

# U.S. Tax Treaty Policy and the European Court of Justice

RUTH MASON\*

I. Introduction	66
II. The Purpose of Tax Treaties	69
A. Normative Justifications for Limiting the Scope of Tax Treaties	71
B. Methods to Limit the Scope of Tax Treaties	76
III. Impact of the European Cases on U.S. Tax Treaties	79
A. <i>Open Skies</i>	80
B. Compatibility of <u>Limitation</u> on Benefits Clauses with EC Law	82
C. Compatibility of Other U.S. Tax Treaty Provisions with EC Law	87
D. How a Tax Treaty Challenge Would Arise	89
IV. Eliminating Tax Treaty Conflicts Through Harmonization	90
A. Scope of the Project: Restriction vs. Discrimination	91
B. Preserving Member State Sovereignty	95
C. Achieving U.S. Anti-Treaty-Shopping Goals	103
D. The Conservative Approach: Wait and See	104
V. The Ambitious Approach: A Multilateral Tax Treaty ..	108
A. Efficiency Gains for Multilateralism	110
1. Qualification Conflicts and Triangular Cases	110
2. Simplicity	115
3. Administrative and Compliance Gains for Government	116
a. Multilateral Limitation on Benefits	116

\* Associate Professor and Nancy & Bill Trachsel Scholar, University of Connecticut School of Law. The author would like to thank Lily Batchelder, Yariv Brauner, Allison Christians, Jim Cofer, Noel B. Cunningham, Daniel Halberstam, Chris Hoist, Georg W. Kofler, Mattias Kumm, Sarah Lawsky, Eran Lempert, Marja Lutsep, Perry Metzger, Christiana HJI Panayi, Richard L. Reinhold, H. David Rosenbloom, Daniel Shaviro, Steve Sheppard, John P. Steines, Jr., and especially Deborah Schenk for their comments on this Article. The author also would like to thank the participants at the conference on Comparative Fiscal Federalism: Comparing the European Court of Justice and the U.S. Supreme Court's Tax Jurisprudence at the University of Michigan Law School in October 2005.