

An Introduction to Comparative Law Theory and Method

Geoffrey Samuel



• H A R T •
PUBLISHING

OXFORD AND PORTLAND, OREGON

2014

Contents

<i>Preface</i>	vii
<i>Contents</i>	ix
<i>List of Figures</i>	xiii
<i>Principal Abbreviations</i>	xv
<i>List of Common Law Cases</i>	xvii
Introduction	1
1. Problems and Promises of Comparative Law	8
I. Levels of Difficulty	8
II. Definitional Problems.....	10
III. Methodology.....	13
IV. Weaknesses and Strengths of Comparative Law	15
V. Theory and Anti-theory.....	19
VI. Comparative Law as Epistemology	21
VII. Interdisciplinarity	23
2. Asking the Right Question	25
I. Framing the Right Question	25
II. Literature Review and the Research Question.....	26
III. Coherence and Non-coherence.....	27
IV. Reflecting on the Literature.....	29
V. Clarity of the Research Question	31
VI. Testing and Reformulating the Research Question.....	34
VII. Orientation.....	34
VIII. Validation of Assertions	39
IX. Reductionism and Harmonisation.....	41
X. Review and Reflection.....	43
3. What is 'Comparison'?.....	45
I. Goals and Models of Comparison.....	45
II. Beyond Modelling.....	48
III. Macro and Micro Approaches	50
IV. Differential Comparison.....	53
V. Genealogical and Analogical Comparison.....	57
VI. Internal and External Perspectives.....	60
VII. Comparative Methods and Law	64

4. Functional Method.....	65
I. Functional Approach in Comparative Law.....	65
II. Practical Examples: Good Faith and Abuse of Rights	69
III. Functionalism and Case Studies	71
IV. Promise of Functionalism	76
5. Alternatives to Functionalism.....	79
I. Problems with the Functional Approach	79
II. Schemes of Intelligibility.....	81
III. Analysis of Schemes	84
IV. Law and the Dialectical Scheme	89
V. Methods and Knowledge.....	92
6. Structural Method.....	96
I. Legal Structures.....	96
II. Norm Structure	99
III. Rights and Structural Relations.....	102
IV. Structural Comparison	106
7. Hermeneutical Method	108
I. Deep Hermeneutical Approach.....	108
II. Deep Hermeneutics and the Problem of Structuralism	111
III. Structuralism and Transplants.....	115
IV. Legal Mentality	118
8. What is 'Law' (1)?.....	121
I. Rule model.....	121
II. Realist Model	124
III. Mentalities	126
IV. Concepts	128
V. Systems.....	131
VI. Object of Comparison: Résumé.....	133
9. What is Law (2)?.....	135
I. Positivism and Causality	135
II. Systems and Interpretation	137
III. Monism, Dualism and Pluralism	141
IV. System and Language	144
V. Law and Fact	147
VI. Virtual Facts.....	148
VII. Comparison and Law: Reflections.....	151

10. Paradigm Orientations	152
I. Introductory Remarks	152
II. Holism versus Individualism	153
III. Order versus Disorder	156
IV. Nature versus Culture	159
V. Comparative Law and the Cultural Paradigm.....	163
VI. Cultural Paradigm and Legal Theory	165
VII. Interaction of Paradigms	166
VIII. Enquiry versus Authority	168
Concluding Remarks: A Methodological Road Map?.....	173
<i>Bibliography</i>	180
<i>Index</i>	191