

International Tax Law

Second Edition

Edited By

Andrea Amatucci



Wolters Kluwer

Law & Business

Table of Contents

Preface	xix
Acknowledgement	xxxi
CHAPTER 1	
The Contribution of Economic Analysis of Law to the Tax Law Methodology <i>Andrea Amatucci</i>	1
§1.01 Oreste Ranelletti, the Founder of the Neapolitan School of Public Finance Law	1
§1.02 The Three Phases of Ranelletti's Experimental Methodology	3
§1.03 The Testing and Analysis of Ranelletti's Methodology, Conducted by the Scholars of the Neapolitan School	7
[A] Francesco D'Alessio	7
[B] Gustavo Ingrosso	8
[C] Romanelli-Grimaldi	9
[D] Vincenzo Sica	11
[E] Giuseppe Abbamonte	11
§ 1.04 The Relationship between the Hard-line Conception of the Italian School of Pavia and the Substantive View of the School of Naples	14
§1.05 The Pavia and Milan Schools of Tax Law and their Relationship to Ranelletti's Scientific Achievements	18
§ 1.06 Methodological Rigor as the Foundation of the Scientific Autonomy of Tax Law	22
§1.07 The Origins of Economic Analysis of Law in the United States	24
§1.08 The Expansion Phase of Economic Analysis of Law in the 1970s	26
§1.09 The Development and Consolidation Phase of Economic Analysis of Law	28
§1.10 Economic Analysis of Law shows Elements in common with Realism	32
§1.11 Efficiency and Redistributive Justice as Selection Criteria of the Real	

	Law Text Meaning	37
§1.12	How Tax Law Pursues Purposes of Redistributive Justice with Less Efficiency Loss than the Other Branches of Law	39
CHAPTER 2		
	Tax Law	~ 45
<i>Nicola d'Amati</i>		
§2.01	Consistency and Systematic Nature of Tax Relationship in the Traditional Doctrine	45
§2.02	The 'Assessment': 'Taxation' Alternative in the 1930s-1940s Doctrine	46
§2.03	The 1950s Pre-reform and Role Mediation	48
§2.04	An Alchemical Formula: The Assessment at Variable Composition	50
§2.05	(Continued): Composition and Process	51
§2.06	The Tax Proceedings as an Alternative to the Tax Relationship	53
§2.07	The 'Pure' Doctrine of the Procedure	54
§2.08	Procedure and Direct Payment of the Tax	56
§2.09	From the 1951 Pre-reform to the Tax Direct Payment	59
§2.10	The New Forms of the Administrative Procedure	61
§2.11	The Annual Individual Income Tax Return as a Turning Point in the Assessment Discipline	62
§2.12	Allorio's ' <i>Nuove Riflessioni</i> ' and the So-Called Equivalence Phenomenon	63
§2.13	The Tax Assessment from the Collecting Point of View	65
§2.14	From the Taxation without Declaration to the Declaration without Taxation	67
§2.15	Centralizing Taxes	70
§2.16	Tax Payment	72
§2.17	Payment Control	73
§2.18	Liquidation	76
§2.19	Tax Compliance	77
§2.20	Tax Law between Obligatory Relationship and Tax Administrative Procedure	79
CHAPTER 3		
	Tax Law and Private Law	85
<i>Lerke Osterloh</i>		
§3.01	General Trends in German Tax Law	85
§3.02	Constitutional Standards for Fiscal Legislation and Application of the Law and Their Implications in Legal Dogma	90
	[A] On Obligations Incumbent on the Legislature Handing Down Tax Law to Adhere to the Basic Law	90

Table of Contents

	[B] On Obligations to Adhere to the Basic Law in Interpreting Fiscal Legislation	93
§3.03	Individual Contentious Issues on the 'Independence' of the Interpretation and Application of Tax Law	97
	[A] Ascertaining Income	97
	[B] Independence of Tax Law ~'	100
	[C] Partnerships and Corporations	102
CHAPTER 4		
	Administrative Provisions in Taxation Law	103
	<i>Christoph Trzaskalik and Marion Petri</i>	
§4.01	Tax Statutes Subject to Further Concretion	103
§4.02	The Concept of Administrative Provision	104
§4.03	The Content of Administrative Provisions	104
§4.04	The Enactment Procedure	105
§4.05	The Legal Meaning of Administrative Provisions	106
	[A] Binding Effects on Tax Authorities' Officers	106
	[B] Binding Effects on Citizens and Jurisdictional Authorities	106
	[1 j] <i>Are Administrative Provisions to be Ranked as Legislative Acts?</i>	106
	[2] <i>Administrative Provisions and their Function as Acts to Implement the Law</i>	108
	[3] <i>Particular Meaning of Administrative Provisions in the Ambit of the Discretionary Powers Recognized for Tax Authorities within the Relevant Legislation</i>	110
	[4] <i>Types of Administrative Provisions Requiring Abidance</i>	112
	[a] Interim Decrees	112
	[b] Rules to Typify and Simplify Taxable Amount Procedures	114
	[c] General Instructions to Ascertain the Facts of the Precise Tax Case	115
§4.06	Final Comments	117
ANNEX TO CHAPTER 4		
	Administrative Provisions in Taxation Law: Current Developments	119
	<i>Henning Tappe</i>	
I	The Concept of Administrative Provisions	119
II	Types and Functions of Administrative Provisions	120
III	Enactment of Administrative Provisions in a Federal State	122
IV	The Legal Meaning of Administrative Provisions	123
V	Final Comments	125

CHAPTER 5

The Administrative Procedure for Determining Tax Liability	127
<i>Eusebio Gonzalez</i>	
§5.01 Systems for Determining the Basis on which Tax Is Applied	127
[A] The Systems of Direct Determination and Objective Estimation	130
[1] <i>Concept and Function</i>	130
[a] <i>Indexes</i>	131
[b] <i>Checked returns</i>	131
[c] <i>Forfeiting</i>	132
[2] <i>Differences to be Established between Systems of Direct Determination and Objective Estimation</i>	132
[B] The System of Indirect Estimation	133
§5.02 Characteristics of the Administrative Estimate Procedure	133
[A] First Characteristic	134
[B] Second Characteristic	136
[C] Third Characteristic	137
§5.03 Control Functions of the Tax Authorities	137
[A] Procedures of Legal Qualification, Assessment and Investigation	138
[B] Procedures of Evaluation	139
[C] Settlement Functions	139
[D] The Function of Obtaining Tax-related Information	139
§5.04 The Settlement Procedure in the Direct Estimation System	141
[A] Legal Nature of 'Voluntary Payment'	141
[B] Provisional Settlement: Concept, Characteristics and Legal Nature	143
[1] <i>Concept</i>	143
[2] <i>Characteristics</i>	144
[3] <i>What Is the Legal and Administrative Nature of Provisional Settlements?</i>	145
[C] Verification of the Existence and Evaluation of the Chargeable Event	147
[1] <i>Concept and Classes</i>	147
[2] <i>Legal Effects of the Checking Activity</i>	148
[3] <i>Function and Structure of the Checking Procedure</i>	148
[4] <i>Possible Discretionary Action by the Tax Authorities in the Checking Procedure</i>	149
§5.05 Summary	150
ANNEX TO CHAPTER 5	
Recent Developments on Administrative Determination of Tax Liability	151
<i>Antonio Vazquez del Rey</i>	

Table of Contents

I	Administrative Procedure and Determination of Tax Liability	151
II	Determination of the Tax Base. Some Issues Regarding Presumptive Taxation	153
III	Tax Authorities Guidance and Advance Instruments Regarding the Determination of Tax	155
IV	Check compliance and Administrative Determination of the Tax Liability	157
V	Summary	159
CHAPTER 6		
	Double Taxation Conventions	161
	<i>Victor Uckmar</i>	
§6.01	Introduction	161
§6.02	The History of Tax Treaties and Model Conventions	162
§6.03	Purpose of Double Taxation Conventions	164
§6.04	Relationship of Tax Treaties and Domestic Law	166
§6.05	Tax Treaty Interpretation	168
	[A] The Vienna Convention on the Laws of Treaties	168
	[B] Reference to the OECD Commentaries	170
	[C] The Interpretation Rule of Article 3(2) of the OECD Tax Model Convention	172
	[D] Conflicts of Qualification	173
§6.06	Basic Contents of the Model Tax Treaty	175
	[A] Coverage and Scope	176
	[B] Income from Immovable Property	177
	[C] Business Income	177
	[D] Dividends, Interest and Royalties	181
	[E] Employment and Pension Income	183
	[F] Capital Gains and the 'Other Income' Article	186
	[G] Non-discrimination	187
	[H] Mutual Agreement Procedure, Exchange of Information and Assistance in the Collection of Taxes	189
§6.07	Treaty Shopping	192
CHAPTER 7		
	Tax Treaties in the Americas: The United States Experience	195
	<i>Charles H. Gustafson</i>	
§7.01	Introduction	195
	[A] In General	195
	[B] Impact of Income Tax Treaties	196
	[C] Outline of This Chapter	196
§7.02	The Jurisprudence of Treaties in United States Law and Practice	197
	[A] Establishing a Treaty	197

	[B] Posture of Treaties in US Practice	198
§7.03	Basic Provisions of US Income Tax Law and Practice	198
	[A] General Rules *	198
	[B] Tax Administration	202
§7.04	Taxation of Inbound Transactions: US Taxation of US Income of Foreign Taxpayers	202
	[A] Definition of Foreign Taxpayer	202
	[B] Source Rules	202
	[C] US Trade or Business Income	204
	[D] Withholding Tax on Non-Trade or Business Income	205
§7.05	Outbound Transactions: US Taxation of Foreign Income of US Taxpayers	207
	[A] Worldwide Taxability	207
	[B] Entity Classification	208
	[C] The Foreign Tax Credit	208
	[D] Anti-Deferral Regimes	210
	[1] <i>Foreign Personal Holding Companies</i>	210
	[2] <i>Subpart F</i>	211
	[3] <i>Passive Foreign Investment Companies</i>	212
§7.06	US Tax Treaty Relations in the Americas	212
	[A] The NAFTA Countries	212
	[B] South and Central America	212
	[C] The Caribbean	213
	[D] Bermuda: A Special Case	213
§7.07	Provisions Favouring Country of Residence	214
	[A] Withholding Tax Provisions	214
	[1] <i>In General</i>	214
	[2] <i>Repatriation of Corporate Profits</i>	214
	[a] <i>Dividends</i>	214
	[b] <i>Branch Profits Taxes</i>	215
	[3] <i>Interest</i>	216
	[4] <i>Royalties</i>	217
	[B] Trade or Business Income	218
	[1] <i>The Permanent Establishment Requirement</i>	218
	[2] <i>Provision of Services by Individuals</i>	219
§7.08	Limitations on Treaty Benefits	220
	[A] Problem of 'Treaty Shopping'	220
	[B] Termination of Treaties	221
	[C] Treaty Limitations	221
	[D] Domestic Law Limitations	222
	[1] <i>Judicial Decisions</i>	222
	[2] <i>Anti-Conduit Regulations</i>	222
§7.09	Provisions Favouring Source Country	223
	[A] In General	223

Table of Contents

	[B] Tax Sparing		223
§7.10	Cooperation in Tax Administration		224
	[A] Bilateral Income Tax Treaties	*	224
	[B] Tax Information Exchange Agreements		227
	[C] Mutual Legal Assistance Treaties		229
§7.11	Conclusion	**	230
ANNEX TO CHAPTER 7			
	US Tax Reforms		231
	<i>Roberta Scarpato</i>		
I	Housing and Economic Recovery Act		231
II	Emergency Economic Stabilization Act		233
	[A] Tax Exemptions for Homeowners		234
	[B] Energy Incentives		234
	[C] Disaster Relief		235
III	Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act		235
CHAPTER 8			
	The Commentary of the OECD Model Tax Convention as Two-Tier Soft Law: Rule of Conduct for Tax Authorities and Living Law for Taxpayers		257
	<i>Konosuke Kimura</i>		
§8.01	Defining the Issues		237
§8.02	Instruments to Analyse the Issues		245
§8.03	The Stains of the OECD Model Tax Convention		250
§8.04	The Status of the Commentary Thereon		252
	[A] Rule of Conduct for Tax Administration		254
	[B] Living Law for Tax Payers and Tax Practitioners		255
	[C] The Equal Application of Norm for Decision before the Courts		255
	[D] The Tentative Conclusion: The Commentary as Soft Law		256
§8.05	The Influence of the Commentary on International Tax Cases of Japan		257
§8.06	Conclusion		258
CHAPTER 9			
	A European Legal Tax Order Based on Ability to Pay		261
	<i>Joachim Lang & Joachim Englisch</i>		
§9.01	The Need for a European Tax Order		261
§9.02	The Constitutional Core of a European Tax Order: Cross-Border Ability to Pay		264
	[A] Foundation in Member States' Constitutions		264
	[B] The Cross-border Aspect Enhanced by the EC Treaty's		

	Provisions on Free Movement	270
	[1J <i>The Constitutional Quality of the Provisions on Free Movement in an Internal Market</i>	270
	[2] <i>-Personal and Territorial Scope</i>	271
	[3] <i>Principles of Equal Treatment</i>	272
	[a] <i>De Jure and De Facto Discrimination</i>	272
	[b] <i>A Step Too Far: A Second Constitutional Layer of Liberal Freedom Rights</i>	276
	[4] <i>Tax Implications: A Cross-border Concept of Ability to Pay</i>	278
	[5] <i>Complementation by the Basic Provisions on Non-discrimination and Free Movement</i>	280
§9.03	Cross-Border Ability to Pay in Direct Taxation	281
	[A] Non-discrimination of Non-residents	281
	[B] Non-discrimination of Foreign Source Income	285
	[C] Equal Treatment of Different Alternatives to Realize a Freedom?	288
	[D] Abolition of International Double Taxation	289
	[E] Most Favoured Nation Clause?	293
	[F] Possible Justifications for Unequal Taxation	295
	[1] <i>Budgetary Reasons</i>	299
	[2] <i>Reasons of International Equity</i>	299
	[3] <i>Reasons Aiming at Taxation According to Ability to Pay</i>	301
	[a] <i>Prevention of Tax Fraud</i>	301
	[b] <i>Effective Tax Collection</i>	302
	[c] <i>Anti-avoidance Rules</i>	303
	[d] <i>Fiscal Cohesion</i>	305
	[4] <i>Extra-Fiscal Objectives</i>	315
	[a] <i>Economic Control</i>	315
	[b] <i>Social or Ecological Objectives</i>	317
§9.04	Cross-Border Ability to Pay in Indirect Taxation	318
	[A] Non-discrimination of Foreign Competitors in the Domestic Market	320
	[B] Proportional Taxation of Foreign Competitors in the Domestic Market	328
	[C] Non-discrimination of Domestic Competitors in the Foreign Market	332
	[D] Abolition of International Double Taxation	333
	[E] Possible Justifications for Unequal Taxation	335
§9.05	Other Constitutional Principles	338

Table of Contents

ANNEX TO CHAPTER 9		
	Recent Developments in the European Legal Tax Order	341
	<i>Werner C. Haslehner</i>	
I	Introduction	341
II	Developments of European Constitutionalism and the European Legal Tax Order	341
	[A] • Legislative Developments: Enlargement, the failed Constitution and the Lisbon Treaty	341
	[B] Fundamental Rights	343
	[1] <i>EU Charter of Fundamental Rights</i>	343
	[2] <i>Accession to the ECHR</i>	343
	[C] Fundamental Freedoms	344
	[1 j] <i>Relationship and Applicability of multiple freedoms</i>	344
	[2] <i>Fundamental Freedoms and the Abuse of EU Law Doctrine</i>	345
III	Developments in Direct Taxation	346
	[A] Non-discrimination of non-residents	347
	[1] <i>Foreign Loss Recognition of 'Virtual Residents': The Demise of the Principle of Territoriality?</i>	347
	[2] <i>Withholding Taxation of Non-residents: Three Approaches</i>	348
	[B] Non-discrimination of Foreign-Source Income	350
	[1] <i>Foreign Loss Relief: 'Final' Losses</i>	350
	[2] <i>Foreign Capital Income: Credit and Exemption</i>	352
	[C] Neutrality of Legal Form	353
	[D] International Double Taxation	353
	[E] Most-Favoured-Nation Treatment	354
	[F] Justifications for Unequal Taxation	355
	[1] <i>Combating Tax Avoidance</i>	355
	[2] <i>Fiscal Coherence</i>	356
	[3] <i>Balanced Allocation of Taxing Power</i>	356
IV	Developments in Indirect Taxation	357
	[A] VAT Fraud and Legitimate Expectations	357
	[B] The Principle of Equality and VAT	358
CHAPTER 10		
	European Union Tax Law and Internal Tax Systems	359
	<i>Gabriel Casado Ollero & Miguel A. Caamaíño Anido</i>	
§10.01	Introduction	359
§10.02	The EU and the Member States from the legal and Competence perspectives	360
	[A] The Transfer of National Competences to the European Union	360

	[B] The Current Situation of the Distribution of Competences between the EU and the Member States	365
§10.03	The Atypical Sources of EU Tax Law *	368
§10.04	The Crisis of the Principle of Legality	371
§10.05	Non-discrimination and Non-restriction at the Service of Fundamental Freedoms	376
	[A] Introduction	376
	[B] Case-Law Evolution of the Characteristic Features of the Concept of Fiscally Restrictive Measure	379
	[C] The Causes for Justification of Discriminatory and/or Restrictive Measures	382
	[1] <i>Causes of Justification Established in the TFEU</i>	382
	[2] <i>Causes of Justification Adopted or Invoked before the Court of Justice of the European Union</i>	382
	[a] <i>Causes of Justification Generally Inadmissible for the Court of Justice of the European Union</i>	383
	[b] <i>Grounds for Justification Generally Accepted by the Court of Justice of the European Union</i>	84
	[D] Evaluation of EU Case-Law on the Principle of Non-discrimination	385
§10.06	Protection of the Internal Market through the Control of State Aids	387
	[A] Concept of State Aids	387
	[B] Exceptions to the Concept of State Aids	391
§10.07	The Canon of Proportionality in EU Tax Law	393
	[A] The Principle of Proportionality in the Sphere of Harmonized Taxation	394
	[B] The Principle of Proportionality in Direct Taxation.	395
	[1] <i>The Prohibition of 'Wholly Artificial Arrangements'</i>	395
	[2] <i>The Prohibition of General Clauses, Presumptions and Legal Fictions</i>	396
	[3] <i>The Prohibition of Discretionary Interference by the Administration</i>	397
	[4] <i>The Rule of 'Impossibility'</i>	398
	[C] The Presence of the Principle of Proportionality in Penalizing Tax Law	398
§10.08	The Tax Dimension of the Principle of Loyal Cooperation	400
§10.09	The Eu Taxpayer's Statute: Non-contractual Responsibility of the States and Refunding of Unduly Paid Taxes	404
	[A] The General Principle of the Liability of the State	404
	[B] Conditions for Incurring the Liability of the State	405
	[C] The Procedural Means and the Limitations to Exercise the Right to Financial Restitution	407
	[D] On the Impossibility of Conditioning the Reparation of the Existence of Blame	410

Table of Contents

	[E] The Actual Extent of the Reparation	411
	[F] Extent of the Period Covered by Reparation	412
§10.10	Tax Law on Penalties from the Perspective of EU Law	412
	[A] Classification Criteria of the Penalties	412
	[B] The Principle of <i>JVe Bis in idem</i>	413
	[C] Principle of Reasonable Time	413
	[D] Principle of Comparative Equality and Its Effectiveness, Deterrent Effect and Proportionality	414
	[E] The Right to Non-self-incrimination	415
CHAPTER 11		
	Community Acts and the Internal Public Finance System	419
	<i>Andrea Amatucci</i>	
§11.01	Objectives and Instruments Imposed by the Treaty Establishing the European Community	419
§11.02	Single European Act, European Union, Maastricht, Amsterdam and Nice Treaties and the EU Enlargement to New Member States in 2004	422
§11.03	Effects of Self-executing Community Acts on the National Legal System	430
§11.04	Conflict between Internal and International Tax Rules	433