17.4.5.3.	Taxes should be regarded as a means for acquiring welfare	416
17.4.5.4.	One should perceive that “everyone else” contributes their fair share	416
17.5.	Conclusions: A trade-off between rationality and legitimacy to reach sustainable tax policies?	418

<b>Chapter 18:</b>	<b>A Sustainable Tax Policy and the New Paradigm</b>	419
	<i>Daniela Oprescu</i>	
18.1.	Introduction	419
18.2.	Tax policy considerations	421
18.2.1.	Flashback on Romania's economical background during Ceausescu's regime	421
18.2.2.	Tax policy scenarios	425
18.2.2.1.	Scenario I - The low-hanging fruit tax policy	425
18.2.2.2.	Scenario II - The sustainable tax policy	427
18.3.	Conclusion	429
<b>Chapter 19:</b>	<b>Towards Sustainable Taxation - Crossing Disciplinary Boundaries to Tackle Tax Avoidance More Effectively</b>	431
	<i>Amanda Sonnerfeldt</i>	
19.1.	Introduction	431
19.2.	Tax avoidance	433
19.3.	Understanding the field and regulatory arena	435
19.4.	Tax sustainability and corporate social responsibility (CSR)	440
19.5.	Propositions	442
19.6.	Methodological challenges	445
19.7.	Conclusion	446