

Departures from the OECD Model and Commentaries

**Reservations, observations and positions
in EU law and tax treaties**

edited by
Prof. Guglielmo Maisto

II



Vol. 11
EC and International Tax Law Series

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements

Foreword

VII

Part One

"Reservations", "Observations" and "Positions" to the OECD Model

Chapter 1:	The Role and Evolution of Reservations, Observations, Positions and Alternative Provisions in the OECD Model	
	<i>Jacques Sasseville</i>	
1.1.	Introduction	3
1.2.	Reservations	4
1.2.1.	Evolution	4
1.2.2.	Role of reservations	8
1.3.	Observations	10
1.3.1.	Evolution	10
1.3.2.	Role of observations	14
1.4.	Positions of non-OECD economies	15
1.4.1.	Evolution	15
1.4.2.	Role of positions	16
1.5.	Alternative provisions	17
1.5.1.	Evolution	17
1.5.2.	Role and form of alternative provisions	19
Chapter 2:	The Legal Status and Effects of Reservations, Observations and Positions to the OECD Model	23
	<i>Alberto Vega</i>	
2.1.	Introduction	23
2.2.	The legal status of reservations, observations and positions to the OECD Model	24
2.2.1.	The legal status of the OECD Model and Commentaries: Brief remark	24
2.2.2.	Reservations to the OECD Model	25
2.2.2.1.	Reservations to the OECD Model and reservations to treaties	25

Table of Contents

2.2.2.2.	Reservations to the OECD Model as an example of reservations to non-binding instruments	27
2.2.3.	Observations to the Commentaries *	30
2.2.3.1.	Observations to the Commentaries and unilateral interpretative declarations to treaties	31
2.2.3.2.	Observations to the Commentaries as unilateral interpretative declarations to non-binding instruments	33
2.2.4.	Positions to the OECD Model	34
2.3.	Legal effects of reservations, observations and positions, especially for the interpretation of tax treaties	35
2.3.1.	Introduction to the role of the Commentaries in the framework of the rules of interpretation of the VCLT	36
2.3.2.	Explicit agreements on the relevance of reservations, observations and positions for the interpretation of tax treaties	40
2.3.3.	Interpretative relevance of reservations, observations and positions in the absence of specific references to them	41
2.3.3.1.	Reservations	41
2.3.3.2.	Observations	42
2.3.3.2.1.	Effects of interpretative declarations to a treaty	43
2.3.3.2.2.	Effects of observations to the Commentaries on the OECD Model	46
2.3.3.3.	Positions	48
2.3.3.4.	Reservations, observations and positions to the OECD Model and their relationship with the UN Model	48
2.3.4.	Estoppel and acquiescence	50
2.3.5.	Inter-temporal problems	54
2.3.6.	Other possible effects of reservations, observations and positions	56
2.3.6.1.	Reference for future negotiations of tax treaties	56
2.3.6.2.	Influence on customary norms	57
2.3.7.	Reservations, observations and positions in case law	58
2.4.	Conclusions	61

Chapter 3:	"Reservations" and "Observations" to the OECD Model: Are They Necessary?	63
	<i>LiseLott Margareta Kana</i>	
3.1.	Introduction	63
3.2.	The practicalities of reservations	64
3.3.	The "positions" of non-OECD economies	64
3.4.	- Observations: Their impact and the difficulties thereof	65
3.5.	Concluding remarks	68
Part Two		
OECD Model and EU Law		
Chapter 4:	Union Law and OECD Model Concepts: What Can We Learn from the Comparison?	73
	<i>Michael Lang</i>	
4.1.	Similarities and differences	73
4.2.	Interpretation and application	76
4.2.1.	Relevance of domestic law	76
4.2.2.	Authentic languages	77
4.2.3.	Equivalence and effectiveness	78
4.2.4.	Anti-abuse-concepts	83
4.3.	Dispute settlement	86
4.3.1.	Mutual agreements	86
4.3.2.	Arbitration Convention	87
4.3.3.	ECJ competence	89
4.3.4.	Combining ECJ competence and MAP?	90
4.4.	Conclusion	95
Chapter 5:	Relevance of (Deviations from) the OECD Model and Commentary in ECJ Income Tax Case Law	97
	<i>Peter Wattel</i>	
5.1.	Preliminary constitutional observations	97
5.2.	Primary EU law is a one huge deviation from incompatible OECD soft law; but secondary EU law often – more or less – conforms	99

Table of Contents

5.3.	Interpretation of EU law terms and concepts drawn from OECD soft law and bilateral tax treaty practice	102
5.4.	The ECJ seems to reward OECD conformity, but does not condemn treaty overrides	104
5.5.	Conclusion	108
Chapter 6:	Relevance of the OECD Model and Its Commentaries in European VAT	111
	<i>Andrea Parolini</i>	
6.1.	Introduction	111
6.2.	Relevance of the OECD Model for the interpretation of concepts/notions laid down in VAT legislation	• 112
6.2.1.	Permanent establishment vs fixed establishment	112
6.2.2.	Arm's length principle vs open market value	114
6.3.	Conclusions	116

Part Three

Revisiting and Reviewing "Reservations", "Observations" and "Positions" to the OECD Model – Selected Provisions

Chapter 7:	National Model Conventions Developed by OECD Member Countries	121
	<i>Claudine Devillet</i>	
7.1.	Almost all OECD member countries are likely to develop a national model convention	121
7.2.	Status of public national models	122
7.3.	Why make a national model public?	123
7.3.1.	Requests for greater transparency of the country's tax treaty policy	123
7.3.2.	Information of all interested parties about the country's basic treaty policy	124
7.3.3.	Assurance that negotiators conform to the model or explain and justify divergences	126
7.3.4. –	To give more weight to specific positions of the country	128
7.4.	Departures from the OECD Model	130
7.5.	Necessity to periodically revise a national model	131

®.n'

7.6.	Withdrawal of a public national model	132
7.7.	Why do many countries decide not to publish their model?	133
Chapter 8:	Revisiting and Reviewing "Reservations", "Observations" and "Positions" to the OECD Model – Selected Provisions: OECD Member Countries	135
	<i>Paolo Arginelli and Michael Dirkis</i>	
8.1.	Introduction	135
8.2.	Historical evolution of reservations and observations in the Commentary to the OECD Model	137
8.3.	General considerations	138
8.4.	Statistical data analysis	141
8.4.1.	Analysis by country	142
8.4.2.	Analysis by article	143
8.4.3.	Analysis by subject matter	144
8.4.4.	Reservations and other model conventions	145
8.5.	Selected topics	146
8.5.1.	Reservations and observations concerning shipping, inland waterways transport and air transport	146
8.5.2.	Reservations and observations on the qualification of certain items of income as dividends, interest, or capital gains	150
8.5.3.	Reservations concerning certain offshore activities	155
8.5.4.	Reservations on the taxation of royalties at source	157
8.5.5.	Reservation on the definition of royalties: Inclusion of income from industrial, commercial and scientific equipment (ICS)	159
8.5.6.	Reservations and observations concerning the mutual agreement procedure	161
8.5.7.	Observations concerning the application of tax treaties to partnerships	162
8.5.8.	Observations concerning the interaction between domestic anti-avoidance rules (including CFC provisions) and tax treaties	165
8.6.	Issues arising from the existence of observations and reservations	168
8.7.	Conclusions	176
8.8.	Annex	176

Part Four
Country Reports

Chapter 9:	Australia	187
	<i>Michael Dirkis and Micah Burch</i>	
9.1.	Introduction	187
9.2.	Treaty practice and national tax treaty model	189
9.2.1.	National models	189
9.2.2.	Treaty practice	190
9.2.2.1.	Article 1 (persons covered)	190
9.2.2.2.	Article 2 (taxes covered)	191
9.2.2.3.	Article 3 (general definitions)	192
9.2.2.4.	Article 4 (resident)	192
9.2.2.5.	Article 5 (permanent establishment)	¹ 194
9.2.2.6.	Article 6 (immovable property)	198
9.2.2.7.	Article 7 (business profits)	199
9.2.2.8.	Article 8 (ships and air transport)	201
9.2.2.9.	Article 9 (associated enterprise)	203
9.2.2.10.	Article 10 (dividends)	204
9.2.2.11.	Article 11 (interest)	206
9.2.2.12.	Article 12 (royalties)	207
9.2.2.13.	Article 13 (alienation of property)	208
9.2.2.14.	Former article 14 (independent personal services)	210
9.2.2.15.	Article 15 (income from employment)	211
9.2.2.16.	Article 16 (directors' fees)	213
9.2.2.17.	Article 17 (artistes and sportsmen)	213
9.2.2.18.	Article 18 (pensions)	213
9.2.2.19.	Article 19 (government service)	215
9.2.2.20.	Article 20 (students)	215
9.2.2.21.	Teachers and academics articles	216
9.2.2.22.	Fringe benefits articles	216
9.2.2.23.	Article 21 (other income)	217
9.2.2.24.	Source of income article	218
9.2.2.25.	Article 22 (capital)	218
9.2.2.26.	Article 24 (non-discrimination)	218
9.2.2.27.	Article 25 (mutual agreement procedure)	219
9.2.2.28.	Article 26 (exchange of information)	220
9.2.2.29. ""	Article 27 (assistance in the collection of taxes)	220
9.2.2.30.	Article 28 (members of diplomatic missions and consular posts)	221
9.2.2.31.	Limitation on benefits article ft.v*	221

9.3.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	221
9.3.1.	The relevance of observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries for the purpose of applying tax treaties	221
9.3.1.1.	Legal status of tax treaties	222
9.3.1.2.	Tax treaty interpretation and legal status of OECD Commentaries	223
9.3.1.3.	Inter-temporal application of OECD Commentaries	228
9.3.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded by Australia in the OECD Commentaries	229
9.4.	Conclusion –	229
Chapter 10:	Austria	231
	<i>Michael Wenzl</i>	
10.1.	Treaty practice and national tax treaty model	231
10.1.1.	Austrian treaty policy in a nutshell	231
10.1.2.	The Austrian Model	233
10.1.2.1.	The Austrian Model as a starting point for treaty negotiation	233
10.1.2.2.	Important departures of the Austrian Model from the OECD Model	234
10.1.2.2.1.	Personal and material scope of application (arts. 1-4 OECD Model)	234
10.1.2.2.2.	Passive income (arts. 10-12 OECD Model)	235
10.1.2.2.3.	Income from employment (arts. 15-16 and 18-20 OECD Model)	240
10.1.2.2.4.	Other income (art. 21)	242
10.1.2.2.5.	Mutual agreement procedure (art. 25 OECD Model)	243
10.1.2.2.6.	Assistance in the collection of taxes (art. 27 OECD Model)	243
10.1.2.3.	Treaty practice –Most common departures from the OECD Model in the Austrian treaty network	244
10.1.2.3.1.	Personal and material scope of application (arts. 1-4)	244
10.1.2.3.2.	Business income (arts. 5-9)	245
10.1.2.3.3.	Passive income (arts. 10-12)	247
10.1.2.3.4.	Capital gains (art. 13)	248
10.1.2.3.5.	Income from employment (arts. 15-16 and 18-20)	249

Table of Contents

10.1.2.3.6.	Artistes and athletes (art. 17)	249
10.1.2.3.7.	Methods for elimination of double taxation (art. 23)	250
10.1.2.3.8.	Non-discrimination and mutual agreement procedure (arts. 24-25)	250
10.1.2.3.9.	Exchange of information (art. 26)	251
10.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	251
10.2.1.	The relevance of observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries for the purpose of applying tax treaties	251
10.2.1.1.	Legal status of the OECD Commentaries	251
10.2.1.2.	Changes in the OECD Commentaries	253
10.2.1.3.	Legal status of observations, reservations and positions	»255
10.2.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded by Austria in the OECD Commentaries	257
10.2.2.1.	Current observations, reservations and positions	257
10.2.2.2.	Historical evolution of observations, reservations and positions	258
10.2.2.2.1.	Reservation regarding article 12 of the OECD Model –Royalties	258
10.2.2.2.2.	Reservation regarding article 26 of the OECD Model –Exchange of information	259
10.3.	Differences between the OECD Model and its Commentaries and EU law	263
10.3.1.	Differences between OECD Model concepts and EU law concepts	263
10.3.1.1.	Beneficial owner	263
10.3.1.2.	Permanent establishments	265
10.3.1.3.	Non-discrimination	266
10.3.2.	Derivations of the Austrian treaty network caused by EU law	268
10.3.2.1.	Passive income and withholding tax	268
10.3.2.2.	Tax Recovery Directive	269
10.3.2.3.	The ECJ as arbitrator	269
Chapter 11:	Belgium	271
	<i>Jasper Bossuyt and Filip Debelva</i>	
11.1.	Introduction	271
11.2.	Departures from the OECD Model in the Belgian Kfodel	274

11.2.1.	Persons covered	274
•11.2.2.	Taxes covered	275
• 11.2.3.	General definitions	276
11.2.4.	Resident	276
11.2.5.	Permanent establishment	277
11.2.6.	Business profits	278
11.2.7.	Shipping and air transport	278
11.2.8.	Associated enterprises	279
11.2.9.	Dividend	281
11.2.10.	Interest	283
11.2.11.	Royalty	285
11.2.12.	Capital gains	286
11.2.13.	Income from employment	287
11.2.14.	Directors' fees	288
11.2.15.	Artists and sportsmen	289
11.2.16.	Pensions	289
11.2.17.	Other income	290
11.2.18.	Elimination of double taxation	292
11.2.19.	Non-discrimination	295
11.2.20.	Mutual agreement procedure (MAP)	295
11.2.21.	Exchange of information	296
11.2.22.	Miscellaneous	296
11.3.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	297
11.3.1.	General	297
11.3.2.	Current and former reservations to the OECD Model	298
11.3.3.	Current and former observations to the Commentary of the OECD Model	309
11.3.4.	Case law	311
11.3.5.	Legal status of reservations and observations under Belgian law	314
11.3.5.1.	Tax treaty does not confirm use of the Commentary for interpretation purposes	315
11.3.5.2.	Tax treaty confirms use of the Commentary for interpretation purposes	316
11.4.	Differences between the OECD Model and its Commentaries and EU law	320
11.4.1.	Permanent establishment	320
11.4.2.	Dividend	320
11.4.3.	Interest	321
11.4.4.	Royalty	322

Table of Contents

11.4.5.	Beneficial owner	322
11.4.6.	Discrimination	324
11.5.	Deviations from OECD Model of bilateral tax treaties inspired by EU law	325
Chapter 12:	China (People's Rep.)	327
	<i>Yimin Kou</i>	
12.1.	Introduction to China's tax treaties	327.
12.2.	Departures from the OECD Model and Commentaries	330
12.2.1.	Difference between the China-Singapore Tax Treaty and the OECD Model	330
12.2.2.	Departures from the OECD Model in terms of Chinese tax treaties	<334
12.2.2.1.	Departures regarding definitions	334
12.2.2.1.1.	Departures regarding "enterprises" and "business"	334
12.2.2.2.	Departures regarding "Resident of a Contracting State"	335
12.2.2.3.	Departures from the second sentence of article 4	336
12.2.2.4.	Departures on "permanent establishment" (PE)	338
12.2.2.4.1.	Departures on project PE	338
12.2.2.4.2.	Departures on service PE	339
12.2.2.5.	Departures on "international transportation"	340
12.2.2.6.	Departures on "dividend"	340
12.2.2.7.	Departures regarding "royalty"	341
12.2.2.8.	Departures on "capital gain"	341
12.2.2.9.	Departures on tax sparing credit	342
12.2.2.10.	Departures on mutual assistance in the collection on taxes	342
12.2.3.	Departures in the OECD Commentary	343
12.2.3.1.	Departures on the interpretation of the terms "enterprises of a Contracting State" and "enterprise of the other Contracting State"	343
12.2.3.2.	Departures from the second sentence of article 4	344
12.2.3.3.	Departures on "permanent establishment"	345
12.2.3.3.1.	Departures on "delivery of spare parts"	345
12.2.3.3.2.	Departures on treatment of a mixed contract	346
12.2.3.3.3".	Departures regarding the profit allocated to a PE	347
12.2.3.3.4.	Departures on non-discrimination on PE	349
12.2.3.3.4.1.	Departures on indirect tax credit	349
12.2.3.3.4.2.	Departures on the deemed profit ratio	350

12.2.3.4.	Departures on international transportation	352
12.2.3.5.	Departures on "royalty"	353
12.2.3.6.	Departures on "beneficial ownership"	357
12.3.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	360
12.4.	The tendency of norm maker and possibility of a future national model	363
Chapter 13:	Germany	369
	<i>Christian J. Schmidt</i>	
13.1.	Summary	369
13.2.	The German Model (2013)	370
13.2.1.	Structure	372
13.2.2!	Title and preamble	372
13.2.3.	Scope of the Model and definitions	373
13.2.3.1.	Contracting state – Article 3(1)(1) of the German Model (2013)	373
13.2.3.2.	Competent authority – Article 3(1)(8) of the German Model (2013)	373
13.2.3.3.	Permanent establishment – Article 5 of the German Model (2013)	374
13.2.4.	Distributive rules	375
13.2.4.1.	PE taxation – Article 7 of the German Model (2013)	375
13.2.4.1.1.	Functionally separated entity approach as the authorized OECD approach (AOA)	375
13.2.4.1.2.	Corresponding adjustment – Article 7(3) of the German Model (2013)	375
13.2.4.2.	<i>Sondervergütungen</i>	376
13.2.4.3.	Transfer pricing – Article 9 of the German Model (2013)	376
13.2.4.4.	Dividends – Article 10 of the German Model (2013)	376
13.2.4.4.1.	Definitions	376
13.2.4.4.2.	Participation exemption	377
13.2.4.4.3.	Procedural rules for taxation at source	379
13.2.4.5.	Interest – Article 11 of the German Model (2013)	379
13.2.4.6.	PE sandwich	381
13.2.4.7.	Royalties – Article 12 of the German Model (2013)	381
13.2.4.8.	Capital gains	382

Table of Contents

13.2.4.9.	Independent personal services	384
13.2.4.10.	Income from employment-Article 14 of the German Model (2013)	384
13.2.4.11.	Income of artistes and sportsmen – Article 16 of the German Model (2013)	385
13.2.4.12.	Maintenance payments	386
13.2.5.	Method for elimination of double taxation	387
13.2.5.1.	Exemption	387
13.2.5.2.	Switch-over clause	391
13.2.5.3.	Subject-to-tax clause	394
13.2.6.	Anti-abuse clause – Article 28 of the German Model (2013)	395
13.2.7.	Treaty benefits for investment funds	396
13.2.8.	Arbitration procedure – Article 24(5) of the German Model (2013)	«397
13.2.9.	Exchange of information – Article 25 of the German Model (2013)	398
13.3.	Treaty practice	398
13.3.1.	Residence	398
13.3.2.	Saving clause	399
13.3.3.	Partnership provision	399
13.3.4.	Income from immovable property	400
13.3.5.	<i>Sohdervergütungen</i>	400
13.3.6.	Dividends	401
13.3.7.	Interest	402
13.3.8.	Royalties	403
13.3.9.	Professional hiring-out of labour	404
13.3.10.	Remittance base clause	405
13.3.11.	GAAR	405
13.4.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	405
13.4.1.	The relevance of observations and reservations recorded	405
13.4.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded by the relevant country in the OECD Commentaries	409
13.4.2.1.	Paragraph 32 of the Commentary on Article 4 of the OECD Model (2010)	409
13.4.2.2. ""	Paragraph 43 of the Commentary on Article 5 of the OECD Model (2010)	409
13.4.2.3.	Paragraph 45.7-9 of the Commentary on Article 5 of the OECD Model (2010)	410

13.4.2.4.	Paragraph 29 of the Commentary on Article 8 of the OECD Model (2010)	411
13.4.2.5.	Paragraph 17 of the Commentary on Article 9 of the OECD Model (2010)	411
13.4.2.6.	Paragraph 32 of the Commentary on Article 12 of the OECD Model (2010)	412
13.4.2.7.	Paragraph 13.1 of the Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model (2010)	412
13.4.2.8.	Paragraph 16 of the Commentary on Article 15 of the OECD Model (2010)	413
13.4.2.9.	Paragraph 15 of the Commentary on Article 17 of the OECD Model (2010)	413
13.4.2.10.	Paragraph 82 of the Commentary on Article 24 of the OECD Model (2010)	413
13.5.	EU law	414
13.5.1.	Residence	414
13.5.2.	PE losses	415
13.5.3.	Dividends	415
13.5.4.	Interest and Royalties Directive and beneficial ownership	416
13.5.5.	Discrimination and most-favoured-nation clauses	418
13.5.6.	EU Arbitration Convention	420
apter 14:	Italy	421
	<i>Giorgia Zanetti</i>	
14.1.	Treaty practice and national tax treaty model	421
14.1.1.	Treaty practice	421
14.1.1.1.	Deviations related to reservations made by Italy to the Commentary to the OECD Model	422
14.1.1.2.	Deviations related to alternative provisions suggested in the OECD Commentaries	425
14.1.1.3.	Other deviations	433
14.1.1.4.	Application of tax treaties by tax authorities and judiciary not in line with the Commentaries of the OECD Model	434
14.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	438
14.2.1.	The relevance of observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries for the purpose of applying tax treaties	438

Table of Contents

14.2.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded by Italy in the OECD Commentaries	443
14.3.	Differences between the OECD Model and its Commentaries and EU law	450
Chapter 15:	Netherlands	459
	<i>Lucas J. de Heer</i>	
15.1.	Tax treaty practice in the Netherlands	460
15.1.1.	Introduction	460
15.1.2.	Residency for tax treaty purposes	460
15.1.3.	The so-called KLM provision	464
15.1.4.	Taxation of offshore activities	466
15.1.5.	Pensions	468
15.1.6.	Readmission clause immigrants	470
15.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in OECD Commentaries	470
15.2.1.	Relevance of observations, reservations and positions recorded in OECD Commentaries for the purpose of applying tax treaties	470
15.2.1.1.	Introduction ...	470
15.2.1.2.	Observations vs reservations	471
15.2.1.3.	Observations determinative for legal nature of OECD Commentary	472
15.2.1.4.	Treaty policy regarding observations and reservations in the Netherlands	474
15.2.1.5.	Dynamic application of the Commentary and inter-temporal application of observations	474
15.2.2.	Observations and reservations made by the Netherlands	477
15.2.2.1.	Articles 1 and 23A/B: Application of the OECD Partnership Report	477
15.2.2.2.	Article 1: Domestic anti-avoidance rules	480
15.2.2.3.	Article 13: Capital gains on real estate investment entities	481
15.2.2.4.	Article 19: Apportionment of pension payments	482
15.3.	Impact of EU law on Dutch tax treaties	484
15.3.1.	Introduction	484
15.3.2. *	Triangular cases	485
15.3.3.	Withholding taxes	485

Chapter 16:	Spain	487
	<i>Ignacio Gordillo F. Villavicencio</i>	
16.1.	Treaty practice and national tax treaty model	487
16.1.1.	Spanish treaty practice	487
16.1.1.1.	The most recurrent deviations from the OECD Model of the tax treaties concluded by Spain and the policy reasons thereof	487
16.1.1.1.1.	Deviations stemming from Spain's reservations and observations	489
16.1.1.1.1.1.	Deviations as regards income and gains from, and capital represented by, immovable property	489
16.1.1.1.1.2.	Deviations as regards royalty income	490
16.1.1.1.1.3.	Deviations regarding business profits and income from independent professional services	491
16.1.1.1.1.4.	Deviations regarding dividend and interest income	492
16.1.1.1.1.5.	Deviations as regards taxation of substantial participations in resident companies	493
16.1.1.1.2.	Deviations stemming from alternative provisions suggested in the Commentaries of the OECD Model	493
16.1.1.1.2.1.	Deviations consisting in the inclusion of anti-abuse clauses	493
16.1.1.1.2.2.	Deviations regarding interest income	494
16.1.1.1.2.3.	Deviations as regards taxation of income from international traffic	494
16.1.1.1.2.4.	Deviations as regards taxation of income derived from artistic and sports events supported by public funds	494
16.1.1.1.2.5.	Deviations regarding the definition of the geographical scope	495
16.1.1.1.3.	Other deviations	495
16.1.1.1.3.1.	Deviations regarding dividend and interest income	495
16.1.1.1.3.2.	Deviations related to the methods to avoid double taxation	496
16.1.1.1.3.3.	Deviations as regards taxation of income derived by students, visiting scholars and researchers	496
16.1.1.1.3.4.	Deviations as regards taxation of profits from international transport	497
16.1.1.1.3.5.	Deviations regarding the objective scope of the convention	497
16.1.1.1.3.6.	Other recurrent and relevant deviations	497

Table of Contents

16.1.1.2.	Cases where the application of Spain's tax treaties by its tax authorities and judiciary is not in line with the interpretation of the OECD Model included in the Commentaries	498
16.1.1.2.1.	A too far-reaching ambulatory interpretation of the Commentaries	498
16.1.1.2.2.	Permanent establishment issues	499
16.1.1.2.2.1.	Contract manufacturers and distributor agents resulting from business restructurings	500
16.1.1.2.2.2.	Restrictive interpretation of the auxiliary or preparatory character of certain activities	501
16.1.1.2.2.3.	A Spanish website may be a PE under article 5(1) of the OECD Model	501
16.1.1.2.3.	Royalty income	501
16.1.1.2.3.1.	Partial alienation of IP rights	502
16.1.1.2.3.2.	Software and computer programs	502
16.1.1.2.3.3.	Alienation of know-how not possible	503
16.1.1.2.3.4.	Income from technical assistance regarded as royalties	503
16.1.1.2.3.5.	Image rights	503
16.1.1.2.4.	Other relevant deviations,	504
16.1.1.2.4.1.	Capital gains other than those arising from the alienation of property	504
16.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	504
16.2.1.	The relevance of observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries for the purpose of applying tax treaties	504
16.2.1.1.	The legal status of observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Model under Spanish law	504
16.2.1.2.	The relevance of observations, reservations and positions for the purpose of interpreting tax treaties	507
16.2.1.2.1.	Spanish case law	508
16.2.1.2.2.	Spanish tax authorities' position	511
16.2.1.2.3.	Spanish academic writings	513
16.2.1.3.	Inter-temporal application of observations and positions in tax treaty interpretation	516
16.2.1.3.1.	Spanish case law	517
16.2.1.3.2.	Spanish tax authorities' position	518

* v'

16.2.1.3.3.	Spanish academic writings	519
16.2.2.	Observations and reservations recorded by Spain in the OECD Commentaries	520
16.2.2.1.	Reservations and observations currently recorded by Spain and the policy reasons thereof	520
16.2.2.1.1.	Current Spanish reservations	520
16.2.2.1.2.	Current Spanish observations	523
16.2.2.2.	Reservations and observations recorded in the past and now deleted by Spain, and the policy reasons thereof	524
16.2.2.2.1.	Old Spanish reservations	524
16.2.2.2.2.	Old Spanish observations	529
16.3.	Differences between the OECD Model and its Commentaries and EU law	530
16.3.1!	The influence of the OECD Model and its Commentaries on the construction of EU legal concepts and the existing differences between comparable concepts	530
16.3.2.	Deviations from the OECD Model related to EU law in Spain's treaty network	535
Chapter 17:	United States	537
	<i>Omri Marian and Yariv Brauner</i>	
17.1.	Introduction	537
17.2.	US Tax Treaty Model and deviations from OECD Model: Current policies and developing trends	538
17.2.1.	The US Model	538
17.2.2.	Current key US deviations from the OECD Model	540
17.2.2.1.	The saving clause	541
17.2.2.2.	The omission of state and local taxes	542
17.2.2.3.	No territorial extension	545
17.2.2.4.	Corporate residence – Place of incorporation	546
17.2.2.5.	Branch taxes	549
17.2.2.6.	FIRPTA and gains from the alienation of real property	552
17.2.2.7.	Non-discrimination and interest stripping – Section 163(j)	554
17.2.2.8.	Comprehensive exchange of information and the development of FATCA	556
17.2.2.9.	Limitation on benefits	559

Table of Contents

17.2.2.10.	Conduit financing arrangements	562
17.2.2.11.	No tax sparing	564
17.2.2.12.	Other deviations	565
17.2.3.	Developing treaty policies	565
17.2.3.1.	New article 7	565
17.2.3.2.	Mandatory arbitration	567
17.3.	US reservations on OECD Commentaries	572
17.3.1.	Relevance of observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries for the purpose of applying US tax treaties	572
17.3.2.	Observations, reservations and positions recorded in the OECD Commentaries	577
17.3.2.1.	Article 1	577
17.3.2.2.	Article 2	578
17.3.2.3.	Article 3	578
17.3.2.4.	Article 4	578
17.3.2.5.	Article 5	579
17.3.2.6.	Article 6	579
17.3.2.7.	Article 7	580
17.3.2.7.1.	New article 7 (2010)	580
17.3.2.7.2.	Article 7-Old (2008)	581
17.3.2.8.	Article 8	582
17.3.2.9.	Article 9	583
17.3.2.10.	Article 10	584
17.3.2.11.	Article 11	585
17.3.2.12.	Article 12(2)	585
17.3.2.13.	Article 13	586
17.3.2.14.	Article 16	586
17.3.2.15.	Article 17	587
17.3.2.16.	Article 19	588
17.3.2.17.	Article 21	589
17.3.2.18.	Article 24	589

Part Five Conclusions

Chapter 18:	Concluding Remarks – A Coordination on the Interpretation and Application of International Tax Law	593
	<i>Augusto Fantozzi</i>	
18.1.	Introduction	593

18.2.	Legislation or interpretation?	594
1-8.3.	The outcome – A new trend	595
Contributors		597