

A Behavioral Approach to Asset Pricing

Second Edition

Hersh Shefrin

Mario L. Belotti Professor of Finance
Leavey School of Business
Santa Clara University



ELSEVIER

AMSTERDAM • BOSTON • HEIDELBERG • LONDON
NEW YORK • OXFORD • PARIS • SAN DIEGO
SAN FRANCISCO • SINGAPORE • SYDNEY • TOKYO



Academic Press is an imprint of Elsevier

Contents

Preface to Second Edition	xix
Preface to First Edition	xxiii
About the Author	xxix
1 Introduction	1
1.1 Why Read This Book?	2
1.1.1 Value to Proponents of Traditional Asset Pricing	2
1.1.2 Value to Proponents of Behavioral Asset Pricing	5
1.2 Organization: How the Ideas in This Book Tie Together	6
1.2.1 Heuristics and Representativeness: Experimental Evidence	7
1.2.2 Heuristics and Representativeness: Investor Expectations	7
1.2.3 Developing Behavioral Asset Pricing Models	7
1.2.4 Heterogeneity in Risk Tolerance and Time Discounting	8
1.2.5 Sentiment and Behavioral SDF	9
1.2.6 Applications of Behavioral SDF	9
1.2.7 Behavioral Preferences	11
1.2.8 Future Directions and Closing Comments	13
1.3 Summary	13

I	Heuristics and Representativeness: Experimental Evidence	15
2	Representativeness and Bayes Rule: Psychological Perspective	17
2.1	Explaining Representativeness	18
2.2	Implications for Bayes Rule	18
2.3	Experiment	18
2.3.1	Three Groups	19
2.3.2	Bayesian Hypothesis	20
2.3.3	Results	20
2.4	Representativeness and Prediction	20
2.4.1	Two Extreme Cases	22
2.4.2	Representativeness and Regression to the Mean	23
2.4.3	Results for the Prediction Study	23
2.4.4	Strength of Relationship Between Signal and Prediction	23
2.4.5	How Regressive?	24
2.5	Summary	25
3	Representativeness and Bayes Rule: Economics Perspective	27
3.1	The Grether Experiment	27
3.1.1	Design	27
3.1.2	Experimental Task: Bayesian Approach	28
3.2	Representativeness	30
3.3	Results	30
3.3.1	Underweighting Base Rate Information	33
3.4	Summary	34
4	A Simple Asset Pricing Model Featuring Representativeness	35
4.1	First Stage, Modified Experimental Structure	36
4.2	Expected Utility Model	36
4.2.1	Bayesian Solution	38
4.3	Equilibrium Prices	39
4.4	Representativeness	40
4.5	Second Stage: Signal-Based Market Structure	42
4.6	Sentiment, State Prices, and the Pricing Kernel	44
4.7	Summary	46
5	Heterogeneous Judgments in Experiments	47
5.1	Grether Experiment	47
5.2	Heterogeneity in Predictions of GPA	48

5.3	The De Bondt Experiment	50
5.3.1	Forecasts of the S&P Index: Original Study	50
5.3.2	Replication of De Bondt Study	56
5.3.3	Overconfidence	58
5.4	Why Some Commit “Hot Hand” Fallacy and Others Commit Gambler’s Fallacy	59
5.5	Summary	61

II Heuristics and Representativeness: Investor Expectations 63

6 Representativeness and Heterogeneous Beliefs Among Individual Investors, Financial Executives, and Academics 65

6.1	Individual Investors	65
6.1.1	Bullish Sentiment and Heterogeneity	66
6.1.2	The UBS/Gallup Survey	67
6.1.3	Heterogeneous Beliefs	67
6.1.4	Hot Hand Fallacy	68
6.1.5	The Impact of Demographic Variables	70
6.1.6	Own Experience: Availability Bias	71
6.1.7	Do Individual Investors Bet on Trends? Perceptions and Reactions to Mispricing	72
6.2	The Expectations of Academic Economists	73
6.2.1	Heterogeneous Beliefs	74
6.2.2	Welch’s 1999 and 2001 Surveys	76
6.3	Financial Executives	77
6.3.1	Volatility and Overconfidence	78
6.4	Summary	78

7 Representativeness and Heterogeneity in the Judgments of Professional Investors 79

7.1	Contrasting Predictions: How Valid?	79
7.2	Update to Livingston Survey	80
7.2.1	Heterogeneity	81
7.3	Individual Forecasting Records	84
7.3.1	Frank Cappiello	86
7.3.2	Ralph Acampora	91
7.4	Gambler’s Fallacy	93
7.4.1	Forecast Accuracy	93
7.4.2	Excessive Pessimism	94
7.4.3	Predictions of Volatility	94

7.5	Why Heterogeneity Is Time Varying	97
7.5.1	Heterogeneity and Newsletter Writers	98
7.6	Summary	99
III Developing Behavioral Asset Pricing Models		101
8	A Simple Asset Pricing Model with Heterogeneous Beliefs	103
8.1	A Simple Model with Two Investors	103
8.1.1	Probabilities	104
8.1.2	Utility Functions	104
8.1.3	State Prices	104
8.1.4	Budget Constraint	105
8.1.5	Expected Utility Maximization	105
8.2	Equilibrium Prices	106
8.2.1	Formal Argument	107
8.2.2	Representative Investor	108
8.3	Fixed Optimism and Pessimism	108
8.3.1	Impact of Heterogeneity	111
8.4	Incorporating Representativeness	111
8.5	Summary	113
9	Heterogeneous Beliefs and Inefficient Markets	115
9.1	Defining Market Efficiency	115
9.1.1	Riskless Arbitrage	117
9.1.2	Risky Arbitrage	117
9.1.3	Fundamental Value	118
9.1.4	When Π Is Nonexistent	118
9.2	Market Efficiency and Logarithmic Utility	119
9.2.1	Example of Market Inefficiency	119
9.2.2	Sentiment and the Log-Pricing Kernel	120
9.3	Equilibrium Prices as Aggregators	122
9.4	Market Efficiency: Necessary and Sufficient Condition	123
9.5	Interpreting the Efficiency Condition	125
9.5.1	When the Market Is Naturally Efficient	125
9.5.2	Knife-Edge Efficiency	126
9.5.3	When the Market Is Naturally Inefficient	128
9.6	Summary	129
10	A Simple Market Model of Prices and Trading Volume	131
10.1	The Model	131
10.1.1	Expected Utility Maximization	131

10.2	Analysis of Returns	134
10.2.1	Market Portfolio	134
10.2.2	Risk-Free Security	135
10.3	Analysis of Trading Volume	136
10.3.1	Theory	137
10.4	Example	139
10.4.1	Stochastic Processes	140
10.4.2	Available Securities	140
10.4.3	Initial Portfolios	141
10.4.4	Equilibrium Portfolio Strategies	142
10.4.5	Markov Structure, Continuation, and Asymmetric Volatility	146
10.5	Arbitrage	147
10.5.1	State Prices	148
10.6	Summary	148
11	Efficiency and Entropy: Long-Run Dynamics	149
11.1	Introductory Example	150
11.1.1	The Market	151
11.1.2	Budget Share Equations	152
11.1.3	Portfolio Relationships	152
11.1.4	Wealth Share Equations	153
11.2	Entropy	155
11.3	Numerical Illustration	156
11.4	Markov Beliefs	157
11.5	Heterogeneous Time Preference, Entropy, and Efficiency	158
11.5.1	Modeling Heterogeneous Rates of Time Preference	159
11.5.2	Market Portfolio	160
11.5.3	Digression: Hyperbolic Discounting	161
11.5.4	Long-Run Dynamics When Time Preference Is Heterogeneous	162
11.6	Entropy and Market Efficiency	163
11.7	Summary	166
IV	Heterogeneity in Risk Tolerance and Time Discounting	167
12	CRRA and CARA Utility Functions	169
12.1	Arrow-Pratt Measure	169
12.2	Proportional Risk	170
12.3	Constant Relative Risk Aversion	170
12.3.1	Graphical Illustration	171
12.3.2	Risk Premia	171

12.4	Logarithmic Utility	172
12.4.1	Risk Premium in a Discrete Gamble	172
12.5	CRRA Demand Function	173
12.6	Representative Investor	174
12.7	Example	175
12.7.1	Aggregation and Exponentiation	177
12.8	CARA Utility	178
12.8.1	CARA Demand Function	180
12.8.2	Aggregate Demand and Equilibrium	180
12.9	Summary	182
13	Heterogeneous Risk Tolerance and Time Preference	183
13.1	Survey Evidence	183
13.1.1	Questions to Elicit Relative Risk Aversion	184
13.1.2	Two Waves	185
13.1.3	Status Quo Bias	186
13.1.4	Risky Choice	187
13.2	Extended Survey	188
13.3	Time Preference	190
13.4	Summary	191
14	Representative Investors in a Heterogeneous CRRA Model	193
14.1	Relationship to Representative Investor Literature	194
14.1.1	Additional Literature	196
14.2	Modeling Preliminaries	197
14.3	Efficient Prices	198
14.4	Representative Investor Characterization Theorem	199
14.4.1	Discussion	203
14.4.2	Nonuniqueness	205
14.5	Comparison Example	205
14.6	Pitfall: The Representative Investor Theorem Is False	208
14.6.1	Argument Claiming That Theorem 14.1 Is False	209
14.6.2	Identifying the Flaw	210
14.7	Summary	210
V	Sentiment and Behavioral SDF	211
15	Sentiment	213
15.1	Intuition: Kahneman's Perspective	213
15.1.1	Relationship to Theorem 14.1	214
15.1.2	Defining Market Efficiency	216

15.2	Sentiment	216
15.2.1	Formal Definition	217
15.3	Example Featuring Heterogeneous Risk Tolerance	217
15.4	Example Featuring Log-Utility	219
15.4.1	Representativeness: Errors in First Moments	219
15.4.2	Overconfidence: Errors in Second Moments	221
15.4.3	Link to Empirical Evidence	225
15.4.4	Evidence of Clustering	226
15.5	Sentiment as a Stochastic Process	228
15.6	Summary	229
16	Behavioral SDF and the Sentiment Premium	231
16.1	The SDF	232
16.2	Sentiment and the SDF	233
16.2.1	Example	234
16.3	Pitfalls	236
16.3.1	Pitfall: The Behavioral Framework Admits a Traditional SDF	237
16.3.2	Pitfall: Heterogeneity Need Not Imply Sentiment .	237
16.3.3	Pitfall: Heterogeneity in Risk Tolerance Is Sufficient to Explain Asset Pricing	238
16.4	Sentiment and Expected Returns	240
16.4.1	Interpretation and Discussion	243
16.4.2	Example Illustrating Theorem 16.2	244
16.5	Entropy and Long-Run Efficiency	244
16.5.1	Formal Argument	245
16.6	Learning: Bayesian and Non-Bayesian	247
16.7	Summary	248
—		
VI	Applications of Behavioral SDF	249
17	Behavioral Betas and Mean-Variance Portfolios	251
17.1	Mean-Variance Efficiency and Market Efficiency	251
17.2	Characterizing Mean-Variance Efficient Portfolios	252
17.3	The Shape of Mean-Variance Returns	254
17.4	The Market Portfolio	257
17.5	Risk Premiums and Coskewness	259
17.6	Behavioral Beta: Decomposition Result	264
17.6.1	Informal Discussion: Intuition	264
17.6.2	Formal Argument	265
17.6.3	Example	267
17.7	Summary	268

18	Cross-Section of Return Expectations	269
18.1	Literature Review	270
18.1.1	Winner-Loser Effect	270
18.1.2	Book-to-Market Equity and the Winner-Loser Effect	271
18.1.3	January and Momentum	272
18.1.4	General Momentum Studies	273
18.1.5	Glamour and Value	274
18.2	Factor Models and Risk	275
18.3	Differentiating Fundamental Risk and Investor Error	276
18.3.1	Psychology of Risk and Return	277
18.3.2	Evidence About Judgments of Risk and Return	278
18.3.3	Psychology Underlying a Negative Relationship Between Risk and Return	279
18.4	Implications for the Broad Debate	281
18.5	Analysts' Return Expectations	284
18.6	How Consciously Aware Are Investors When Forming Judgments?	285
18.7	How Reliable Is the Evidence on Expected Returns?	286
18.8	Alternative Theories	288
18.8.1	The Dynamics of Expectations: Supporting Data	291
18.9	Summary	294
19	Testing for a Sentiment Premium	295
19.1	Diether—Malloy—Scherbina: Returns Are Negatively Related to Dispersion	296
19.2	AGJ: Dispersion Factor	298
19.2.1	Basic Approach	298
19.2.2	Factor Structure	298
19.2.3	General Properties of the Data	299
19.2.4	Expected Returns	300
19.2.5	Findings	300
19.2.6	Volatility	301
19.2.7	Direction of Mispricing	301
19.2.8	Opposite Signs for Short and Long Horizons	302
19.3	Estimating a Structural SDF-Based Model	302
19.3.1	Proxy for $h_{Z,0}$	303
19.3.2	Findings	303
19.4	Summary	304
20	A Behavioral Approach to the Term Structure of Interest Rates	305
20.1	The Term Structure of Interest Rates	305

20.2	Pitfall: The Bond Pricing Equation in Theorem 20.1 Is False	306
20.2.1	Identifying the Flaw in the Analysis	308
20.3	Volatility	308
20.3.1	Heterogeneous Risk Tolerance	311
20.4	Expectations Hypothesis	312
20.4.1	Example	314
20.5	Summary	315
21	Behavioral Black–Scholes	317
21.1	Call and Put Options	317
21.2	Risk-Neutral Densities and Option Pricing	318
21.2.1	Option Pricing Equation 1	318
21.2.2	Option Pricing Equations 2 and 3	320
21.3	Option Pricing Examples	321
21.3.1	Discrete Time Example	321
21.3.2	Continuous Time Example	324
21.4	Smile Patterns	327
21.4.1	Downward-Sloping Smile Patterns in the IVF Function	330
21.5	Heterogeneous Risk Tolerance	332
21.6	Pitfall: Equation (21.12) Is False	333
21.6.1	Locating the Flaw	334
21.7	Pitfall: Beliefs Do Not Matter in Black–Scholes	334
21.7.1	Locating the Flaw	335
21.8	Summary	335
22	Irrational Exuberance and Option Smiles	337
22.1	Irrational Exuberance: Brief History	338
22.1.1	Sentiment	340
22.2	Risk-Neutral Densities and Index Option Prices	344
22.2.1	Butterfly Position Technique	345
22.3	Continuation, Reversal, and Option Prices	347
22.4	Price Pressure: Was Arbitrage Fully Carried Out?	353
22.5	Heterogeneous Beliefs	354
22.6	General Evidence on the Mispricing of Options	354
22.7	Summary	356
23	Empirical Evidence in Support of Behavioral SDF	359
23.1	Bollen–Whaley: Price Pressure Drives Smiles	360
23.1.1	Data	361
23.1.2	Trading Patterns	361
23.1.3	Buying Pressure and Smile Effects	362

27.9	Real-World Portfolios and Securities	455
27.9.1	Empirical Evidence	455
27.9.2	Examples	458
27.10	Summary	459
28	Equilibrium with Behavioral Preferences	461
28.1	The Model	462
28.2	Simple Example	463
28.2.1	Neoclassical Case	463
28.2.2	Prospect Theory Investors	464
28.3	Boundary Value Property	468
28.4	Equilibrium Pricing	469
28.4.1	Additional Insights Regarding Convexity and Existence	471
28.4.2	Weighting and Heterogeneous Beliefs	471
28.5	Portfolio Insurance	472
28.5.1	Testable Prediction	474
28.6	Risk and Return: Portfolio Insurance in a Mean-Variance Example	474
28.7	Heterogeneous Preferences and Heterogeneous Beliefs: Equilibrium with a Mix of SP/A Investors and EU-Investors	478
28.7.1	Behavioral Preferences and the Signature of Sentiment	481
28.7.2	Further Remarks on Skewness and Coskewness	482
28.8	Summary	484
29	The Disposition Effect: Trading Behavior and Pricing	487
29.1	Psychological Basis for the Disposition Effect	487
29.2	Evidence for the Disposition Effect	492
29.3	Investor Beliefs	497
29.3.1	Odean's Findings	497
29.3.2	A Size Effect	498
29.3.3	A Volume Effect	499
29.4	Momentum and the Disposition Effect	500
29.4.1	Theoretical Hypotheses	501
29.4.2	Empirical Evidence	502
29.4.3	Extensions	503
29.5	Summary	504
30	Reflections on the Equity Premium Puzzle	505
30.1	Basis for Puzzles in Traditional Framework	505
30.1.1	Brief Review	506
30.1.2	Attaching Numbers to Equations	507

30.2 Erroneous Beliefs 509
 30.2.1 Livingston Data 509
 30.2.2 The Market and the Economy: Upwardly Biased
 Covariance Estimate 512
 30.3 Alternative Rationality-Based Models 513
 30.3.1 Habit Formation 514
 30.3.2 Habit Formation SDF 514
 30.3.3 Habit Formation SDF Versus the Empirical SDF 515
 30.4 Behavioral Preferences and the Equity Premium 516
 30.4.1 Myopic Loss Aversion 516
 30.4.2 Transaction Utility 518
 30.5 Risks, Small and Large 521
 30.6 Summary 522

VIII Future Directions and Closing Comments 523

31 Continuous Time Behavioral Equilibrium Models 525

31.1 General Structure 526
 31.1.1 Continuous Time Analogue 527
 31.1.2 Linear Risk-Tolerance Utility Function 529
 31.1.3 Dynamics Driven by a Single Brownian Motion 530
 31.2 Analyzing the Impact of a Public Signal 533
 31.2.1 Two-Investor Example When One Investor Holds
 Objectively Correct Beliefs 534
 31.2.2 Signal Structure: General Issues 535
 31.2.3 Continuous Time Signal Structure 535
 31.3 Jump Processes and Stochastic Volatility 542
 31.3.1 Theoretical Framework 544
 31.3.2 Empirical Procedure 545
 31.4 Issues Pertaining to Future Directions 546
 31.5 Summary 550

32 Conclusion 551

32.1 Recapitulating the Main Points 551
 32.2 Current and Future Directions 554
 32.2.1 Issues Involving Investor Benefits 554
 32.2.2 Issues Involving Behavioral Preferences 555
 32.2.3 Issues Involving Behavioral Beliefs and Behavioral
 Preferences 558
 32.3 Final Comments 560

References 563

Index 587