

WOLF THEISS AWARD - BAND 19

# Formulary Apportionment in the EU

by

MMag. Dr. Patrick Weninger, LL.M.

HOCHSCHULE  
LIECHTENSTEIN  
Bibliothek



RECHT

Wien • Graz 2009

# Table of Contents

Preface.....	5
Acknowledgments.....	7
List of Abbreviations.....	19
<b>A Aim and Structure of the Investigation.....</b>	<b>23</b>
I Aim of the Investigation.....	23
II Structure of the Investigation.....	23
<b>B Corporate Tax Harmonization in the EU.....</b>	<b>25</b>
I Overview.....	25
II The Prevailing Approach of Taxing MNEs in the EU.....	25
III Former Attempts to Harmonize Corporate Taxation in the EU.....	26
IV Legal Framework for Harmonizing Corporate Taxes in the EU.....	27
V The Commission Staff Working Paper.....	28
1 Overview.....	28
2 Tax Obstacles in the Internal Market.....	28
3 Targeted Measures.....	29
4 Comprehensive Approaches.....	29
4.1 Common Features of the Four Proposals.....	29
4.2 The Four Proposals in Detail.....	30
a HST.....	30
a.i Characteristics.....	30
a.ii Merits.....	31
a.iii Caveats.....	31
b CCBT.....	33
b.i Characteristics.....	33
b.ii Merits.....	33
b.iii Caveats.....	34
c EUCIT.....	34
c.i Characteristics.....	34
c.ii Merits and Caveats.....	35
d Compulsory Harmonized Tax Base.....	35
d.i Characteristics.....	35
d.ii Merits and Caveats.....	35

VI	Political Tendencies in Designing the Apportionment Formula.....	36
	<	
	1 Uniformity.....	36
	2 Lowering Compliance Costs.....	36
	3 Tax Base Sharing With Respect to Firm-Specific Factors.....	37
	4 Others.....	38
<b>C</b>	<b>The Division of a MNE's Tax Base.....</b>	<b>39</b>
I	Overview.....	39
II	Justification for Taxing MNEs.....	39
	1 Geographical Source.....	39
	2 Entitlement Principle.....	41
	3 Benefit Principle.....	41
	4 Theory of Economic Allegiance.....	42
III	Benefit Taxation.....	43
IV	Nonbenefit Taxation.....	44
	1 Residence Taxation.....	44
	2 Source Taxation.....	44
	2.1 Overview.....	44
	2.2 Supply Approach.....	44
	a Ignoring Structural Interdependencies between Members of the MNE.....	45
	a.i Overview.....	45
	a.ii Transaction Based Methods.....	47
	a.iii Profit based methods.....	49
	a.iv The OECD's position to global FA.....	51
	b Accepting Structural Interdependencies between the Members of the MNE - FA.....	54
	2.3 Supply/Demand Approach - FA.....	58
V	Blurred Delineation between the Single Categories.....	58
	1 Overview.....	58
	2 Continuum of ALP Methods between SA and FA.....	59
	3 The Benefit Principle.....	59
<b>D</b>	<b>Conceptual Issues of FA.....</b>	<b>61</b>
I	Overview.....	61
II	An Attempt to Classify FA Regimes.....	61

1	FA on a Separate Entity Basis.....	61
2	FA on a Combined Group Basis.....	62
3	FA on a Consolidated Group Basis.....	65
4	FA on a Unitary Business Basis.....	67
III	Evaluation of FA.....	68
1	Accepting Structural Interdependencies between the Members of a MNE.....	68
2	Reduction of Profit Shifting.....	72
3	Tax Compliance.....	73
4	Shortcomings.....	75
IV	Lessons for the Development of an EU FA System.....	78
<b>E</b>	<b>Existing Subnational FA Regimes.....</b>	<b>79</b>
I	TheUSSCIT.....	79
1	Conceptual Filing.....	79
2	The SCIT in the system of Corporate Taxation in the US.....	79
3	Constitutional Restraints.....	80
3.1	Overview.....	80
3.2	Due Process Clause.....	80
3.3	Commerce Clause.....	83
a	Interstate Commerce Clause.....	83
b	Foreign (Dormant) Commerce Clause.....	84
4	Restricted Uniformity.....	84
5	State Tax Competition.....	85
6	Apportionable Income.....	90
6.1	Business Income.....	90
6.2	Federal Tax Base as Starting Point.....	91
6.3	Worldwide Unitary Combination versus Water's Edge Limitation.....	92
7	Income to be Allocated.....	93
8	Scope of Enterprises Subject to FA.....	95
9	Conditions for Apportioning Taxable Income to a US State.....	98
9.1	Overview.....	98
9.2	Nexus Requirement.....	98
9.3	Apportionment Formula.....	102
a	Overview.....	102
b	Property.....	103
b.i	UDITPA Definition.....	103
b.ii	Merits and Shortcomings.....	104
c	Payroll.....	105

## Table of Contents

c.i	UDITPA Definition.....	105
c.ii	Merits and Shortcomings.....	106
d	Sales.....	106
d.i	UDITPA Definition.....	106
d.ii	Merits and Shortcomings.....	109
d.iii	Throwback Rule.....	109
d.iv	Throwout Rule.....	111
e	Industry-Specific Formulae.....	111
f	Relief Provision.....	112
10	Intra-State Apportionment.....	112
11	Lessons for the Development of an EU FA System.....	113
11.1	Uniformity.....	113
11.2	Combined Reporting.....	113
11.3	Apportionable Income.....	113
11.4	Relief Provision.....	114
	The CIT of the Canadian Provinces.....	114
1	Conceptual Filing.....	114
2	The Provincial CIT in the system of Corporate Taxation in Canada.....	114
3	Apportionable Income.....	116
4	Scope of Enterprises Subject to FA.-.....	116
5	Conditions for Allocating Income to a Province.....	117
5.1	Overview.....	117
5.2	PE Requirement.....	117
5.3	Allocation Mechanism.....	118
a	Overview.....	118
b	Payroll.....	118
c	Sales.....	118
d	Industry-Specific Formulae.....	119
6	Lessons for the Development of an EU FA System.....	119
6.1	Uniformity.....	119
6.2	Combined Reporting.....	120
	The Swiss Cantonal CIT.....	120
1	Conceptual Filing.....	120
2	The Cantonal CIT in the system of Corporate Taxation in Switzerland.....	120
3	Apportionable Income.....	122
4	Scope of Enterprises Subject to FA.....	122
5	Conditions for Apportioning Income to a Swiss Canton.....	122
5.1	Overview.....	122
5.2-	Nexus.....	122
5.3	Apportionment Mechanism.....	123

6	Lessons for the Development of an EU FA System.....	124
6.1	Uniformity.....	124
6.2	Differentiated Apportionment Scheme.....	124
IV	Germany's Local Business Tax.....	125
1	Conceptual Filing.....	125
2	The Local Business Tax in the system of Corporate Taxation in Germany.....	125
3	Apportionable Income.....	125
4	Scope of Enterprises Subject to FA.....	126
5	Conditions for Apportioning Income to a German Municipality ....	128
5.1	Overview.....	128
5.2	Nexus.....	128
5.3	Apportionment Mechanism.....	128
a	Overview.....	128
b	Multiple PEs in different municipalities / PE moved from one municipality to another.....	128
c	PE connected with more than one municipality.....	129
5.4	Relief Provision.....	130
6	Lessons for the Development of an EU FA System.....	130
6.1	Benefit Principle.....	130
6.2	Relief Provision.....	130
6.3	Differentiated Apportionment Scheme.....	130
V	Other FA Applications.....	131
1	Art 7 Para 4 OECD MC.....	131
2	FA in APAs- Global Trading.....	133
3	Other Formula Approaches in Tax Treaties and under Domestic Law.....	134
VI	Guidance of Existing FA Regimes for Designing an EU FA System.....	134
<b>F</b>	<b>The Economics of FA.....</b>	<b>137</b>
<b>I</b>	<b>Overview.....</b>	<b>137</b>
<b>II</b>	<b>Economic Distortions.....</b>	<b>137</b>
1	Overview.....	137
2	Perspective of Separate Excise Taxes on Apportionment Factors.....	139
3	Empirical Evidence.....	140
<b>III</b>	<b>Profit Shifting.....</b>	<b>141</b>

Table of Contents

IV	Tax Competition.....	143
1	Overview.....	143
2	Determinants of Tax Competition under FA.....	143
2.1	Tax Rate Differentials.....	143
2.2	Tax Base Design.....	144
2.3	Choice of Apportionment Factors.....	145
3	Effect of Tax Competition on Social Welfare under FA.....	145
V	Tax Spillovers.....	146
1	Tax Spillovers under SA.....	146
2	?Tax Spillovers under FA.....	147
VI	Interjurisdictional Risk Sharing.....	149
1	Sharing of Losses.....	149
2	Sharing of Profits.....	150
3	Critics.....	150
VII	Social Welfare.....	151
VIII	Strategic Factor Setting.....	152
1	Small vs Large Jurisdictions.....	152
2	Strategic Factor Setting in Dependence on the Industrial Structure in a Jurisdiction.....	152
IX	Transfer Pricing in Dependence on the Market Structure.....	153
X	Lessons for the Development of an EU FA System.....	153
	<b>G Nexus Requirement.....</b>	<b>155</b>
I	Overview.....	155
II	Current Nexus Concepts.....	155
III	Critics on Current Nexus Concepts.....	156
IV	Recommendations for a Common EU Tax Base Nexus Requirement.....	157
1	Factor Realization Nexus.....	157
2	De Minimis Threshold.....	158

<b>H</b>	<b>Apportionment with Respect to Firm-Specific Factors.....</b>	<b>159</b>
I	Overview and Common Features.....	159
II	Property.....	160
1	Justification.....	160
1.1	Perspective of Return on Capital.....	160
1.2	Benefit Principle.....	162
2	Definition Features.....	162
2.1	Delineation.....	162
2.2	Valuation.....	163
2.3	Intangible Assets.....	164
a <sup>iii</sup>	General Issues.....	164
b	The Location Problem.....	166
c	The Valuation Problem.....	167
d	Possible Considerations of Intangibles in the Property Apportionment Factor.....	167
d.i	No Consideration of Intangibles'for Lack of Localization and Valuation.....	167
d.ii	Valuation at Historical Costs.....	168
d.iii	Application of DCF Tools.....	169
d.iv	Capturing Intangible Assets By Other Apportionment Factors.....	170
e	Intangible Assets as a Profit Shifting Tool in Dependence on the Personal Scope of FA.....	171
3	Conceptual Filing.....	172
4	Economic Consequences.....	173
4.1	Effect on Factor Location Decisions.....	173
4.2	Tax Incidence.....	173
4.3	Effect on Corporate Mergers.....	174
5	Guidance for the Development of an EU FA System.....	174
III	Payroll.....	175
1	Justification.....	175
2	Definition Features.....	176
3	Conceptual Filing.....	176
3.1	Assumption of Equal Productivity.....	176
3.2	Payroll or Lump Sum.....	177
4	Economic Consequences.....	178
4.1	Effect on Corporate Mergers.....	178
4.2	Effect on the Unemployment Level.....	179
5	Guidance for the Development of an EU FA System.....	180
IV	Sales.....	180
1	Justification.....	180



## Table of Contents

2	Definition Features.....	183
2.1	Equal Treatment of Tangible and Intangible Assets.....	183
2.2	Net or Gross Basis.....	183
3	Conceptual Filing.....	183
4	Economic Consequences.....	184
4.1	Impact on Profit Shifting.....	184
4.2	Impact on Tax Competition.....	184
4.3	Tax Incidence.....	185
5	Guidance for the Development of an EU FA System.....	185
V	Industry-Specific Formulae.....	185
1	Reasons for Industry-Specific Formulae.....	185
2	Merits and Shortcomings.....	186
VI	Alternative Apportionment Factors.....	187
VII	Guidance for the Development of an EU FA System.....	187
<b>I</b>	<b>Apportionment with Respect to the Value Added.....</b>	<b>189</b>
I	Overview.....	189
II	Justification.....	189
III	Determination of the Value Added.....	189
1	Calculating the Value Added.....	189
2	Adaption of the VAT Basis.....	190
VI	Conceptual Filing.....	191
1	Characteristics.....	191
2	Weighted Combination of Property and Payroll.....	191
3	Missing Link between Value Added and Taxable Profits.....	192
4	The Need for Arm's Length Pricing.....	192
5	Nexus Problems.....	193
6	No Need for Industry-Specific Formulae.....	194
V	Economic Consequences.....	194
1	Economic Consequences under the Perspective of Property and Payroll Combination.....	194
2	Profit Shifting.....	194
VI	Possible Modifications.....	195

1	Subtraction of Employee Compensation.....	195
2	Value Added at Destination.....	195
VII	Guidance for the Development of an EU FA System.....	196
<b>J</b>	<b>Apportionment With Respect to Non-Firm-Specific Factors.....</b>	<b>197</b>
I	Overview and Scope.....	197
II	Industry-Wide Factors.....	197
III	Macro-Economic Factors.....	198
IV	Merits of Non-Firm-Specific FA.....	198
V	Caveats of Non-Firm-Specific FA.....	199
VI	Conclusion.....	200
<b>K</b>	<b>Allocation to Source of Certain Tax Base Elements.....</b>	<b>201</b>
I	Overview.....	201
II	The Theory of Economic Rents.....	201
III	Compromise Solutions.....	202
IV	Delineating Apportionable Income.....	202
V	Guidance for the Development of a Common EU Tax Base.....	203
	<b>Results.....</b>	<b>205</b>
	Political Framework.....	205
	Dividing a MNE's Tax Base.....	205
	Conceptual Issues of FA.....	206
	Guidance of Existing FA Regimes.....	206
	Economic Considerations.....	207
	Nexus.....	207
	Firm-Specific Factors.....	207
	Value Added.....	208

Table of Contents

Non-Firm-Specific Factors.....:	209
Allocating Certain Tax Base Elements to Source.....	209
<b>Bibliography.....</b>	<b>211</b>
Books, Commentaries, Collected Editions and Dissertations.....	211
Articles in Journals and Collected Editions.....	212
Official Documents.....	222
Miscellaneous.....	223
Index.....	225